

**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
DECEMBER 12, 2011
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
LHD-2011-0023
4105 Avenue D
Hyde Park Local Historic District**

PROPOSAL

Construct a one-story side addition and two-story rear addition to a c. 1922 house.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The existing residence, built c. 1922, is an approximately 1,500 sf, one-story wood frame bungalow with craftsman detailing. The house has a side-gabled roof over the main body of the house and a separate front-gabled roof over the partial width front porch. The eaves have exposed rafter ends cut into a decorative shape and triangular knee braces. The porch roof is supported by squared wood columns that sit upon stucco'd piers that extend to the ground level without bracing at the porch floor.

The house is sided with narrow profile, lap siding. There are two sets of triple windows on the front façade, both with double-hung wood sashes that appear to be original. Other windows on the side elevations are single or multiples of double-hung wood sashes that appear to be original. All windows have wide surrounding trim. The front door, which faces to the side, has craftsman styling with 3 vertically oriented lites set in the top 1/3.

The applicant proposes to demolish the rear of the house, which includes part of the original house as well as a rear addition likely added in the 1960's. The applicant further proposes to add an approximately 220 sf, one-story addition to the south elevation and a two-story addition to the rear.

The side addition, as proposed, will be set back 15' from front façade. The addition will be sided with narrow horizontal lap siding with dimensions and profile similar to the historic house. There will be a front facing set of windows configured similar to that found on the existing front façade. The roof will be side gabled and have exposed rafter ends and triangular knee braces.

The two-story rear addition, which has a foot print of approximately 1,000 sf, includes an attached garage with living space above. The second floor of the addition is set back 60'-0" from the existing front façade. The roof form as proposed is hipped and will have a pitch and eave depth similar to the existing house, but will not have exposed rafter ends and braces. The two-story addition will have the same horizontal, narrow wood siding to match the existing house. Windows will be 2:2 clad windows to differentiate them from the historic house.

The entire house will be roofed with a standing metal seam roof similar to that on the house currently.

A pergola is planned on the north side of the house over the driveway.

The applicant proposes to replace the existing, original double-hung windows with new clad windows. The applicant further proposes to repair and replace historic materials and

features on the façade as needed, and to replace the existing front door with a salvaged or new door of similar design and materials. It appears the existing door may be an interior door due to the thinness of the panel material.

A low (approximately 3'-0") fence is proposed around the front yard that will have an open weave design.

STAFF COMMENTS

The house is listed as a contributing structure in the Hyde Park Local Historic District and Hyde Park National Register Historic District. Projects in the Hyde Park Local Historic District are reviewed according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the Hyde Park Preservation Plan and Design Standards:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards relating to the proposed work state

- A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
- The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
- Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
- Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- Deteriorated historic features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The Hyde Park Preservation Plan and Design Standards are as follows:

A. Design Standards

1. General Standards

1.1: Prevention of Demolition

Demolition of all structures, including non-contributing structures, is strongly discouraged under all circumstances. No person shall demolish a contributing structure or any exterior part of any contributing structure within the local historic district without prior review by the Historic Landmark Commission. A permit for demolition for a contributing structure or an exterior part of a contributing structure shall be granted only in extraordinary

circumstances and only when a plan for the replacement structure, including the dimensions and design of the structure, has been presented by the applicant. These demolition standards apply to all properties within the Hyde Park Local Historic District, with narrow exceptions for multi-family properties, as described in Multi-Family Property Standards.

In no case shall the maximization of energy efficiency be used as a reason to demolish a historic, contributing, or potentially contributing structure, or to change a structure in such a way that its historic features are modified or obliterated. Hyde Park recognizes that the greenest house is one that has not been torn down and taken to the landfill.

1.2: Retention of Historic Style

Respect the historic style of existing structures and retain their historic features, including character-defining elements and building scale. Avoid alterations to the existing fabric of historic buildings.

