

Audit and Finance Committee Meeting Transcript – 03/31/2021

Title: City of Austin

Channel: 6 - COAUS

Recorded On: 3/31/2021 6:00:00 AM

Original Air Date: 3/31/2021

Transcript Generated by SnapStream

=====

Please note that the following transcript is for reference purposes and does not constitute the official record of actions taken during the meeting. For the official record of actions of the meeting, please refer to the Approved Minutes.

[9:32:41 AM]

>> Alter: We'll start with the first speaker. >> And the first speaker is Mary Ingle. >> Can you hear me?
>> We can hear you, Mary, good morning. >> Good morning. I'm Mary Ingle and I'm a neighborhood activist from the north university neighborhood. I'm here to talk about waiving fees at the board of adjustments. I've been here about four years ago and we talked about this topic. It's about waiving fees for interpretations. The fees now are thousands of dollars, and regular citizens cannot really afford that. And sometimes interpretation is the only way to solve an ambiguity that's in the code and we all know that everything is subject to ambiguities and we need to have sound arguments to you

[9:33:44 AM]

rationality decide these things. So I just want to encourage you and I know you've got a resolution and I want you to take this up very soon because really it's an issue of fairness and equity across the city for citizens to have the opportunity to have an interpretation at the board of adjustments. It's not a common thing because it's very laborious. The paperwork is horrendous and the staff has to approve it. But it's something that needs to be there and I think there have been something like four or five in the past 10 years [inaudible] >> Alter: We lost you, Mary, were you finished?

[9:34:51 AM]

Clerk's office was she finished or should we move to the next person? >> It looks like we might have a connection issue with this speaker. Give us just a second. >> Mayor Adler: Chair, I was just in another link and there were six or eight people waiting for this meeting in that other link. So we have two channels I think now. You may already be aware of that. >> Pool: The only other link we got was executive session. >> I think some of the people in the waiting room are actually from my staff waiting for the follow-up items. >> Mayor Adler: Councilmember harper-madison is in that other one. Farah is in that other one. >> Alter: And I tnk councilmember Fuentes was coming. >> Pool: So this is the link. Ask them to use the one that does not say executive on

[9:35:51 AM]

it. >> Mayor Adler: No, it didn't say executive. >> Kelly: I think it's the waiting room for this meeting so you get kind of stuck there until we officially move you over to this one. I was stuck there for awhile as well. So I think Vanessa Fuentes is also listed in that one listed as an attendee rather than a participant so maybe we can move any councilmembers that we need to at this point. I see councilmember Fuentes is on here. If councilmember harper-madison is also on there if we can move her over. So it looks like we have all the councilmembers that we were waiting on and the other folks are staff waiting to come in at the appropriate time. Is that correct? >> That's correct. Approximate. >> Alter: Okay. Great. So did Ms. Ingle want to continue? Were you able to fix that? >> It looks like Ms. Ingle

[9:36:53 AM]

decided to drop off. I'm not sure what happened with that, but it did sound like she was cut off mid sentence. So I'll keep an eye on her and see if she comes back here in the attendee list. But I guess until then we will just have to continue. >> Alter: Great. Thank you. Do you want to take up the next speaker. >> Next up is Paul Robbins. >> Can you hear me? >> Alter: We can hear you, good morning, Paul. >> I don't want to speak for Mary, but I'm sure that she would like to finish her speech. Let me start. Council, I'm asking for an audit of the customer assistance program by Austin energy while this is meant to help low income people to their utility bills it is giving millions of dollars of ratepayer money to the wrong people for the wrong purpose. There has not been an audit of the customer assistance

[9:37:54 AM]

program since 2012. This is your program now and you should take an active role in repairing problems that continue after having long been exposed. The staff that run this program are with exceptions complacent. After six and a half years of my own efforts trying to get them to correct major problems, I've come to the realization that Austin energy will not get its own house in order so I'm imploring council to get the audit department to do it for them. People living in 5,000 square foot homes with

swimming pools and tennis money meant for poor people. Even people who live in more modest homes could have assets that should disqualify them from participation such as high salaries, late model cars and expensive jewelry. Yet five out of six Austin participants are not income

[9:38:54 AM]

qualified. There could be thousands of unjustified enrollees. We just don't know. Income qualification is the standard in the Sacramento municipal utility district, a larger municipal utility than Austin. And that utility's percentage of participation is over twice that of Austin. So do not be misled by the excuse that income qualification will reduce participation. Another problem is we were rewarding people who waste energy with 15% across the board discounts. If we eliminated the 15% discount for the top two tiers of electric use, we could more fairly distribute an extra \$60 a year energy discounts to all participants. And Austin energy is blatantly and subtly hiding

[9:39:57 AM]

information that can assist low income ratepayers and clarify problems with this program. It is sad and bewildering when the most dedicated person scrutinizing a 30-million-dollar a year program is a volunteer activist. You need to get your professional team involved that can review the information that has been hidden or that has been ignored. [Buzzer]. And scrutinize this -- scrutinize these miss allocated funds in-depth. Thank you. >> Thank you, Mr. Robin. Next speaker. >> Next up is Olivia Overturf. >> Good morning. Can you hear me? >> Alter: Yes, we can, good morning. >> Okay, good morning. My name is Olivia Overturf, I live in district 2. I'm here to speak about agenda item number four.

[9:40:57 AM]

I ask that the audit for the city's disaster to response for specific awarding that evaluates the use of any org, non-profit group, fund, coalition on or trust by any councilmember or any other city staff member during winter storm uri. During the storm there were several new pop-ups that didn't have any license, certifications or bond, any irs status or any proof why they were allowed to utilize the city resources, primarily in districts 1 and 2, which included the millennium distribution hub, access to water distribution sites and more. Some of the organizations like community resilience trust were stationed at the millennium, yet managed to completely ignore the surrounding housing communities directly near the millennium, including the mount Carmel apartments currently on day number 40 of not having gas. During the storm several of us saw food waste, ppe hoarding and water being

[9:41:58 AM]

taken to areas that did not have an ordinance. I saw some take close to 50 bags of produce and dump it. In another instance there is an allegation that a person wrecked a van during a transportation of homeless persons during the haphazard storm rescues. Residents and others who donated to these organizations are finding out that their donations are not tax deductible. I'm asking that the city include organizations in this specific audit by also have councilmembers provide a list of orgs, non-profits or any groups they included on their social media pages on orgs that were allowed to help council and their staff and current orgs and groups being used today as acting as liaisons for this ongoing crisis. And for the record this happens with every disaster crisis in this city, therefore it's crucial to include this in the audit.

[9:42:58 AM]

And this is citizens communication, I can answer questions, but not allowed to respond to answers -- to comments made by the council or the committee. >> Alter: Thank you. Is there anyone else on the line? >> Yes, we have one more speaker. And it's Tiffany Washington. >> Hello, good morning. I was actually calling to speak on a specific agenda but I'm not sure if I can speak on that now during citizens communication. >> Alter: Please speak about it now. With the virtual setting we're doing all of our speakers first. Thank you. >> Okay, thank you. I'm actually calling to speak about agenda item number 5, the audit update for the millennium youth entertainment complex. The audit has already happened so we're currently receiving an update. And as a citizen, it was very confusing and very painful for me to actually

[9:44:01 AM]

read the full audit from August 2020. I had -- I was very confused by the way in which the millennium is structured and why it would be the only cultural center or community center for African-American people to be structured in the manner that it's structured. So I'm not sure if it's structured as a park or if it's structured as a recreational center because park is involved. And I'm not sure why park is involved with facility management if the millennium has a facility manager. I'm also very confused about the relationship between the arc dc and the city of Austin. I guess the city of Austin in that agreement is seen as park, so it's very confusing how the relationships go back and forth and why there

[9:45:02 AM]

are so many different parties involved. That also gives me huge pause when it comes to how the millennium has been funded. I'm sorry, my name is Tiffany Washington. I'm an Austin resident. And I'm

also the granddaughter of Dorothy turner so when it comes to the millennium it's very near and dear to me. And going up there is nostalgic. You will never be able to replicate that unless that center is properly funded and fully funded the way it's supposed to be funded within the agreements that are set forth especially between the city and the arcdc because the management can only set their budget for the fiscal year. And then it's on the arcdc to request the funds and let the city know exactly what's needed. And I feel like that extra step with pard, pard is just

