

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
FEBRUARY 25, 2019
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
C14H-1974-0030
Catherine Robinson House
705 San Antonio Street

PROPOSAL

Replace the existing diamond-shingled asphalt roof with a standing seam metal roof.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The applicant proposes to replace the existing diamond-shaped shingled roof with a standing seam metal roof.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The Commission's Standards for Review of applications for Certificates of Appropriateness include:

- Do not destroy the distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environment. Avoid the removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features.
- Recognize all buildings, structures, and sites as products of their own time. Do not construct alterations which have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance.
- Repair, rather than replace deteriorated architectural features wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Base the repair or replacement of missing architectural features on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.
- Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties are appropriate when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historic, architectural, or cultural material and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee recommended against the use of standing seam metal as an appropriate roofing material.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recognizes that other historic landmark houses in the immediate vicinity have metal roofs, but concurs with the Certificate of Appropriateness Review Committee's recommendation against standing seam as an appropriate roofing material. The roof of this house is readily visible so the material chosen should accurately depict a historical condition, and houses of this caliber never had a metal roof in the historic period. Staff therefore recommends that the applicant consider the use of an alternative material, such as metal shingles, that more accurately convey the historic appearance of this house.



View of the house for the north showing the exposure of the roof material. This house is on a one-way street going south, so this is the primary view of the house coming off of 8th Street.



What appears to be a metal shingle that more approximates the current roof of the house – this would be a more appropriate material than a standing seam metal roof.