1.3: Avoidance of False Historicism

Avoid alterations that have no historic basis and that seek to create the appearance of a different architectural period. For example, do not add Victorian trim to a 1920s bungalow or bungalow details to a 1950s ranch-style house or cottage.

1.4: Sequence of Appropriate Treatment Options for Contributing or Potentially Contributing Structures

Repair rather than replace deteriorated historic features and architectural elements. If an existing architectural feature cannot be readily repaired, the replacement shall match the historic feature in size, scale, and materials. When the original materials of a structure are deteriorated beyond the point of preservation, the substitution of compatible recycled historic materials is acceptable. Reconstruct or rebuild missing architectural features with photographic or physical evidence as your guide. Physical evidence can include corresponding appropriate features displayed by other unaltered buildings within the historic district. As a last resort, the use of new materials that duplicate the form of the original materials (based upon photographic or other evidence) is acceptable.

1.5: Energy Efficiency

Recommendation: Construction of any new structures or alterations of existing structures shall be done in such a way as to maximize energy efficiency.

2. Residential Standards: Single Family and Contributing Multifamily - Preservation and Restoration

2.1: Front of Houses

Houses in Hyde Park uniformly face the front street with a generally centered front door, and have windows facing the front yard and street. The front is the front wall of the living space and the porch is at the front of the houses.

Retain the original front facade of a house. Make no changes that would compromise the status of the house as a contributing or potentially contributing resource in the Hyde Park Local Historic District. Repair damaged exterior wall materials to the greatest extent possible.

Doorways on the primary facade are considered an important architectural feature. Do not enlarge, alter, or relocate them. Retain original entry doors. In cases where replacement of an entry door is the only option, choose a door that is close to the original door in design and materials, based on other historic houses of similar age and style in the neighborhood. Retain the glazing (window or glass) in its original configuration on doors that contain windows.

Rainwater collection systems that are visible from the public street must use traditional materials such as metal and wood; use of PVC containers or piping is not permitted within the public view.

2.2: Windows

Original fenestration is character-defining for a building. In Hyde Park, most old windows are old-growth pine or cypress and are 50 to 100 years old. Original steel-casement and other types of windows are also still extant in Hyde Park. With proper restoration, these units will likely outlast many modern products.

Maintain, repair, and restore, if necessary, the original placement, style, design, materials, and glass of windows.

2.3: Porches

Porches are an integral part of the character of homes in Hyde Park. Different porch styles are appropriate to different house styles.

Maintain original front and street-side porches. Do not enclose open front and street-side porches. Other porches, including second floor front porches, may have screening over the original openings.

2.4: Lighting

Exterior lighting has traditionally been located on the ceilings of porches (thus minimizing light pollution and emphasizing the entry) or on the wall adjacent to the entry.

Retain the original location and fixture style of exterior lighting.

2.5: Roofs

The most common roof forms in Hyde Park are hipped roofs, gabled roofs, and combinations of hipped and gabled roofs. Roofs are generally more complex for Queen Anne styles and of a simple form for twentieth century buildings. Roofs often included dormers. There are examples in Hyde Park of flat roofs, but those are not typical of the roofs of the primary structures for contributing residences in the neighborhood. Traditional roof materials were wood shingles for main roofs and corrugated metal for outbuildings. There are also examples in Hyde Park of metal shingles. Occasional Nineteenth Century residences had metals roofs, but during the Twentieth Century, metal roofs were not considered appropriate for residences. Wood shingles were replaced by asphalt shingles in the early- to mid-Twentieth Century. Metal roofs returned in popularity as an energy saving approach in the last 20 years of the Twentieth century.

Retain the original roof pitches of the building. Avoid changes to roofs on the fronts of buildings. Avoid adding to the eave height of original roofs, especially at the front of structures. Retain historic dormers. In replacing roof material, first use either the original

material, second, use a product that resembles the original material, third, use metal. Do not use shaped, scalloped or diamond shingles unless they were original to the building. Preserve original gable/attic vents and roof brackets.

