Item C-05 1 of 6

Dear Planning Commission Member

RE: AGENDA ITEM at April 12 Meeting C14H02016-0005

Please accept this as objection to to the recommended rezoning of 1502 Hardouin

I strongly urge you to do a fact check of the representations made by the Historic Landmark Commission Staff in its recommendation for rezoning of this property at 1502 Hardouin.

The information included in the staff review is imaginative, misleading and/or false. Please see the attached comments.

The staff wants to attribute historic significance to a man who did nothing whatsoever significant in his lifetime.

Please find attached a portion of the zoning review page prepared by the staff of the Historic Landmark Commission (and annotated in blue by me).

This case is a travesty. It clearly demonstrates how the staff plays fast an loose with the truth and that the Historic Commission itself did not question what he represented as fact.

Item C-05 2 of 6

This property is neither architecturally significant nor connected to a significant figure in Austin's history.

<u>Historic Landmark Staff</u> staff report is unbelievable Literally. It is full of untrue and un provable allegations. (I filed PIA request & have fact checked)

.

The guy who built this house in 1930 is being called significant simply because he worked for a company his uncles started 45 years earlier.

Not one credible significant action or achievement on **his** part is cited in staff recommendation. At best he's credited with reconstructing the facility after a fire in 1951. This would not pass any "so what" test.

The house was built following plans published for contractors and lumber yards. Any number of other houses

<u>built contemporaneously in Pemberton Heights would have similar architectural features.</u>

Current owners bought in April 2015 for \$1,399,000.

If it is rezoned the owners will see property tax cut by at least \$8500.

\$2500 City of Austin

Item C-05 3 of 6

\$2500 Travis County

\$3500 AISD

AISD will lose revenue so the the owners of this house get a tax reduction.

How does that make sense?

Please demand that the staff provide credible support for the claims it has makes.

Respectfully submitted

Jane Hayman

1410 Wooldridge

(415) 516 1296

Item C-05 4 of 6

A.2 - 1

ZONING CHANGE REVIEW SHEET

<u>CASE NUMBER</u>: C14H-2016-0005 <u>HLC DATE</u>: February 22, 2016

PC DATE:

APPLICANTS: Richard G. and Laura Key, owners

HISTORIC NAME: William F. and Eleanor-Warren House

WATERSHED: Shoal Creek

ADDRESS OF PROPOSED ZONING CHANGE: 1502 Hardouin Avenue

ZONING FROM: SF-3-NP to SF-3-H-NP

SUMMARY STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends the proposed zoning change from single family residence, neighborhood plan (SF-3-NP) combining district to single family residence – Historic Landmark – neighborhood plan (SF-3-H-NP) combining district zoning.

QUALIFICATIONS FOR LANDMARK DESIGNATION:

Architecture and historical associations

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION ACTION:

PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION:

<u>DEPARTMENT COMMENTS</u>: The house is beyond the bounds of the Comprehensive Cultural Resources Survey (1984).

CITY COUNCIL DATE: ACTION:

ORDINANCE READINGS: 1ST 2ND 3RD ORDINANCE NUMBER:

CASE MANAGER: Steve Sadowsky PHONE: 974-6454

NEIGHBORHOOD ORGANIZATION:

Pemberton Heights Neighborhood Association

BASIS FOR RECOMMENDATION:

Architecture:

One-and-a-half story, rectangular-plan, Colonial Revival styled, side-gabled, brick-veneered house with a projecting front gable containing the principal entry framed with a wood surround; single Colonial Revival-styled 6:6 windows with single-leaf casement windows in the tympanum of the front gable; gabled dormer over the secondary window on the front façade. NOT one of these features is UNIQUE or significant architecturally. STAFF MERELY PROVIDES A DESCRIPTION OF THE HOUSE. FAILS TO IDENTIFY A

Item C-05 5 of 6

SINGLE <u>SIGNIFICANT</u> ARCHITECTURAL CHARACTERISTIC. ALL OF THESE FEATURES ARE PRESENT ELSEWHERE IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD. Therefore, fails to meet the requirements of the city; code. According to the application for rezoning, this house was BUILT FROM PLANS WIDELY PUBLISHED FOR USE OF CONTRACTORS. It was one of several houses constructed at the time in Pemberon Heights. Was the 10th house built in Pemberton Heights.

