



MEMORANDUM

TO: Audit and Finance Committee Members

FROM: Joya Hayes, Interim Director, Human Resources and Municipal Civil Service *JH*

DATE: February 23, 2016

SUBJECT: Updated Information on Compensation for the Municipal Civil Service Commissioners

The purpose of this memorandum is to provide updated information regarding compensation for the Municipal Civil Service (MCS) Commissioners. The Audit and Finance Committee discussed this at their September 23, 2015 meeting and this item is scheduled for discussion by Council on February 25, 2016.

Staff previously provided a memo to the Audit and Finance Committee in November 2015 which included benchmarking data based on research of other Texas cities with similar labor commissions. When looking at other cities, there are a variety of compensation structures for consideration. Not all cities provide compensation to commissioners; for those that do, compensation ranges from \$5.00 to \$20.00 a hearing, with an average of \$12.50 per hearing.

Some cities also use a hearing officer or grievance examiner in tandem with a Board or Commission. These positions supplement the process and often work with the board or commission to review appeals or grievances and in some cases, provide a recommendation or make a decision. These positions have a compensation range from \$135.00 to \$400.00, with an average of approximately \$295.00. Prior to MCS the City of Austin also utilized a Hearing Office system, and the City Hearing Officers were paid \$1600 a day to hear appeals and provide a report a to the City Manager for consideration.

Below is a table that provides this information and differentiates between compensation for Boards and Commissions and officers or examiners:

City	Number of Commissioners	Commission Compensation	Officer/Examiner Compensation	Structure
Austin	5- member Commission	None	N/A	Commission hears appeals and makes decisions.
Corpus Christi	3-member Board	\$5 per commissioner per meeting; not to exceed \$100/FY.	N/A	Commission hears appeals and makes decisions.
Dallas	3-member Trial Board or Administrative Law Judge	None	Administrative Law Judge—\$400 - \$200 paid by City - \$200 paid by employee.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Both hear appeals and make decisions.Employee chooses who hears the appeal.

El Paso	9-member Commission assigns appeals to Hearing Officers.	None	Hearing Officers paid \$135/hour	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Hearing Officer hears appeals, reviews evidence and prepares a recommendation for the Commission; Commission reviews Hearing Officer recommendation and makes a decision.
Houston	3-member Commission, Grievance Committee, and Grievance Examiner	None	Grievance Examiner paid \$350/case.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <u>Grievance Committee</u> - Hears lower level grievances; Committee's decision is NOT appealable to the MCS Commission <u>Hearing Examiner</u>: \$350/case, if employee unsatisfied may be appealed to the MCS Commission <u>MCS Commission</u>: 3 members, not compensated <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Hears cases where the Hearing Examiner's decision is being appealed Hears appeals on more severe disciplinary actions like discharges, involuntary demotions, and reductions-in-force.
San Antonio	3-member Board 3-alternate members	\$20 per commissioner per hearing	N/A	Commission hears appeals and makes decisions.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

cc: Marc A. Ott, City Manager
Assistant City Managers
Chief of Staff
Rebecca Kennedy, Chief Administrative Officer, Human Resources Department
Sylba Everett, Municipal Civil Service Administrator