[9:46:03 AM]

kind of like why are you here? Are you doing these things that you're supposed to be doing? What are your administrative service duties to the arcc? Is pard taking full budget that the arcdc is getting from the management company to the city of Austin? Are they completely funding it? Because to me it looks like the millennium is only partially ever funded and then they're supposed to make up the rest of the funds from the revenue. I'm saying all this to say -- [buzzer] -- There is no equitable funding for millennium. There is a very unequitable system. So I don't see this happening at any other place, including the mac, the Dougherty center. None of these places are funded like this. So I would ask that the city take a very, very serious look at the relationship it has with the millennium and

[9:47:04 AM]

the relationship that the millennium has with its citizens. And they do the right thing and they fully fund it, especially during covid. Like we know for a fact that that facility is not being operated daily because -- or to its current schedule because of covid-19 and we know they're losing money, we know they need the support. So having an audit come out in August during covid it was so painful to read. I think you guys should really listen to their recommendations, their response to the audit and take the time to allow them with the new board they have to do the changes and do the things they need to do so that the people can go back to the millennium. Thank you. >> Alter: Again Ms. Washington, if you would stay on for one second, the auditor's office has indicated that they would be happy to walk you through the audit and try to provide further explanation if you

[9:48:06 AM]

can get in touch with the auditor's office. I believe you can email the auditor at corrie.stokes@austintexas.gov. They will be happy to get together with you and walk you through the audit and where we are at in the process if it's not clear from the conversation today. Thank you. All right. For my colleagues who joined us a little bit after we started, I apologize that we started quickly. We are trying to combine two meetings and I appreciate you being aware of you being in never-never land and apologize for that. I'm not sure why that happens sometimes, but I appreciate that we were

able to get you back on quickly. So given that we are trying to combine essentially two meetings since we had to cancel the last meeting due to storm aftermath, we're going to try and move quickly today. We do have to spend the last about half hour in executive session for municipal civil service and determining who

[9:49:07 AM]

we are interviewing. So I'm just going to ask folks to try to be as con size and as quick as possible. If we have something -- I guess we will, but hopefully we won't need to do that. The next two items that we have are a homelessness follow-up item, item 2, and police follow-up item. Both of those are reports back from the auditor on implementation of recommendations that were made in other audits. This is something that we try and regularly do so that we can take stock of how the recommendations of our auditor are being implemented and keep accountability, keep those conversations going where they need to. So Ms. Stokes, if you want to bring up item 2, please. >> Absolutely. So we'll have two follow-up items. Just a reminder to you guys, last year our follow-up we

[9:50:08 AM]

were doing everything as a recommendation was ready to be tested. We tested it. And this year we're trying to be a little more thematic because I think it's more valuable to you guys and the public to hear about a whole topic. The first one we have on the agenda is the homelessness audit series. And this we actually looked at the homelessness audit. We did four of those in a row and then we also looked at some recommendations from our social services audit that happened to overlap with our homelessness contract. So Katie Houston and Kelsey Thompson. Katie was the manager, Kelsey was the lead on this project and they will be presenting to you and quickly. >> Thank you, good morning. I am Kelsey Thompson and I was the auditor in charge for the homelessness project. The purpose of this report was to follow up on the city's actions to implement on homelessness assistance and city contracting process audits. Next slide, please.

[9:51:09 AM]

We initially did the homelessness audits because council identified addressing homelessness as a top priority and we initially did the city's social service contracting audit because stakeholders were concerned that contracts to address homelessness were not effective or resulting in desired outcomes. We followed up on the city's social service contracting process audit along with the homelessness assistance audits because the recommendations we issued regarding homelessness -- regarding social services impact how the city provides homelessness assistance. However, the city's social service contracting process includes many other topics other than homelessness assistance such as basic needs,

health equity, workforce development, etcetera. And we issued 11 findings and 13 recommendations as a result of these five audits. Next slide, please. Of the 13 recommendations we issued, the city has implemented three. One is no longer applicable and four are still underway. And the city's implementation of five

[9:52:09 AM]

recommendations is on hold due to the city's need to respond to the covid-19 pandemic. Next slide, please. For the recommendations that have been implemented, the city assessed the camping, sit, lie and panhandling ordinances to determine the legal risks they pose to the city and council made changes to the ordinances for them to be more aligned with the city's vision to address homelessness. The city also created the homeless strategy position to coordinate efforts citywide. Next slide, please. Four recommendations are still underway. The city has made progress to address the quality and the accuracy of data about people experiencing homelessness by working with the ending community homelessness coalition to improve data collection and creating the Austin homelessness dashboard to provide more accurate and updated data to the city and the public. The city is developing strategies to meet the housing need and is meeting the goal in the Austin

[9:53:11 AM]

strategic housing blueprint with 50 more affordable housing units each year. The city has made progress with contracts related to homelessness assistance with stakeholder feedback to improve contracts and will implement the changes to the contracts in fiscal year 2022. However the city can continue to take action in these areas to fully implement these recommendations. Next slide, please. Covid-19 has impacted the city's ability to make progress on five recommendations. Austin public health was assigned to coordinate the cross-departmental response and implementation of these recommendations. And therefore these activities are on hold due to the reassignment of key Austin public health to respond to the covid-19 pandemic. Next slide, please. Thank you, and we are happy to take any questions. >> Alter: Thank you, Ms. Thompson. Ms. Stokes, was there any other city staff that wanted

[9:54:11 AM]

to respond to this? I know there was for the police audit. Was there for homeless audit? >> My understanding is we have several people available to answer questions both from the homelessness strategy office, from the housing department and from Austin public health, but I think -- I don't know that they had a presentation as much as they are here to answer any of y'all's questions that we can't answer. >> Alter: Great. Colleagues, are there any questions on this audit? Councilmember Kelly. >> Kelly: Thank you. And thank you for providing this information to us. I noticed that a lot of these items

were on hold because of covid. When can we expect them to get back on track and moving again? >> Our understanding is that timelines energy flux right now due to the evolving situation around the pandemic. And the Austin public health staff that is on the call may be more able to give a definitive answer on that. >> >> Kelly: Okay. Could Austin public health give us that answer or an idea of when it might get

[9:55:12 AM]

started again? Thank you. >> I don't see them moved over yet, but hopefully they will be any minute now. >> Alter: While they're moving over I want to point out that I believe that the contracting audit came out in December of 2019 and that one, you know, normally takes a little while for those recommendations to move through. And with covid hitting in March that's not at all surprising that they're not able to have adjusted that one. And I will just note that at least one of the ones that's on hold on housing the capacity to prevent homelessness we have taken a large number of steps to prevent homeless via our covid investments. It just doesn't follow exactly the audit because the audit was created in a context that did not include the pandemic, but many of the steps that we've taken have been to avoid and prevent homelessness for large numbers in our community.

