

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
PERMITS IN NATIONAL REGISTER HISTORIC DISTRICTS
APRIL 26, 2021
HR-2021-048237
CLARKSVILLE NATIONAL REGISTER HISTORIC DISTRICT
1816 WEST 11TH STREET

PROPOSAL

Construct a two-story residential building, a two-story garage, and a two-story accessory dwelling unit.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

- 1) Construct a two-story primary residential building. The proposed building features a compound cross-gabled roofline, with a shed-roofed inset entryway supported by metal posts and a projecting gabled enclosure at the main elevation. The inset entryway, inset porch at east elevation, and second-floor shed-roofed projection at east elevation are clad in fiber-cement horizontal siding, while the rest of the building is clad in fiber-cement board-and-batten. The west elevation features a second-floor balcony.
- 2) Construct a two-story detached garage. The proposed garage is oriented perpendicularly to the primary building, with bay door at west elevation. It is gabled, with cantilevered second floor and exterior stairs for second-floor access. Inset portions of the first floor are clad in horizontal siding, while the rest of the building is clad in fiber-cement board-and-batten.
- 3) Construct a two-story accessory dwelling unit. The proposed ADU is oriented perpendicularly to the primary building, with entry at west elevation. It is gabled with inset entryway and projecting window. Inset portions of the first floor are clad in horizontal siding, while the rest of the building is clad in fiber-cement board-and-batten.

All proposed buildings are constructed with standing-seam metal roofs and black metal fixed-pane undivided windows, arranged irregularly.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The City of Austin's Historic Design Standards (March 2021) are based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and are used to evaluate projects in National Register Historic Districts. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

Residential new construction

1.1 Set back a new primary building from the street in line with nearby historic buildings. An appropriate setback may be calculated with the following: a. The setback of one adjacent contributing historic building; or b. The median of contributing historic buildings on the same block. This method must be used if contributing buildings on the block have a variety of setbacks.

1.2 Locate a new building to maintain the rhythm of contributing buildings on the street.

1.3 Locate accessory buildings in a way that follows the historic location and setback patterns of similar buildings on the block or in the district. Garage apartments, detached garages, and other accessory buildings are typically located at the rear of the lot, behind and to the side of the front building.

The proposed primary building is set back approximately 26', roughly the same setback as adjacent contributing buildings. The proposed accessory buildings are located behind the primary building toward the rear of the lot.

2.1 Orient a new building to be consistent with the predominant orientation of contributing buildings on the same block.

2.2 Orient a new building towards the primary street.

2.3 For detached garages, match the predominant garage orientation found on the block's contributing properties.

The proposed main building is oriented toward the primary street, like others on the lot. The proposed garage and ADU are oriented toward the west, perpendicular to the primary street.

3.1 Design the height of new buildings to respond to nearby contributing buildings and the dimensions of the lot.

3.2 Design the massing of new buildings to reflect the character of nearby contributing buildings. Simple massing is typically appropriate.

3.3 Use step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent contributing buildings by more than one-half story.

3.6 Design accessory buildings to be visually subordinate to the primary building in height, massing, and form, as viewed from the street.

The proposed buildings are two stories, while most contributing buildings in the district are one story. The new construction's vertical massing is not compatible with nearby contributing buildings, though the simple forms and step-down first floor articulation at the primary building's main façade comply with the standards. The two proposed accessory buildings match the primary building in height, though their massing and form are simpler than the primary building; they will be minimally visible from 11th Street.

4.1 Design the proportions of new buildings to be compatible with those of contributing buildings on the same block.

4.2 If the proportions of contributing buildings on a block vary, the design of a new building may select from those options. Contributing buildings elsewhere on the block include hall-and-parlor houses with full-width porches and Craftsman-style bungalows. The proportions of the proposed new buildings do not appear compatible with either form.

5.1 Design new buildings to be compatible with the character of the primary building, historic district, and/or historic landmark in terms of scale, massing, proportions, patterns, materials, and architectural features.

