

**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION**  
**APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**OCTOBER 26, 2020**  
**HR 2020-135226**  
**611 OAKLAND AVENUE**

---

**PROPOSAL**

Repair or replace siding, replace windows, and partially demolish and construct an addition to a contributing house.

---

**PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS**

1. Repair or replace existing wood siding in-kind.
2. Demolish rear porch and replace with addition. The proposed addition is clad in corrugated weathering steel. It features an offset gable roof, vertically oriented fixed and casement aluminum windows, and a perforated corrugated weathering steel screen at the northwest and northeast elevations.
3. Replace wood windows on existing house with matching aluminum windows.
4. Remove and replace window on secondary elevation.
5. Remove and replace existing front door with new wood door and frame.

---

**STANDARDS FOR REVIEW**

The Smoot-Terrace Park Design Standards are used to evaluate projects on contributing buildings within the historic district. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

***Front Exterior Walls***

***Requirements***

1. Retain and repair the historic exterior materials on front walls, side walls within 15 feet of the front, unless HPO staff and/or the HLC agree that repair is not possible due to deterioration beyond repair.

The proposed project includes siding repair where feasible.

2. If replacement of the historic exterior wall materials is necessary, choose a material similar in dimensions, profile, reveal, and texture to the historic material, and install the new materials so that they do not damage adjacent historic fabric and so that they maintain the planar relationships and joint patterns that existed historically relative to window frames, door frames, and other exterior features.

The proposed project replaces deteriorated siding in-kind where required.

***Doors and Door Openings***

***Requirements***

1. Avoid alterations that enlarge doorways, relocate doorways, or add new door openings on front walls and side walls within 15 feet of the front.

The proposed project does not relocate, add, or enlarge door openings.

2. Retain and repair historic doors and door frames unless HPO staff and/or the HLC agree that deterioration is beyond repair.

The proposed project includes replacement of the front door and frame.

3. Retain and repair door glazing (window or glass) in its historic configuration unless deteriorated beyond repair.

The proposed project maintains the existing transom and door configuration.

4. In cases where a historic entry door is missing or deteriorated beyond repair, choose a replacement door that is similar in terms of design and appearance with the historic character of the house.

The proposed door is compatible with the house's historic character.

5. If a new door or door frame is required because the original is deteriorated beyond repair, install the new components so that they maintain the same planar relationships and joint patterns that existed historically relative to door frames, exterior wall planes, and other exterior features.

The proposed door replacement does not alter existing planar relationships or joint patterns.

### ***Windows and Window Openings***

#### ***Requirements***

1. Avoid alterations that enlarge or relocate window openings, or add new window or skylight openings, on front walls, side walls within 15 feet of the front, or roofs within 15 feet of the front.

The proposed new window opening is over 15' from the front wall of the house.

2. Retain and repair all components of existing historic windows unless HPO staff and/or the HLC agree that the individual component is deteriorated beyond repair.

The proposed project replaces all existing windows.

3. If replacement of historic windows is necessary, use windows that are the same size and match the dimensions, profile, and configuration of historic windows.

The proposed replacement windows match the existing windows.

4. Substitute materials are appropriate if they maintain the profile and finish appearance of the historic window. Extruded aluminum and aluminum-clad wood are acceptable substitutes for wood; vinyl is not an acceptable substitute material.

The proposed windows are aluminum.

5. If replacement windows are required, install the new windows so that they maintain the same planar relationships and joint patterns as existed historically relative to window frames, exterior wall planes, and other exterior features.

All but one of the proposed replacement windows will be installed in their original locations.

### ***Roofs and Roof Features***

#### ***Requirements***

1. Retain and repair the original roof shape, including pitches, profiles, and eave heights and depths within 15 feet of the front.

The proposed project does not alter the roof shape within 15' of the front of the house.

2. Retain and repair historic dormers, historic gable/attic vents, historic roof brackets, and historic chimneys unless they are deteriorated beyond repair.

The proposed project does not alter historic dormers, vents, brackets, or chimneys.

### ***Additions to Contributing Buildings***

#### ***Requirements***

1. New additions should be compatible with the historic building by reflecting the scale, massing, and/or materials of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that they are not confused as historic or original to the building.
2. If designing an addition in a contemporary style, reflect the scale, massing, and/or materials of the historic building; if designing an addition in a style that reflects the style of the historic building, differentiate the scale, massing, and/or materials, at least slightly.

The proposed addition is differentiated from the historic portion of the building by its contemporary style. While its massing and materials are not strictly compatible with the historic character of the building, it is minimally visible from the street.

3. Design new additions that are subordinate to and do not overpower the historic building.

The proposed addition is subordinate to the historic building, as its position to the rear of the sloped site mitigates the impact of its bold design.

4. Construct additions that avoid the removal or obstruction of any historic exterior features on the front of the building or the sides within 15 feet of the front.
5. Set back a new ground-level addition a minimum of 15 feet measured from the front wall of the house (excluding the porch).

The proposed addition does not affect historic features within 15' of the front of the house.

6. A new basement addition may extend to the front of the house.
7. Design basement additions so that they do not raise the floor level of the house, or so that the new floor level of the house is not higher than either the average of the contributing houses on the same block face, or the average of the adjacent houses if contributing.

The proposed project does not include basement-level alterations.

8. Modern materials such as fiber-cement siding are appropriate for additions, provided that the overall design is compatible with the historic building.

While the overall design is not strictly compatible with the historic building, its minimal visibility from the street greatly reduces its visual impact.

The project meets most applicable standards. The applicant has amended plans to conform to Committee recommendations.

#### **COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS**

---

Replace window on original house with salvaged window from demolition area. Adjust the placement of the addition's windows to match the height of existing windows and/or align with dormers to create rhythmic pattern.

#### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

---

Concur with Committee recommendations, and recommend that the applicant restore, rather than replace, historic wood windows on the original house where advanced deterioration does not inhibit repair; then approve the application.