[9:56:17 AM]

>> Pool: Chair, I'm, so were you done? >> Alter: Yeah, I was just going to acknowledge the staff that's on. But if you wanted to jump in before they speak. >> Mary Ingle has been trying to get back in and she texted me that it's been difficult. So what I would like to do is pass her phone number along to av or somebody on Corey's staff to initiate the call with Mary so she can get on and finish her comments to us. Corey, can I send Mary's phone number to you and then you can pass it along to whomever? Great. I've told her that we would try to call her. Thanks. >> Alter: Thank you, councilmember. Are you the person on to speak to councilmember Kelly's question? >> So I am on and I believe Adrian Sturup will also be on on the part of aph since there are a couple of -- three or four on hold -- a couple of which do respond

[9:57:22 AM]

or apply directly to homeless services division. I would make a couple of comments. Absolutely the rise in rent programs have been a huge preventive measure that have of course been administered through housing and planning department in terms of the rent supports and in particular about the ability to pay rental arrears and some forward rent. So that's been very important. The other piece that I'll mention is that as we look at the outcomes of the conversations around the summit on homelessness that is ongoing, one of the pieces that we have identified is the need to look at prevention, but in a very targeted way. Because nationally and sort of historically one of the

[9:58:23 AM]

things the homeless services have struggled with is to identify who really is on the verge of homelessness. Because lots of people need rental assistance. So one of the recommendations that we'll be looking at is that we look at prevention with a specific eye to people who have experienced homelessness previously and/or very significant housing instability. >> So those would be my commentary on prevention. And then the -- improving the coordination and collaboration with entities providing case management, that is certainly ongoing with echo and all of the providers, but in a -- I think a more concentrated way around what are the city controls, I think that we will be looking at the bss plus program to think through the various sort of

[9:59:26 AM]

styles of case management and how we can I think be more intentional about not having it be one-size-fits-all, but really understanding what everyone is delivering. And of course our work with echo is ongoing and that coordination and collaboration between stakeholders is one of their primary purposes. And I'm happy to answer any further questions. >> Alter: Ms. Sturup, did you want to respond? I believe that councilmember Kelly's question was about the timing of the restarting. >> I am not seeing Adrian. >> Alter: I see her name and I see that her audio is off. I don't know if she's having trouble speaking.

[10:00:26 AM]

>> There she is. >> Mayor Adler: We can't hear you. >> Alter: Yeah, I can't hear her enough. >> Hello? >> Alter: Now we can hear you, great. >> Awesome. All right. Good morning. I guess my headset is not working. Adrian Sturup, Austin public health. Councilmember Kelly, it is our hope that we will be able to resume the activities at the beginning of the next fiscal year. I think it will be contingent on, as Kelsey pointed out, covid operations. Now that we see phaser as approved for -- pfizer as approved for kids 12 to 15, our efforts might be focused on making sure we get our kids vaccinated and ready for school. As our community gets more vaccine and we have more providers up, Austin public health will be able to shift back to our more traditional duties and that will give us the time and flexibility to work on these issues. But best case -- worst case

[10:01:27 AM]

would be at the beginning of the next fiscal year we'll be able to turn and focus on those recommendations. >> Kelly: Thank you very much for providing those explanations. >> Alter: All right. Thank you. Mayor Adler? >> Mayor Adler: I appreciate this follow-up because I continue to believe along with the council that this goes to our highest priority in the city. And I know that a lot of this has been slowed down. I just want to tick off a couple of things that I think are really important as we're gearing back up to I'm really anxious to see, and that's to move forward on the data collection and the reporting by echo to resolve that issue so that we get better data more quickly to be able to do the work. I'm real interested in making sure that we have outcome metrics and make our

[10:02:29 AM]

contracts performance based contracts so that there's that measure of accountability. I think it's critical that -- the original recommendation was to create the homeless strategy officer and I'm real excited that we've done that and I'm real thankful that you're in that position. What we need desperately is a strategic plan. We have all kinds of reports in the past that have identified the elms for us that we need to do, but what has been missing has been an implementation plan, a calendar for what we need to do by when in order to meet the challenge and an associated spending plan so that the community as a whole can figure this out. Obviously it's not just a city responsibility. We can only do part of it. The county needs to do part of it. Echo independent agency getting federal money needs

[10:03:29 AM]

to do part. Haca independent entity getting dollars needs to do part of it. And obviously the service providers in the city. And then I hope the businesses in the philanthropic community. But we need that open -- [background noise]. I really look forward to getting to that as quickly as we possibly can. One thing to take a look at that was identified I think is important is that while we're successfully hitting the 50 permanent supportive housing units each year that was called for in the housing blueprint, I think now we know that that is just woefully inadequate to actually achieve the meeting of the challenge of homelessness. So to really revisit those goals that are called out for in that strategic plan. I would really like for us to get a better website and a landing page. The one we have now is static. And it's already out of

[10:04:30 AM]

date, which is what happens kind of with the static page. And I guess what we're looking for is more realtime tracking of funding and performing. A 83io map that tells us where complaints are coming -- geo map that tells us where complaints are coming from in the city and when we respond to them that they change colors or something so that there's some kind of realtime interactive feedback to the

community going to that page. And then the last thing I would just note that we've now kind of separated lobbying and contracts everywhere except for social service contracts, and the council asked the staff to take a look at how we do that in the last area of social service contracts. We haven't gotten there yet. And I wonder if it's just -- right now Austin public health is charged with that responsibility and obviously they've been point on a covid response and so much other stuff, but I also

[10:05:31 AM]

wonder whether that's the right place to do that because they're able to be lobbied. And I wonder if it might be better to take that assignment and give it to financial services or to the law department in order to be able to pop that out and move that forward. But I really appreciate the work that's being done. I know that covid has really slowed us down, but there have been a lot of resolutions that have been coming from the council, the heal resolution came forward with action. Councilmember tovo has brought several different elements of action. There's the community now with its own kind of -- members of the community with its plan with the summit to help advance these. We have the monies that are coming in from the American rescue plan, interest in the county in collaborating. I really do think this is a unique moment in time that we have that we need to see

[10:06:33 AM]

if we can seize to actually take this allege off our plate. -- Take this challenge off our plate at some foreseeable time. Thank you. >> Alter: Councilmember tovo and then councilmember pool. >> Tovo: Thank you, mayor, for those comments. I want to let my colleagues know as chair of the health and human services committee this year I'm going to be focusing a lot of that committee's attention on issues related to homelessness beginning with our meeting next week. So if you're interested in this issue please take a look at the items we're going to be taking up next week. And I think some, mayor, that you just indicated of ongoing interest we could incorporate into future meetings beyond next week. But I see that committee as really having the opportunity to kind of keep on top of some of these issues the numbers that we're housing, which grants have already been in place and some of the other issues that I know we've all expressed an interest in really following.

[10:07:35 AM]

>> Alter: Councilmember pool. >> Pool: Thanks. I wanted to thank our staff for their continued hard work on homelessness. I wanted to thank and amplify a couple of things that the mayor just said. Specifically about the work coming out of the summit, which sounds really good. The piece that I wanted to specifically amplify is that what I really liked about the summit is it was a convening of folks from all sectors in the community. And it can't -- because in my opinion the city of Austin cannot do this alone,

we've said that time and time and time again, but it really does bear repeating. We absolutely need everybody across all sectors in the community in order to address this properly. And I want to actually maybe if there is a way to create a situation where people don't look just to the city of Austin for this work, we have to do something about

[10:08:35 AM]

that. Nominally we seem to be the head of it all and I think that that stands in the way of bringing the larger group in. So I absolutely endorse that and hope to help work on that. And then the other piece, mayor, that you mentioned about the social service contracts need to be reviewed for the anti-lobbying why they're exempted. I remember asking this question a couple of years ago and I can't quite remember all of the specifics, but I hope in this second look, third look at the anti-lobbying ordinance with regard to the social services that we really scrutinize that carefully and then that will potentially ease the concerns that arise from time to time in our community over what seems to be violations of our conflict of interest, but are not. And we have to dig into why again and explain it to folks who would much rather have the consistency across the board. So thanks for bringing both of those up and I join you

[10:09:36 AM]

in those concerns and that effort. >> Alter: Thank you. I wanted to just kind of put a pin in something for future conversation because I think this report notes these things are on hold. And in my view some of these things we've been doing a lot. And my hope is that in our response to covid that we've learned, for instance, about, you know, improving coordination and collaboration and case management. And from what I understood of, you know, how we were approaching moving folks out of the prologues, etcetera, or from particular locations we were experimenting with different ways to do the case management. We were also experimenting with a lot of different ways to prevent homelessness. And I think it would be useful to bring together some of the lessons learned that are now informing how we approach better these

[10:10:37 AM]

audits, but take into consideration what we've learned from covid. In the interest of time I'm not going to ask you to go through that right now, but I do think that we have had by force of nature had to experiment and I think we've learned a lot and we've deepened and that we appreciate other things done by other cities in that regard and take these into consideration. If there are no other questions on this I want to see if Ms. Ingle is on the line. >> Yes, we do have her. >> Alter: Ms. Ingle, if you would like

to conclude your remarks. Sorry about that. >> Thank you. I'm very sorry to speak out of turn here and I have no idea what you heard because it's always -- I'm talking in the dark here.

