

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
MAY 24, 2021
HR-2021-067051
1805 E. 3RD STREET
HERRERA HOUSE

PROPOSAL

Replace the front doors and paint the historic house; construct a 2-story rear addition. Previous restoration work was approved administratively.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The proposed project involves six parts:

- 1) Replace the non-historic front doors with 2-over-2 glazed doors.
- 2) Replace the metal roof with composition shingles with a wood-shake profile.
- 3) Paint the house to match the historic color (yellow).
- 4) Reconstruct the rear (south) wall after it was removed beyond the scope of approvals. The proposed new wall includes a 3-panel fully glazed sliding door and a window opening with a 2-over-2 window (sash material pending).
- 5) Construct a 4'3" deep concrete patio behind the rear (south) wall of the historic house.
- 6) Construct a 2-story rear addition. The addition is set back approximately 24' from the front wall and has a footprint of 265 square feet. It is clad in horizontal hardiplank siding and capped by a front-gabled roof, with a slope and eave depth matching those of the historic house. Windows are sliding and fixed vinyl-sash. A garage on the ground floor is accessed by a glazed roll-up door on the rear (south) wall.

ARCHITECTURE

One-story, L-plan, cross-gabled building; vertical board-and-batten siding; 4:4 wood-sash windows; shed porch with two entry doors; National Folk style.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

The City of Austin's Historic Design Standards are based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and are used to evaluate projects on historic landmarks. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

Repair and Alterations

General Standards

1.1 Do not remove intact historic material from the exterior of a building.

1.2 Always attempt repair first. Replacement should only be undertaken when absolutely necessary, and for the smallest area possible.

1.3 When historic material must be replaced due to damage or deterioration, replacement material should look the same, perform reliably within the existing construction, and, in most cases, be made of the same material.

The proposed project repairs and retains historic wood siding, windows, and trim. Where replacement of boards or battens is necessary due to deterioration, replacements will match historic materials and profiles. The project meets these standards.

1.4 Do not attempt to re-create an architectural detail or element without proof that it existed on the building historically.

The proposed project replaces plain wood porch posts with turned wood posts matching the profile of existing engaged posts. The project meets this standard.

1.5 When demolishing additions or features that were built after the building's period of significance, minimize damage to the building.

The proposed project replaces rear additions in poor condition with a new addition. The project meets this standard.

Roofs

3.1 When replacing roof material, use a material that is appropriate to the building's history and character.

3.5 Owners of landmark properties must replace roofs with material that approximates the appearance of the historic or existing roof material.

d. Standing seam metal roofs, despite their historic look, are generally not acceptable for historic landmarks unless the

owner can document that the building historically had a standing seam roof.

The proposed project replaces a metal roof with composition shingles that mimic the appearance of the building's original wood-shingled roof. The project meets these standards.

3.2 When replacing roof material, retain the configuration; pitch; soffit detailing; character-defining features such as chimney, gutters, and ventilation systems; and design, configuration, and detailing of eaves.

3.3 Retain and repair historic decorative roof elements.

3.4 Do not add decorative roof elements that were not historically present.

The proposed project retains the roof form and character-defining features, including decorative trim, and does not add any elements not historically present. The project meets these standards.

Exterior Walls and Trim

4.1 Repair, rather than replace, historic material, unless it is deteriorated beyond the point of stabilization or restoration.

The proposed project repairs existing wood siding on the north, east, and west walls. The project meets this standard.

4.2 When replacement or patching is required, use a compatible material that has a matching profile and texture, and that will not damage the historic material.

Where replacement of boards or battens is necessary due to deterioration, replacements will match historic materials and profiles. The project meets this standard.

4.7 Obtain historic approval before changing exterior paint colors or painting unpainted masonry.

The proposed project includes repainting the house (currently aqua) a canary yellow color. This color was matched to a historic building element and is in line with the recollections of Herrera family members. The project meets this standard.

4.8 Do not remove or replace exterior cladding and trim for additional insulation.

The project does not remove exterior cladding or trim and meets this standard.

Windows, Doors, and Screens

5.1 Repair, rather than replace, historic windows, doors, and screens; and their trim, surrounds, sidelights, transoms, and shutters, unless they are deteriorated beyond the point of stabilization or restoration. Retain windows if 50% or more of the wood or metal sash members are intact.

The historic windows, trim, and shutters (on the easternmost window on the front wall) will be retained and repaired. Glazing on some walls will be replaced with new glazing in the historic sashes; information on the location and scale of the replacement is pending. The project meets this standard.

5.7 If replacing a non-original door, identify the historic style of the door through research, or look to nearby similar properties to guide the choice of a replacement.

5.8 If a historic window or door is missing, replace it with a new unit based on documentation of the historic feature. If no documentation exists, use a new design compatible with the historic opening and the historic character of the building.

The non-original front doors are proposed to be replaced with 4-lite doors. The project does not meet this standard.

5.13 Do not enlarge, move, or enclose historic window or door openings unless required by an addition. If an opening is being used to connect to an addition, retain the size and configuration of the opening to the greatest extent possible.

5.14 New door or window openings must be limited, appropriate for the building, and compatible with the architectural character.

The proposed project retains historic window and door openings and does not create any new openings in historic walls. The rear wall was demolished without approval, and the proposed new wall includes new door and window openings that do not match historic. The project does not meet this standard.

Porches

6.1 Repair, rather than replace, historic porch decking, piers, columns, railings, skirting, and trim, unless they are too deteriorated.