Photovoltaic and solar thermal installations on existing contributing buildings must be designed to be in scale with the existing structure's roofline, and must not damage historical architectural features of materials. These roof systems must be on the same plane as the roof. The colors of the panels must be compatible with surrounding roof materials.

Recommendation: Consider replacing any dormers that can be documented when roof work is done.

2.6: Chimneys

Maintain existing chimneys.

2.7: Garages

Garages have traditionally been located to the rear of the lot and separate structures. They are constructed in a simple but complementary design to the main building. Most garages are front gabled regardless of the style of the house.

Retain original materials and roof pitch. Maintain the historic siding of the garage.

Recommendation: New doors to garages should be of an appropriate style.

3. Residential Standards: Single Family and Contributing Multifamily - New Construction

3.1: Houses

Local Historic District designation does not prevent change, but instead provides parameters for change that works with the special character of the district. Hyde Park recognizes that any new residential structure should reflect its time; consequently, contemporary design for new residential construction is appropriate, as long as it fits the architectural patterns of the neighborhood and its immediately surrounding structures. Items of most concern are finished floor height, floor-to-floor heights, roof heights and pitches, fenestration pattern, porch size and location, setbacks, and an overall scale that reflects neighborhood patterns.

Use massing, scale, and architectural elements typical of the block in new construction. The geometry of new house construction shall be in a scale with contributing buildings on the same block. Present any new building elevations along with adjacent building elevations for review.

Design fenestration to be similar to the character of fenestration in contributing structures. A half-story approach for second story space is more prevalent in Hyde Park than full second stories and maintains a scale in character with existing houses; consider a half story design for second floor space for new houses.

Front porches on new construction must be at least 7 feet deep, and intended to be useable as a social area. Raise porch and first floor levels for new houses to a height comparable to existing houses with pier and beam construction, even if new construction is on a slab.

Recommendation: Minimize light pollution with the location and style of exterior lighting.

For appropriate roof forms, look to the roof forms traditionally used on contributing Hyde Park houses. Use roof forms traditionally used on contributing structures, such as hipped and gabled. Shed roofs are appropriate on attached porches but not main structures.

Locate the entrance of a building in which a principal use is located on the front of a building. If it is necessary to add a doorway on a secondary facade, it shall be of a size and shape that does not detract from the original fenestration pattern of the house.

3.2: Additions

Items of most concern are finished floor height, floor-to-floor heights, roof heights and pitches, fenestration pattern, porch size and location, setbacks, and an overall scale that reflects neighborhood patterns.

An addition shall not require the removal of significant portions of the existing house. The front façade shall remain intact.

Recommendation: Changes should not compromise a house's status as potentially contributing.

Design additions to existing residential buildings to reflect the form and style of the existing house. Design an addition to be subordinate to the original house in terms of size, scale, and massing.

Locate new additions and alterations to the rear or rear side of the building so that they will be less visible from the street. Extend the existing roof line in the rear of the house to accommodate an addition wherever possible. Match the pitch and height of the roof of the addition to that of the existing house. On an addition, make windows visible from the street compatible with the main house in terms of sash configuration, proportion, spacing and placement. Make the exterior siding material and profile of an addition match or be compatible with that of the existing house.

Construct one-story additions to one-story houses when possible. Considerations of impervious cover may provide an exception. Design additions to have the same floor-to-ceiling height as the existing house. Locate second story additions at least 15' setback from the front house wall. Design additions so that they do not overwhelm the original building.

Recommendation: Wherever possible, build additions in existing attic space without raising the roof height. Consider the construction of attic dormers opening to the side or rear of the house to open underused attic space.

Design side wall heights on second floor additions to be in scale and proportion to the original house.

Recommendation: Where attic heights are adequate to support second floor living space, dormers or rear additions that do not exceed the original roof ridge height are preferable, as are side walls that maintain the same proportions.

3.3: Chimneys

Do not locate a new chimney on the front façade. Construct chimneys of brick or stone, or to have the appearance of brick or stone.