[10:11:38 AM]

Just to close, I'm talking about waiving fees for interpretations, not variances, interpretations, which are very rare at the board of adjustments for regular citizens. Because sometimes this is the only way to correct an error on a permit or to address ambiguities in the code. And there are always ambiguities that need to be resolved. So I want to encourage you to adopt fee waivers for regular citizens and move a resolution -- a resolution forward soon. I've spoken to assistant city manager Gonzalez. He thinks it's very possible to do without a hardship to the city to reduce these fees and waive them without making bankrupt, of course. And it wouldn't be a burden. And so I just think this has to happen for the sake of fairness and equity to all

[10:12:39 AM]

the citizens so they have an opportunity for an interpretation if they need one. Thank you. >> Thank you, Ms. Ingle. I'll just note that I know at least I and councilmember kitchen and probably a couple other colleagues are working on a resolution that would do that for the fee waivers and address the situation that reintroduced looking at this as well. So thank you for raising that in this forum. The next report up is item 3 is on police oversight follow-up. >> Chair, can I interrupt for just a moment. >> Alter: Sure. >> So it looks like we have a certify from this morning -- speaker from this morning that was trapped in a different room who just signed in. It would be Chevis Watson. Are they able to speak now? >> Alter: Sure. >> Chevis Watson. >> Alter: Good morning, Mr. Watson. >> Can you all hear me. >> Alter: Yes, we can,

[10:13:39 AM]

good morning. >> Good morning, Alison. This has been a be leaguering process this morning. I don't know what was going on. I've tried this number a few times. As to -- I echo what Olivia Overturf and Tiffany Washington have stated. We need a complete new look at what's going on at the millennium. There's been quite some time since the last audit. There are those of us who live in district 1 who are also small business owners throughout the city who have a concern about what's going on at the millennium via item 67 a few weeks ago in the black Austin coalition or the black leaders collective, whatever you want to call them. We'd like to see actual

[10:14:41 AM]

documents showing the chronological history of what's going on at the millennium so that we as community members know how to support the facility moving forward. I was one of the first 50 kids at the millennium and it's definitely not the same place that it used to be. It is city run, city mandated with support from other partners. You know, I've been made privy to in the last few years. But we're still pretty much aloof as to what's going on, who's going to be involved in business dealings moving forward alongside Ms. Silas and the rest of them at the millennium. I feel like I jumped into this meeting at the crack of it so I don't quite know what item we're on. I had registered to speak on

[10:15:42 AM]

every item. So I thank you for allowing me just taking the time at this point being so frustrated, I think I would just like to observe. >> Alter: I apologize we were not able to get you in sooner. With the virtual meetings we try to take the speakers at the beginning of the meeting for all items and so we were fitting you in as soon as you were on so that you would be able to move on with your day if you were not watching everything. Councilmember harper-madison? >> Harper-madison: Thank you for recognizing me, chair. I was just going to say in addition to the auditor office's reaching out, I personally upon the first attempt to interpret what the management structure was and who was responsible for what and what entities are connected to whom and, you know, it's changed so many

[10:16:43 AM]

times over the years and it still remains relatively complicated. So it's starting to occur to me that we might want to put together some sort of diagram that really lays out for the community who's who, what their responsibility is, how they are connected with the process and then what it looks like moving forward. I think some community folks don't recognize that the board is a sovereign board and not connected to Ms. Silas or the management company she works for and how that relates to pard. I can see the confusion and frustration because it is complex and I hope we'll put together something that the community at large can follow. >> Alter: Thank you. And I'm sure that the auditor would be happy to also engage with Mr. Watson to provide clarification. Ms. Stokes, did you want to comment? >> No, all I was going to say is, you know, we struggled with that as well as we were doing this work last summer and we did put

[10:17:45 AM]

together a diagram that kind of shows this very complex relationship between all of the entities and that's in the audit report. But I think it's worth sitting down with anyone who wants to sit down with us,

we will walk through not just the audit report but what's happened since the audit and try to connect them with the parks department. I know they are on the call too and we'll have that item in a minute. But we'll connect them to people who can answer their questions which might be us but might be other folks in the city. >> Alter: Thank you. And I assume you can get connected to the clerk's office to get information more them. >> I will figure out how to do that. >> Alter: Thank you, mayor pro tem. So I think we will move on to item number 3, the plies oversight follow -- police oversight follow up.

[10:18:45 AM]

>> This is about police oversight. We had multiple audits in the last several years looking at different parts of police oversight whether that was complaints against officers, both cameras, mental health incidents. So we've looked at all the recommendations that we've made related to oversight in one fell swoop and Patrick Johnson is the manager of the audit, Maria is the lead and Maria will be presenting to us right now. And our presentation is starting, so all is working. But not that one. I saw it for a second so I know the presentation -- there it is -- is nearby. >> Thank you, corrie and good morning committee members. I was the auditor in charge for this project. Next slide, please. In this project we followed up on actions that were taken by the city related to recommendations from several past police oversight audits.

[10:19:45 AM]

This included an audit from 2016 on ads handling of complaints, two from 2018, effectiveness of police oversight and one on APD's response to mental health-related incidents. And one audit from 2019 related to APD's use of body worn cameras. Next slide, please. In these audits we issued 20 recommendations. I'll talk about the status of recommendations for each of these audits in the following slides, but overall the city has implemented 14 recommendations and six are underway. Next slide, please. The first audit we looked at as part of this project was related to APD's handling of complaints. Handling complaints against sin police officer we issued 11 recommendations. The city has implement ten and one underway. You can see those recommendations in our report, but overall the recommendations that have been implemented related to making the complaint process more accessible and improving the processing of

[10:20:45 AM]

complaints. So, for example, the city developed a website where the public can go and learn about the complaint process. And the city also clarified the complaint process to specifically allow for anonymous complaints. One recommendation from this audit is still underway which related to ensuring data and APD's complaint data base is accurate, complete and APD did make some changes, but APD is

implementing a new complaint data base in 2022. We'll wait until that new system is implemented to test and make sure controls in the system ensure reliability of data in the complaint data base. Next slide, please. A second audit was related to effectiveness of citizen police oversight. In this audit we looked at the effectiveness of citizen police oversight as well as APD of implemented recommendations which was known as the citizen review panel. In this audit we made four

[10:21:46 AM]

recommendations. Three of those recommendations were related to improving the effectiveness of citizens police oversight. The has has made progress all all recommendations. Clarified the citizens oversight process. For example, they now require that any recommendations made by the citizens oversight body to APD are made public and APD's responses to those recommendations are also made public. The city manager also established the community police review commission which replaced the oversight body in existence. This group has been operating since October 2020 and the the city is working on developing standard operating procedures to guide P work of this group. While a lot of work has been done on these recommendations, we are unable to test them and need this Guadalupe for operating for a period of time to make sure the process is working as intended. There was one recommendation from this audit that has

[10:22:48 AM]

been implemented and this related to ensuring information create by a citizen oversight body is protected and retained. The city did provide the new commission with training related to public information requests and confidentiality requirements and also provided commission members with city email accounts so that we can make sure that information generated by the new commission is able to be controlled by the city. Next slide, please. A third audit west looked at as part of this project was related to APD's response to mental health-related incidents. In this audit we looked at whether or not APD was effectively receiving and responding to calls involving people who were experiencing a mental health-related need. In this audit we identified several improvements including improvements related to training and responding to calls for service. We made two recommendations, one related to engaging the people most informed and affected by mental health-related issues and the second related to

[10:23:49 AM]

implementing solutions that were identified from that feedback. The city has implemented the first recommendation and is working on implementing the second. The city engaged with the community and a consultant known as the meadows mental health policy institute. And as a result of that process, six recommendations were issued to APD. APD is currently working with meadows on full

implementation of those recommendations. Next slide, please. The last audit we looked at as part of this project was related to APD's use of body worn cameras. In this project we look at whether APD officers were using body worn cameras in accordance with city policy, state law and best practice guidance. We made three recommendations in this audit, two have been implemented and one is underway. Related to the recommendations that have been implemented, APD has established quarterly supervisory review of body worn camera videos to make sure officers are using cameras appropriately.