5.2 Design new buildings to be differentiated from historic buildings.

5.4 If designing a building in a modern style, use corresponding modern architectural details.

5.5 Do not combine character-defining features from different architectural styles unless similar eclectic buildings were historically present in the historic district or on the historic landmark property.

The scale, massing, proportions, fenestration patterns, materials, and architectural features of the proposed new buildings deviate from the historic character of the surrounding district. However, the buildings are differentiated from historic buildings and use modern architectural details that correspond to their modern design.

6.1 Design simple roof forms that reflect the character of the roofs on contributing buildings.

6.2 Any roof details such as dormers, eave detailing, and bargeboards must correspond to the form and architectural style of the new building.

6.3 Select roof materials that match or are compatible with the roofs on contributing buildings, particularly buildings with a similar form and architectural style to the new building. a. Metal roofs in a historic district may be appropriate, depending on the type of metal proposed. b. If metal roofs historically were present in the district, construct new metal roofs with similar finish and details.

The proposed roof forms are simple; complex rooflines at the primary building's secondary elevations would appear minimally visible from the street. Metal roofs may have been historically present in the district; most nearby contributing buildings use shingle roof cladding.

7.1 Use exterior wall materials that are compatible with the character of the historic district in scale, type, material, size, finish, and texture.

7.2 For rear buildings, use siding that is compatible with the primary building.

7.4 Make the use, pattern, and arrangement of secondary materials compatible with the character of the district.

7.5 Avoid windowless walls visible from a street, unless such walls are a character-defining feature of the historic district. The proposed board-and-batten siding at second floors is not compatible with the district, as it emphasizes the incongruent height of the new buildings. The rear buildings' cladding matches the primary building; all three use fiber cement siding. The use of horizontal siding as a secondary material at inset bays is not present elsewhere in the district. All near-windowless walls are located on secondary elevations and will be minimally visible from the street.

8.1 Design street-facing facades to have similar window and door opening patterns as nearby contributing buildings.

8.2 Select windows that are compatible with nearby contributing buildings in terms of size, configuration, and profile.

8.3 For rear buildings, match the style, proportions, and materials of the windows to the primary building's style and design.

8.4 Locate front doors of new primary buildings so that they are visible from the street, unless another entrance location is a character-defining feature of the historic district.

8.5 Match the style, proportions, and materials of the front door to the building's style and design.

The proposed primary building's door is oriented toward and visible from the street; the window patterns are regular at street façade. The undivided panes, irregular placement at secondary elevations, and thin, shallow metal frames are not compatible with the district. The projecting windowed room at the main elevation is not compatible with massing or fenestration in the district. The proposed rear buildings' windows complement the primary building's in their style, sizes, and arrangement.

9.1 Include a porch in the design of new primary buildings if the majority of contributing buildings on the same block have porches.

9.2 Design new porches that reflect and continue the size, proportions, placement, depth, and rhythm of porches on contributing buildings within the district.

Most contributing buildings on the block have full-width shed-roofed porches or partial-width gabled porches. The proposed primary building has a porch, though its shed-roofed corner-cutout design does not reflect the size, proportions, depth, or rhythm of porches on contributing buildings in the district.

The project meets some of the applicable standards.

STAFF COMMENTS

The existing apartment buildings are of historic age but were relocated to the site in the 1980s from an unknown location, rendering them ineligible for landmark designation. They do not appear to reflect the character of the Clarksville National Register Historic District during its period of significance and are identified as noncontributing in a 2018 survey of the Clarksville-Buass-Martin neighborhood.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Comment on new construction plans and release the permit, encouraging the applicant to consider horizontal siding, divided-light windows, a full-width front porch, and shallower roof pitches for the proposed primary building.

LOCATION MAP

(Insert map.)

PROPERTY INFORMATION

*Photos**Photo source, date**Occupancy History*

City Directory Research, date

1959

1957

*Biographical Information**Source, date**Permits**Permit type, date*