Historical Associations:

The house was built in 1930 by William F. and Eleanor Warren, who lived here until their deaths in the mid-1980s. William F. Warren was the son of Margaret Brydson Warren, the sister of John J. and Robert W. Brydson, who began a house-building business in 1888, and which later grew to be the Brydson Lumber Company, with William F. Warren as the long-time president. HE HAPPENED TO BE BORN INTO BRYDSON FAMILY. This accident of fate did does not confer historical significance.. HIS MOTHER MADE HER BROTHERS GIVE HIM A JOB .HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT? NO.

.

Brydson Lumber and Construction Company was one of Austin's largest lumber suppliers, **NOT TRUE.**but also, on the same model as Calcasieu Lumber Company and East End Lumber Company, Brydson designed, built, and financed houses for their customers.

Not true DURING the period William F. Warren was president of the company.

The Brydson family came to Austin around 1888, and John J. and Robert W. Brydson began working as house builders. They brought in another brother, Burt Brydson, and their company was known as Brydson Brothers. William F. Warren began at Brydson Brothers in 1911, when he worked as an apprentice in the planing mill. After working in every aspect of the industry, Warren became a partner in the business in 1920, and president of the company in 1933. During Warren's tenure, Brydson continued to be a strong presence in Austin's growth and development, providing lumber and building supplies to various contractors, as well as furnishing designs and contractor services. NOT TRUE Brydson also carried a full line of paints and varnishes, built cabinets, and milled their own lumber. Brydson grew to be one of the two major lumber companies in Austin NOT TRUE and was responsible for many houses in north-central Austin, NOT TRUE including the Brydson Addition near the University of Texas campus. NOT TRUE.

COMMISSION SHOULD ASK WHERE IS THE BRYDSON ADDITION? THE STADIUM WAS OPENED IN 1924. THERE IS NO EVIDENCE THAT A BRDYSON ADDITION EVER EXISTED BEYOND PLANS. William Warren served as the head of the company until his retirement in 1966, and rebuilt the company after a disastrous fire in 1952 wiped out the company's mill and facilities. SO WHAT?

WILLIAM F WARREN DROVE THE COMPANY HE HEADED INTO THE GROUND. IT DID NOT EXIST AFTER 1966, THE YEAR OF HIS RETIREMENT.

A SUCCESSFUL ENTERPRISE BUILDS UP ASSETS, BOTH INTANGIBLE AND TANGIBLE WHICH CAN BE EVALUATED AND SOLD. BRYDSON LUMBER SIMPLY DISAPPEARED IN 1966-67. WILLIAM F WARREN HAD NOTHING TO SHOW FOR THE YEARS HE WAS PRESIDENT.

PARCEL NO.: 01150103070000

Item C-05 6 of 6

LEGAL DESCRIPTION: Lot 6, and the West 10 feet of Lot 7, Block 4, Pemberton Heights, Section 1.

ESTIMATED ANNUAL TAX ABATEMENT: \$8,500 (owner-occupied); city portion: \$2,500 (capped). AISD Portion \$3500, Travis County Portion \$2500

APPRAISED VALUE: \$1,399,201 purchased by current owners in April 2015

PRESENT USE: Single-family residence

CONDITION: Excellent

PRESENT OWNERS:

Richard and Laura Key 1502 Hardouin Avenue Austin, Texas 78703

DATE BUILT: ca. 1930

ALTERATIONS/ADDITIONS: Remodeled by original owners in 1940; rear additions in 1988, and 1992, adding a two-story rear addition; addition to the detached garage in 2001.