[10:24:50 AM]

APD also established a tracking system for tracking public information requests they receive for body worn cameras and tracking whether or not videos requested as part of those requests are withheld or released. The city is making progress on the remaining recommendation, so the police technology unit which is within APD is working on a new tool that will allow APD to track body worn camera metrics. This includes metrics such as whether or not all calls for service have a body worn camera associated with them as they should and whether or not the videos are categorized appropriately which makes sure the videos are maintained in the system as long as needed. We'll go into tests to make sure the issues we identified in our audit have been addressed. Next slide, please. Next slide, please.

[10:25:52 AM]

We will continue to follow up on all of the recommendations from these audits until fully implemented. That concludes our presentation. Thank you. And we're happy to take questions. >> Alter: Thank you. I understand Ms. Mucodin is on the line and wanted to make a few remarks. >> Yes, it does look like she is here. >> Tovo: Good morning. >> Good morning, good morning chair, mayor and council. Thank you for this opportunity to present to you. It was a pleasure working with the audit staff. I'm really proud with transferring the panel to the police review commission. In terms of how we advertise for recruitment. We had over 70 applicants, which was a bit surprising. We selected ten which are very representative of our Austin community. They have gone well and beyond what is required by

[10:26:53 AM]

the meet and confer agreement in regards to training. We also had police oversight consultants train them not only in terms of their responsibilities of being commissioners but in terms of how they should review critical incidents. They've had a lot of support. The website, they have their own individual website. They have been meeting since October of last year. They were appointed in September. And they have their bylaws currently. And so far they've submitted three recommendations to APD. One regarding mental health recommendations, one regarding a critical incident that they reviewed, and

another regarding wanting to be more involved in resolution 95 that was passed last summer in terms of reviewing the policies related to the summer protests. So they are very active. We're still kind of working out some of the kinks in terms of review of critical incidents, but I'm very

[10:27:54 AM]

pleased with the progress and the ten commissioners that were selected. I think we have fundamentally changed their process and their review and their effectiveness. >> Alter: Thank you. Was there any other staff that were here that wanted to comment before we opened up to questions? Seeing none, do my colleagues have questions? Okay. I do have just a couple of real quick questions for Ms. Mucodin. Can you talk us through the ability to access internal affairs files? It says that the recommendation has been implemented. Is your office facing difficulties or roadblocks in accessing the files you need? >> So we have a shared data

[10:28:55 AM]

base. It's an internal data base that was created by ctm. And so essentially we -- we utilized that to access the information, but it is reliant upon internal affairs inputting that information into the system so that we can review it. So that -- that can be a little bit of a wreck he will since we don't have direct access. But fundamentally when we do need case file information, we can access it through that system. >> Alter: Thank you. I was pleased to see the full list of the recommendations for the contractor forums. That was in there. We're going to be approaching the contract negotiations again quickly, believe it or not. So can you tell me whether you believe there are areas of the contract that can be further modernized to reform, you know, and improve the effectiveness of our oversight efforts?

[10:29:56 AM]

>> Oh, absolutely. I have my wish list already. But I think particularly as it relates to the community police review commission, I think that there's -- it's a little too tight for them. I think there's room to allow them more authority in terms of their review of cases, particularly critical incidents. It's really right now limited to that and so there's probably room for some expansion. It is really, really tight in terms of their confidentiality, which I understand, but I think there's room to -- because they are the voice of the community, I think they have to have a little bit more leeway in terms of what they can and cannot communicate. We are -- we have had one opportunity, there's more coming, where they are now allowed to observe subject officer interviews. So I think that's an area of potential expansion. Yeah, those are just a few

[10:30:58 AM]

examples. >> Alter: Thank you. You know, we don't have to actually vote on this report, I just want to point that for recommendation 11, it sort of says that it's complete and implemented, and in my view this is still underway. We have done an enormous amount through the contract to improve oversight, but there's still more that can be done that follows from the original audit. And I don't think there's a lot gained from playing with the documents since it's a special report and we're not adopting it, but I do want to flag that in my view that is still underway. We have accomplished a lot, but we have more to do. There are also things that lie outside of the contract where we could improve oversight. Are there others that you believe can be improved in the near term to provide better oversight and transparency? >> Yeah, one of the things that I'm hoping to work with

[10:31:58 AM]

and resolve internally with interim chief which cha-cha cone, see -- where fundamentally only 20% much complaints were being investigated and I have an issue with that. I think we should be investigating more complaints from the community, not less. And so that -- I had a meeting with chief Chacon yesterday and he committed to working to address that issue, but that's one area outside the contract that absolutely needs to be addressed. >> Alter: Thank you. And there's some other little things that I could go into, but in the interest of time I'm not going to do that now. We talk pretty regularly on these issues and I'll take those off line. Are there any other questions from anyone else? Great. Well, thank you all for being here. We appreciate the report on

[10:32:59 AM]

these oversight items. The next item of business is item 4, a discussion of potential audit of disaster response. Councilmember tovo and I and probably some other colleagues had opportunity to talk with Ms. Stokes about some of the ways that we might approach this audit, and I'm going to invite the auditor to speak about her proposal on next steps and how we get to a place where we can identify the most appropriate audit, both in terms of fit with the audit office's skills and ability to contribute as well as in line with what council's concerns are. Ms. Stokes. >> Great. So I appreciate the opportunity to talk to you guys about this. And more of you guys are on the committee, which is always fun. For me, there's a lot of stuff that happens behind the scenes in an audit and I think normally we try not to

[10:34:01 AM]

overnerd and share happening behind the scenes but in this case I think it's relevant. When we do an audit, we do a lot of community work before we actually zero in to what we're going to do our audit work on. And what I propose for this audit is I've seen in the work plan and all the discussions that have been happening and certainly if your office has specific concerns, reach out and share those as well. What we want to do is take all of that information and put it through a funnel where we try to figure out, and that really is what the first stage is, putting us through that funnel and trying to zero in on the highest risk and not just the highest risk but the highest risks that aren't being addressed by somebody else. There may be a really high risk and it may be being reviewed right now by an external entity or something related to the electric grid, and if it's already being covered, then that's

[10:35:04 AM]

probably not the most useful place for my office to focus. What we really want to zero in are what are the areas where we know something went awry during the winter storm and we know that somebody else in the city isn't doing a deep dive into it. Or let's say the city is doing a deep drive into it, but y'all really want the kind of third party or the outside perspective that my office can bring. So that's what we're trying to narrow, kind of zero in on and my proposal would be come back to you all, basically give us a month, we'll do our work as quickly as possible, take in everything we've seen and everything people have been concerned about and then come back to y'all in April or May. I prefer April because I think the sooner the better. I think councilmember tovo's face just told me she prefers April as well. Let's come back as soon as possible but with audit

[10:36:04 AM]

ideas so we can get some clear, you know, here's two or three ideas of where we think highest risk is and we would bring that back to y'all, which as I mentioned we do this in every audit, we don't usually pause in the middle and bring it back to audit and finance committee, but I think this is an example of where that seems really appropriate. So I'm done for now. >> Alter: Thank you. I will also just add we'll have to jigger around with the audit plan in order to do this audit, and one of the things we've discussed is some of the covid after action plans are not quite right because we're not after covid yet, but we'll still do those audits but push them off into time. The other thing we will take up as a committee is the possibility of shifting when

[10:37:05 AM]

we determine our audit plan so it is not as aligned with the budget process so that -- if we did that shift this year, say, to November or December, that would also give us some of the flexibility to add this audit without much of a change to our existing plan. But until we know what the audit is, we won't be able to

take that up as a committee to think about providing that direction. It's not clear that we have to take a vote back to council, but we will certainly have the discussion among the committee on the appropriate next steps with that and consider that and just sort of throwing it out for now today. Councilmember tovo, did you want to speak or understand you are comfortable with the probably, but -- >> Tovo: Sure, and Corey,

