HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION

OCTOBER 22, 2012
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
C14H-2009-0015
Gardner House
2418 Jarratt Avenue

PROPOSAL

Construct a one-and-a-half-story side addition; construct a second-story addition to the existing detached garage.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The applicant proposes to construct a one-and-a-half story addition to the left side of the house. The proposed addition will have similar Tudor Revival styling to the historic house, and will be connected to the main house with a stucco-clad one-story connection. The proposed addition will have stucco walls with a 41-inch-high stone wainscoting, with stone matching stone accents on the house. Windows will have screens matching the diamond-paned screens on the main house, and the addition will have a composition shingle roof matching that on the main house.

The applicant has also submitted plans for all stucco walls for the addition in accordance with the recommendations of the Certificate of Appropriateness Review Committee, but prefers the design with the stone wainscot over the all-stucco design.

The applicant further proposes to construct a second-story addition to the existing detached stucco garage. The proposed addition will have stucco walls and fenestration details to match those on the house. An existing door and window in the garage will be removed and a new door and window installed on the second story of the proposed garage addition. The non-historic metal garage door will be replaced with a wooden garage door.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The Commission's Standards for Review of applications for Certificates of Appropriateness include:

- Do not destroy the distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environment. Avoid the removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features.
- Recognize all buildings, structures, and sites as products of their own time. Do not
 construct alterations which have no historical basis and which seek to create an
 earlier appearance.
- Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties are appropriate when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historic, architectural, or cultural material and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.
- Construct new additions or alterations to structures in such a manner that if such addition or alteration were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure will be unimpaired.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee recommended that the applicant use all stucco on the proposed house addition to simplify the design and differentiate it from the main house.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve the application as proposed with the stone accents to the addition. The stucco connector proposed between the historic house and the proposed addition will adequately differentiate the historic house and the addition, and that the proposed stone wainscoting picks up on stone accents, including the chimney, of the historic house.