3.4: Garages

Design new garages to be detached and located to the rear of the lot and to be of a design that is simple but complementary to the main building. Do not locate garages or carports on the front façade of a building.

3.5: Garage Apartments/Secondary Units

The traditional pattern in Hyde Park for secondary units is that they face the street and they share access to parking with the primary unit except in the case of corner lots, when some secondary units face the side street and access parking from the side street.

As specified in the NCCD, garage apartments and secondary units are allowed only on lots equal to or greater than 7000 square feet in size. Design new secondary units to respect the traditional patterns of Hyde Park.

Locate the front door and windows to face the street. Design secondary units and garage apartments should complement the form and integrity of the existing house. Design secondary units and garage apartments to complement the form, integrity, massing, materials, scale, character elements, and fenestration patterns of the primary unit.

Recommendation: Do not locate windows so as to invade the privacy of neighboring properties.

Historic, contributing, and potentially contributing garages and carriage houses shall retain their historic appearances as garages or carriage houses when apartments are added to them.

3.6: Driveways

A single lane driveway, entered from the front of the lot and located to the side of a house, is character-defining for Hyde Park. They are constructed of gravel or runners. Parking has traditionally been located to the side or rear of the house.

Do not locate a driveway in front of a house. Locate them from the front lot line along the side of the house. The NCCD specifies acceptable materials for driveways. Locate parking as required in the NCCD. No circular driveways.

3.7: Fences

Fences shall adhere to the regulations set forth in the Hyde Park Neighborhood Conservation Combining District (Ordinance No. 020131-20). Design fences to be compatible with the design of the structure.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REVIEW COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

The project was reviewed at a Certificate of Appropriateness Review Committee meeting with the following comments:

1. Demolition. This is acceptable given the plans the applicant has presented.
2. Windows. If the existing tripartite windows are going to be removed on the side elevation, prefer they be reused on the addition. Prefer shortened 1/1 double hung sash on north elevation to match the height of the existing windows and trim to match the existing trim.
3. Siding. Any style of dropped or lapped siding would be ok.
4. Carport. Don't have a problem with this. The applicant should look at the one on the 43rd Street side of the house at the northwest corner of Avenue G and 43rd.
5. Roof Massing. Prefer the gabled roof design presented but would also consider a pyramidal or hipped roof as a possibility.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends releasing the building permit based upon the proposed design as submitted with the following revisions:

1. The design of the horizontally oriented window on the north elevation closest to the front façade to be revised to a vertically oriented wood-framed, double-hung window of similar proportions to the existing 1:1 window. The bottom of the window can be higher than the existing double-hung window to accommodate the configuration of interior bathroom layout. Frosted glazing is acceptable.
2. The exposed rafter ends on the south side addition to be squared (e.g. no decorative shaping) to differentiate the addition from the historic house.
3. Historic windows that will not be eliminated as part of the demolition plans (e.g. the front façade windows) to be repaired rather than replaced.
4. The final selection of a replacement door to be reviewed administratively by Staff.
5. If minor changes to the design are needed, allow Staff to review on an administrative basis.

PHOTOS





From: David Conner
Sent: Thursday, October 20, 2011 1:28 PM
To: Sadowsky Steve
Cc:
Subject: Liz Williams Renovation - 4105 Ave. D

Hello Steve,

The HPNA Development Review Committee met with Edward on Monday and he showed us the renovation plans for 4105 Ave D. The DRC members presented were Wanda Penn, Paula Rhodes, Michelle Rossamondo, and me.

We had a few questions related to the roof design and parking and Edward explained to us the reasons for the roof design. Additional NCCD zoning questions related to onsite parking may need to be addressed.

He plans to meet with Paula Rhodes, a DRC member and the neighbor to the north which can address these if necessary.

At this point, we do not oppose the design as presented and Edward will follow up with the DRC if there are any major design changes. Please let me know if you have any questions.

See you Monday night at HLC meeting and thanks !

David Conner