[10:38:06 AM]

you read my face correctly. I think it's critical we get involved with this work and get the information back as soon as possible. I want to underscore I think the approach makes sense to see what else is being done, but I like that you highlighted -- that there may be a topic or two that are being investigated -- not investigated, are being analyzed and reviewed, but that they are still appropriate for audit review because we really rely on the auditor's office to get the outside perspective and you and I talked about some of the areas that may be the case. Thanks very much. I'm eager to see the information and put that alongside some of the other conversations that will be taking place about the review of the storm. >> Alter: Thank you. Councilmember Fuentes, did you have your hand up? >> Fuentes: Yes, thank you. I want to kind of make sure I have a good understanding what's coming in April. So in April the auditor's office will let us know a

[10:39:07 AM]

refined scope of work that the auditor's office audit will cover. In addition we're also going to be hearing from the city manager's office about the third-party independent audit which I'm assuming will be the audit of Austin water and Austin energy, our utilities and their response. Is that right? Is that fair to say? >> I think from -- I'm not sure about the time line on what the city manager is bringing back, but certainly something I can check in on and I know we will coordinate with them and make sure that, you know, if our -- as I think councilmember tovo said it nicely, if our work does overlap, it's going to be on purpose. We won't accidentally overlap with work being done by other folks in the city. But also as you mention it, we -- I think we won't bring back a specific scope of work, we may, but we're

[10:40:07 AM]

going to try to bring options back to gauge y'all's interest. Whoever wants to be here, which I appreciate is more than our committee. But whoever is here, what we want to do is bring back-topics is this what you want us to do so we get guidance where to go next. >> Fuentes: I think just in my office's preliminary research, we went back to the 2013 flooding disaster that we had here in district 2, and we saw it took about four months before the after action review was presented to council. And there was a corrective action plan that was instituted as a result of the after action report. Even in that corrective

action plan, there were still items that were identified that really were not implemented or executed during this winter storm disaster. So I think there's an opportunity -- or I would like for us to identify, you

[10:41:09 AM]

know, we've been through a disaster before. We've had these review processes in place, but there's staff and how we ensure those items we've stated need to be addressed and getting them implemented so that we're best prepared for the next disaster. So if there's a way either through your audit or perhaps through the other audit that will be done, I just want to make sure we have a clear understanding but I would hate for us to go through this process and especially as we engage our community and do this listening session that councilmember tovo's resolution outlined, that we're learning and implementing from it. That was the other thing I wanted to put on your radar. >> I appreciate that, and not something I thought about explicitly, but I really like the idea of looking back at lessons learned from prior disasters or storms or certainly nothing quite like what we experienced in February, but

[10:42:10 AM]

just very hard to compare it to prior incidents and how broad it was and how many people it affected. But I do think that looking back to those incidents and the flood for sure. We had a winter storm, I'm not getting the date right, but at point in the early 2010s, we had another winter storm, so what are lessons learned from that and what have we done with that information is something we can definitely look at. >> Fuentes: Thank you. >> Alter: I think, councilmember Fuentes, that's an interesting approach. I too have noticed going back to some reports, I didn't go back to the flood report that you did, but there are after action reports that say that we should have, you know, emergency operations training for council, which has never happened, which I've been discussing with the city manager, which hopefully we will move forward with in the next couple months. But there's a whole host of these after action reports whether it's the water boil,

[10:43:10 AM]

whether it's the other stuff where it certainly would be an appropriate thing for us to get a look back and see just like we just did with these audits on these after action things completed, were these actions taken, you know, and where do they stand. I don't know if that's exactly what we had in mind for the particular audit, but there's nothing to stop us from adding to the audit plan as we move forward and those may not be the immediate audit may be very focused on the storm, but then we might say we want to do a series of audits on some of these other plans that relate to climate disasters and in a

particular way moving forward that might not be the specific audit for this storm, but as part of our after -- after storm next steps.

[10:44:10 AM]

Councilmember pool, did you have your hand up? >> Pool: I did and it was just to endorse the approach that the auditor is recommending that fits with councilmember tovo's request, and I think that sounds good to me. I like the rigorous processes that we get through audit, especially this committee and I think it's really appropriate. It also [inaudible] The professionalism of staff and gives them time to being a late information and get us accurate and timely responses, so I think it's all good. Thanks. >> Alter: Thank you. Councilmember tovo? >> Tovo: Just quickly, councilmember Fuentes, you've hit on something that I think will have an opportunity, some opportunity to discuss in our council review. I have added to that exhibit a before we passed the work plan as a council asking with each section for the staff to reflect on how -- what items have been implemented from one of the plans that we had adopted

[10:45:12 AM]

that I think had indicated some next steps and some recommendations that in some cases we haven't yet -- we haven't yet implemented. So I agree that that work I think is really important. I do want to ask the auditor, at the point that wouldn't be my highest focus for this audit because I think we really need to understand what happened in the storm, in this storm and the response. But I do think we -- I think we will find as we have these conversations that we have some excellent planning documents on resilience, on what we need to do with regard to climate change that did lay out some blueprints for things that we need to do differently that we haven't done and that would have been of assistance today. So just to note that. Just for the record, I have done disaster response training. That's something that -- that is offered through the city and that we can do.

[10:46:12 AM]

I do agree that it would be useful to do it as a council and I especially look forward to that conversation because there are ways in which -- there are ways in which the manager, you know, it only works well if we're in an in a structure that follows along those guidelines. What I remember from that training there are clear ways in which councilmembers and elected officials can be helpful in a disaster in ways that we can actually, you know, that it's less helpful. But it really only works if the operation, the communication is there to allow us to do our respective jobs. I think it's time to revisit that suggestion, councilmember alter, I know you've made in the past about having disaster training and looking at going through it together, I think that would be very helpful. >> Alter: Thank you. I don't think we have to to any action on this item. We'll move on to item 5.

[10:47:14 AM]

We have item 5 where we're going to hear from the [inaudible] Board chair in response to their response to the earlier audit. We also have the smbr update and a quick discussion of the municipal civil service. We may or may not need to postpone smbr. I'm going to see how long the millennium takes and ace but that -- assuming we have end times we need to mark for most colleagues at 11:30. I will invite the speakers for item 5, the cultural arts center audit update millennium youth

[10:48:15 AM]

I don't know if someone from the auditor's office is going to introduce it or we're just going to move into -- >> I see Suzanne piper, our representative from pard, and perhaps she is introducing the item, although we can't hear you yet, and Courtney Robinson. I think they will take over from here. >> Alter: Great. Thank you. >> Can you hear me? >> Alter: Yes. >> Very good. Good morning, Suzanne piper, chief administrative officer for the city of Austin parks and recommendation department. I am sitting in on behalf of our director Kimberly [inaudible] Could not be here today. >> Alter: If you could speak up just a little bit. You are a little hard to hear. >> I'll go as loud as I can go. Upon review of the 2020 audit recommendations related to the cultural centers including the nyec

[10:49:16 AM]

or millennium entertainment complex, board members decided it would be appropriate for [inaudible] Dr. Robinson to introduce herself and [inaudible]. >> Alter: I think there's a presentation as well. Did you want that up? >> Yes, please. Good morning. I am the board chair for the millennium, Suzanne, it's wonderful to see you. I'm glad we are having the opportunity today to talk about our response -- >> Alter: Excuse me. Dr. Issue Robinson, I want to make sure we get the slides up. Av, can we get the slides up please? >> I'm looking here. I'm not seeing anything for that. >> Alter: In the backup on -- I don't know if it was given to you. It's available on the backup.

[10:50:26 AM]

Maybe we'll ask folks to access it via the backup for the committee unless Ms. Robinson needs it up while she presents. >> That would have been helpful, but let me pull up my copy. >> I can share my screen if that's helpful. I don't know if I actually can, but I think av can help me share my screen. >> I

can't share my screen. >> Alter: Av, what's possible? >> If corrie stokes would like to share their screen, they are welcome to. >> Let me pull it up first and I will gladly share my screen. I have it up. Thank you.

[10:51:27 AM]

I'm slowly hitting the share button. Here we go. All right. Does that look right? >> Yes. Thank you so much. >> Zoom. >> All righty, we're going to the first slide. And I just want to say that I'm going into year, year and a half as being board chair for the millennium. It has been an exciting run. We have discovered lots of things and began to understand lots of things. Could we go to the next slide? I just want to first identify that the audit that was done was done during a

[10:52:27 AM]

time when the current board wasn't seated. The audit was done, I believe from 2014 to 2018. You can correct me if I'm wrong, Ms. Stokes. But that board wasn't seated until 2019. So the board that was previously on the board of millennium was actually a part-led board. I think that's important to opponent out, and I also want to comment pro tem harper-madison for thinking about the millennium in terms of being a community-led board. I think that this building represents more than just a building and a city asset. It really does speak to what the community wanted at the time, and it is our vision to continue to make this space a community space for youth to learn and play. And so with that said, it is really our effort and our energy to really forge a

[10:53:29 AM]

positive path forward for the millennium. And so the recommendations that you will hear today really speak to how we want as this current board and hopefully an all-city board ongoing -- I mean an all-community board ongoing will operate and collaborate and co-create with the city of Austin and with the millennium city management team. Next slide. Next slide. There we go. So we'll speak to our first finding and sort of breaking down the barriers of trust. Among all of the stakeholders, it has been an ongoing process to ensure that we have a really great relationship with the park department, who is our liaison, and the community at large. And so I see that there's lots of improvement happening in the communication process, but it has to be noted that this

[10:54:31 AM]

is a -- a long history with the two entities. It spans over 20 years, and there have been some true harms that have happened. There's enough blame and shame to be around and that's not really what we're here for. We're really here to talk about what are the critical issues that need to happen to help us move forward. Because I was talking with the pard director, the millennium was ignored for many, many years. And woefully neglected. So we want to continue building that relationship, but we also want to be sure that all parties are committed to the mission of the millennium. And really thinking about how do we ensure that black and brown youth in particular and all youth have an opportunity to be in the millennium, to get what they need, to get services, to learn and to play. And within the next year, we want to ensure that our

[10:55:34 AM]

responsibilities and obligations as a board are met, and we will also present a resolution to the council to outline how we want that to happen. Next slide. The next finding was to ensure that it meets its mission effectively. Prior to this board, the board had not met for many, many years. It was very sporadic. This board has been meeting monthly since its inception, except for during the storm. We missed that month, I think like everyone else. And we've also begun to establish some committees. We have subcommittees. Our finance committee, which receives and reviews the facility reports and requests and looks at the budget and capital improvements. Our contract compliance committee which includes our attorney and another board member. Activities and creative

[10:56:35 AM]

space use because we're really thinking about the space in new and different and in exciting ways, and we really want to have city members on board who understand what this facility can really be alongside the community board members and, of course, we have a community stakeholder committee as well. Because we understand that this is a valuable space for our community and we want to be sure that we're meeting the needs of the community. Next slide, please. Ensuring adequate oversight. When we're talking about oversight, as I mentioned, the facilities managers for the millennium for many years were left to just do the best that they could. There was very little oversight happening because the board wasn't meeting. This all-community board is

[10:57:36 AM]

poised to act to remedy all of the issues that have been defined by the audit. And we want to, of course, consistently hold board meetings. We have determined working groups. We're working hard with the facilities manager to learn the current state of the N y.c. Burg our -- during our covid shut down during the stormy had an opportunity to tour and there's so many repairs and so much needs to be done inside

to make it a place where children feel welcome and excited to be there. We're going to be working with facilities management to determine all the areas that must -- all the capital improvements and interior improvements that must be done immediately. Of course we received and reviewed and acted on the facilities manager facility reports, maintenance and

[10:58:37 AM]

analysis and recommendation reports about the funding for the millennium. The millennium had one small funding increase in the 20-plus years it's been in existence. And the budget board member may be able to tell me in this is correct, but 3 to 5%. Had we gotten a 3 to 5% increase every single year, we would be equitably funding at this opponent, but that hasn't happened. We are trying to figure out how do we ensure how to provide the programming that children need. Next slide. >> I forgot that was me for a second. >> Thank you. Thank you for doing it. Finding 4 is make sure the maintenance is done in a timely fashion. I'm so excited to say that

[10:59:38 AM]

the communication, one of our sort of triumphs of the communication is that we have been able to replace our skating rink floor and also make that skating rink floor a basketball ball floor so we're super excited about the work the facilities management team did along with pard to make this happen. The skating rink was a hazard, and I'm just happy to report that we've been able to make those necessary improvements. However, we do need to talk about what equitable funding looks like, and so the relationship with the arcdc board plan of action, I think that it is important for this board to have a relationship with the city of Austin city manager because pard has a lot of things under their umbrella and a lot of facilities. And we believe that it would

[11:00:38 AM]

be important to have a direct contact with budget so that we can explain as a board what are the things we see, what is it that we need, because we are right here in it and right here on the ground versus having a middle mound -- middle ground. So it is our desire to have our operations budget moved from pard to the city manager's office. Next slide. I think it's also important to mention that for years, I want to say it was three years, we did not have a contract with the city. And so this board has been able to secure a contract with the city. Three years went by and I think that also speaks to

[11:01:39 AM]

the communication improvement among all of the parties. So to take the necessary actions to facilitate this equitable funding, we agree with the audit report there needs to be an evaluation of the fees so we are working with our facilities management company to take a look at the fees. We've done some of that work and we recognize that the fees are much lower than some of the other fees of the same type of facilities in our area in terms of bowling and skating and those kinds of things, our fees are relatively low, but we will continue to examine what that means for the community that is being served by the millennium. And we'll provide annual updates to that. If we have an equitable funding, if it is achieved,

[11:02:40 AM]

we will be able to hire a full-time person to really cultivate community partnerships. We have great community non-profits in this area. And we have wonderful schools. And we are surrounded by housing authority properties. We have an opportunity to serve in ways that I get giddy just thinking about. And so for us if we can have funding that allows us to build these kinds of partnerships, this city asset will be a gem in the community. And the board will authorize the use of the facilities activity revenue and any additional funding that happens to two recreational activities for youth at no or very limited costs. Our goal is to serve this community. Hopefully I went through that quick enough. I know we are short on time.

[11:03:41 AM]

So if there are any questions, we have board members on the call and other folks who can answer questions along with myself. >> Alter: Thank you, Dr. Robinson. I appreciate your leadership. Ms. Stokes, I think you can take that off. Great. Thank you. And welcome to the other board members who are with us. Colleagues, are there any questions or comments? I'll just note that this is a report that the board asked to make to us in response to the audit. There's not necessarily an action that we're taking today. Mayor pro tem? >> Thank you much. I appreciate it. I had the benefit of being able to follow along, courtside seats. I do want to express my deep gratitude and appreciation for the board members who are so tirelessly pouring themselves into the millennium youth entertainment complex, given we've described the complex nature of the series of

[11:04:44 AM]

events here and management and all the other complexities. What we as a municipality needed was a group of people who would wholeheartedly pour themselves into this, tirelessly as a volunteer board into course correcting and recalibrating and I just, I really am so grateful that we have a board that sees

the potential of this community benefit and is really fighting hard to get it to its best possible place and have it continue to be one of the pillars in our community. I'm just very grateful that we have this iteration of the board and this level of commitment to getting things right. Just a note of appreciation for the board. Thank you all very much. >> Alter: Thank you. And I want to just note of these findings, 1, 2, 3 and 5 are pretty much focused on what the board is going to do.

[11:05:46 AM]

Finding 4 does require action by the city and I don't know whether the full scope is feasible, however, we are in budget processes already and we have processes set up for quality of life commissions to have conversations with the budget office, and it seems to me that we don't have to change the reporting structure in order to open the space for that conversation to happen within the budget process. Obviously that happens through pard and right now that is where this is located. But in so far as this is a group, a volunteer group that is putting a lot of time and energy, I would just like to invite maybe Ms. Piper can help in so far -- whatever that process is for our budget staff, to listen and hear from our quality of life commissions, perhaps we can open this

[11:06:47 AM]

space for, you know, a virtual meeting with that board with the appropriate budget staff and pard there so that that voice can be heard through this process because it likely won't -- anything that would happen down the line will not be resolved in time in terms of governance for this budget process. Ms. Piper; that something. >> Yes, that is something we can do. >> Alter: Thank you. Mayor Adler? >> Mayor Adler: I just want to follow up from what the mayor pro tem said and the chair of the new board. I just think that this facility has such potential given its location in the community, where it is, its history, geographical location as well as the need in our community. So I really appreciate this

[11:07:49 AM]

group genetic in and everybody -- group getting in and everybody ready to make this so much more of an active and relevant place that meets then the need of the community and please reach out to my office in ways that we can help and support your work and the mayor pro tem's work on this property. >> Thank you. >> Alter: Thank you. Councilmember tovo. Then we've got to wrap up. >> Tovo: Thank you. I just too want to extend thanks to the board and for these recommendations. I think this is really interesting and agree with the mayor and mayor pro tem harper-madison, I think this has -- the millennium center is -- is a great resource and has the capacity to really expand its reach. I am -- I'm eager to try to sort out how having a for-profit management

[11:08:49 AM]

company impacts some of the funding conversations. And so I'm going to commit to doing a little bit to try to understand that better and how that has -- certainly the management structure has been complicated and that has in the past years made it complicated and delayed unnecessarily delayed some of the repairs that needed to happen to really make that a space that kids wanted to come and roller skate and participate in the other activities. I look forward to the continued conversation, but I think one of them needs to be -- needs to have some information about the revenue sharing between the for-profit management company and trying to remind myself of the audit we had last August. I'm not necessarily seeing that information. So as we continue to talk about budget and funding, let's bring that piece of that in as well. >> And if I could just, councilmember tovo, just so you are aware, this isn't an

[11:09:49 AM]

agreement that the all-community board set up, this is an agreement that the city park board established. And so we too have been working through what it all means. >> Tovo: Absolutely. I know it's a long history of that arrangement and I really, again, really appreciate the board for trying to sort these issues out. And that's -- that's kind of a key piece of we enter into revenue sharing opportunities with vendors all the time, but I would like to better understand whether that's the right arrangement for the millennium center. >> Alter: So -- >> Tovo: Given some of the other issues that have been raised. >> Alter: I'm going to -- Mr. Van eenoo has joined us. >> Very quick, just wanted to extend an offer, Ed van eenoo, chief financial officer for the city, wanted to extend an officer to Mrs. Robinson, the budget

[11:10:52 AM]

office would be happy to come out to the next arc meeting and present about the budget process, facilitate the conversation about the board's recommendations for the facility and facilitate the process of making sure those recommendations are seen by the appropriate department, by city management and by city council as we go through the budget process. We're at that part of the budget process where we're gathering input from across the city's boards and commissions and so I just wanted to make sure that invitation was offered to her and that we could coordinate with you on this. >> Thank you. >> Alter: Thank you, Mr. Van eenoo. I think that addresses what I brought up before. Ms. Jordan, if you wanted to say something quickly. >> As a new board we did that last year, met with the budget office and they came and spoke to us. Last year we were completely

[11:11:53 AM]

ignorant and more prepared to potentially fix some of the budget issues. Very much looking for to a different step we understand as process for the board. >> Alter: Thank you for joining us and Ms. Piper for joining us. I'm going to move on to item 6, the small business minority update. We are going the need to postpone this item. My staff has been in touch with them. My understanding it is not time sensitive if we move this to our April meeting. Without objection, we will postpone that item to the apomict. And then very quickly, we do have to move into executive session to take care of municipal civil service. So I'm going to say that we will not discuss future items other than to -- which is item 10 other than to take up item 8 and

[11:12:54 AM]

foreshadow where we're going to be going with ace. Councilmember, did you want to speak quickly to that and we'll have to go into executive session so we can determine who we're interviewing for the municipal civil service. >> Pool: Thank you, share. And that was all we really wanted to accomplish or I wanted to accomplish with the committee is introduce the fact I have requested information. You all have the answers from the board in your backup. Some of the information has -- is yet to come. I think there was some details on job posting that weren't included. So we'll be chasing those down too, but I appreciate Phillip's stance in lassoing this information so you had a chance to see it before today. And then I did let him know that I would like to have him and Ms. Thomas come and talk to us at our April 28 meeting to answer questions

[11:13:55 AM]

about the financial structure and it's a complicated mix of three different -- it's a tri diagnosis pard agreement just to kind of set the stage for understanding what this valuable asset the city has and provide some additional oversight that really we haven't made time for and I would like to make up for us not having made in my mind sufficient time. I don't know if councilmember tovo or councilmember Kelly wanted to make any remarks, and so I will see. Yeah, councilmember tovo I think -- >> Alter: If you could be brief. >> Tovo: Just a request that we also have city staff present for that conversation as well, so they can help us understand the history of why this structure is what it is and what other options may exist with relationship to the structure of the management

[11:14:55 AM]

of the Hilton. So I think that would be Lee Crawford and possibly some of our financial staff as well. >> Pool: Absolutely. Thank you for that. We'll certainly line them up. >> Alter: Councilmember Kelly briefly.

>> Kelly: I'm looking forward to getting more clarity on ace's operations. Being new to council, I am in a position where I'm learning with you all especially for this we'll get our answers to our questions because I know a lot of questions weren't answer understand the backup that we got. Thank you very much, lessee, our councilmember pool, for bringing this forward. >> Pool: I'll close by saying the city of Austin has our quasi city entities out there and I have asked to get a list of those so that we can have our knowledge base refreshed and so when we go into budget we have a concise list of all the groups like allc that we

[11:15:58 AM]

have oversight -- ace LLC and we have attachments to legally. Thanks. >> Alter: Thank you. So I believe this is all of the items minus item 7, which is municipal civil service applications and item 9, which is executive session for that. I believe I was just sent a version of the executive session script, so is there anything else we need to take up before we move to executive session? >> Just a quick preview on the future audit items -- not future audit items, future items for the committee. Obviously a conversation about ace, a proposal for the disaster response audit and our external audit by deloitte. We just moves the smbr, the update for that.

[11:16:59 AM]

The overview for April and we'll have an exciting and full April agenda. >> Alter: And we have some items that my office has been working on with Mr. Van eenoo, some finance items we may up with respect to the procurement policy revisions and the capital funding process as well. Okay, so I believe I now have a version of the script here. So what we're going to do is go into closed session and if we have to come back, I will announce who we're interviewing, I will come out to close the meeting and if we need to have a vote, we will do that. Otherwise all other business is done. The committee will go into closed session to take up one item pursuant to government code, the

[11:18:00 AM]

committee will discussion personnel matters related to item 9, appointment to municipal civil service commission. Is there any objection to going into executive session on the announced? Hearing none, the committee will go into executive session at 11:18 and hopefully we can be quick get over there and done with that so we can move on to our other commitments. Thank you so. See you in executive session. [Executive session]

[11:30:57 AM]

Item 9, it is 11:30 and we will reconvene the meeting and chair wants to announce that for candidates for municipal civil service commission, we will be interviewing Mackenzie Frasier -- Gupta, Kevin mullen and Andy Mormon. Thank you to everyone who applied for everyone for their willingness to be engaged. If you did not apply and you qualified and you want to engage with us this process we will have several openings over the next year so please be in touch with us so that we can consider you for serving on the board. So I don't think I need a vote on that. Do I? Okay. So seeing there is no need for a vote, I will now adjourn this meeting it is 11:31. Thank you, everyone and I appreciate everyone's help in getting us done on time with this ambitious agenda.

[11:31:58 AM]

We will look forward to the smbr discussion at our next meeting. Thank you. >> Thank you. >> Bye. >> Bye. >>