The proposed project retains engaged turned posts and replaces plain replacement posts with turned posts replicating the engaged profile. The concrete decking will be retained with the same dimensions. The project meets this standard, though revised elevations should be carefully reviewed for accuracy before the project is released.

6.2 If it is necessary to replace historic elements, use compatible material with matching dimensions and details. Compatible materials include wood, rot-resistant material, or matching masonry and concrete.

6.3 Maintain porch dimensions and height.

The proposed project maintains the porch dimensions and height. The concrete decking will be retained with the same dimensions. The project meets this standard.

6.4 Maintain the open nature of front porches.

The proposed project does not enclose the front porch and meets this standard.

Residential Additions

Location

1.1 Locate additions to the rear and sides of historic buildings to minimize visual impact.

The proposed addition is located at the rear of the historic building, 24' behind the front gabled wall and 12' behind the side-gabled wing, and preserves the building's form. The project meets this standard.

1.5 Minimize the loss of historic fabric by connecting additions to the existing building through the least possible invasive location and means.

The proposed addition is connected to the rear of the existing building, where non-historic additions in poor condition were previously removed. The project meets this standard.

1.6 Additions are not appropriate for all historic landmarks and will be evaluated on a case-by-case basis.

Staff believes that the location, design, and materials of the proposed addition are generally compatible with and differentiated from the historic building. However, the scale and massing are not subordinate to the small one-story historic building and could be more compatible. The project does not meet this standard.

Scale, Massing, and Height

2.1 Design an addition to complement the scale and massing of the historic building, including height. The addition must appear subordinate to the historic building.

The proposed addition is two stories high, with a ridgeline that is 26' high, 8' higher than the historic ridgeline. The addition is attached to the rear wall of the historic house and subordinate in location, but not in height or massing. The project does not meet this standard.

2.2 Minimize the appearance of the addition from the street faced by the historic building's front wall.

a. If the addition connects to the historic building's rear wall, step in the addition's side walls at least one foot (1') from the side walls of the historic building.

The west wall of the proposed addition is stepped in 1' from the west wall of the historic house, but the addition is 8' higher than the ridgeline of the historic house and will be highly visible from E. 3rd Street. The project partially meets this standard.

b. The historic building's overall shape as viewed from the street must appear relatively unaltered.

The proposed addition is connected to the rear wall of the historic house with a one-story hyphen, leaving the historic house's shape intact. The project meets this standard.

Design and Style

3.1 Design additions to be compatible with and differentiated from the historic building, if they are visible from the street.

a. Design proportions and patterns such as window-to-wall area ratios, floor-to-floor heights, fenestration patterns, and bay divisions to increase compatibility.

b. Do not replicate the design or details of the existing building to a degree that the addition might be mistaken as historic.

The proposed addition is generally compatible with and differentiated from the existing building, with similar window-to-wall area ratios and fenestration patterns on the west wall visible from the street. Larger ground-floor windows, horizontal windows on the second floor, and modern materials will ensure that the addition will not be mistaken as historic. The project meets this standard.

3.2 No particular architectural style is required for addition design. Designs in both traditional and contemporary styles can successfully achieve compatibility and differentiation with historic buildings.

The proposed addition is designed in a stripped-down style that references the historic house. The project meets this standard.

Roofs

4.1 If an addition will be visible from a street on the front or side, design its roof form and slope to complement the roof on the historic building.

The front-gabled roof of the proposed addition matches the roof form and slope of the historic house. The project meets this standard.

4.2 Use roof materials that match or have similar color, texture, and other visual qualities as the roof on the historic building.

The addition roof materials will match the roof materials on the historic building. The project meets this standard.

Exterior Walls

5.1 If an addition will be visible from a street on the front or side, use exterior wall materials that are compatible with those on the historic building in scale, type, material, size, finish, and texture.

5.2 Differentiate the exterior wall materials of the addition from those of the historic building. This could be accomplished by using different materials, using the same materials with different dimensions, or changing trim type or dimensions.

The proposed addition will be clad in horizontal hardiplank siding that is differentiated from the historic house. The project meets this standard.

5.3 Avoid windowless walls facing a street.

The proposed addition's front (north) wall does not include windows. However, it is set behind the historic house's rear wall and helps to avoid drawing attention to the addition. The project meets this standard.

Windows, Screens, and Doors

6.1 If an addition will be visible from a street on the front or side, use windows that are compatible with those on the existing building in terms of material, fenestration pattern, size, proportion, configuration, and profile.

Ground-floor windows on the addition's west wall have sill heights that match those of the existing window openings.

The second-story windows are wide, high windows that deemphasize the second story of the addition. The windows are vinyl-sash. The project meets this standard, except for the window materials; vinyl is not appropriate for an addition to a historic landmark.

Attached Garages and Carports

9.2 Set attached garages and carports back from the front wall of the building to minimize their visual prominence.

The first-floor garage in the addition is located behind the historic house, with a rear-facing door, and is not visible from the street. The project meets this standard.

9.3 Design a new attached garage or carport to be compatible with the historic building in terms of size, massing, proportions, style, and materials. The new garage or carport should not be designed to appear as though it was constructed simultaneously with the historic building.

See comments on addition location and massing. The project somewhat meets this standard.

COMMITTEE FEEDBACK

Replace metal roof with dimensional shingles and retain all windows possible. Committee members were supportive of the addition's roof pitch and form and requested perspective views.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Postpone the case to June 28, 2021, with additional feedback from the Architectural Review Committee regarding period-appropriate front doors for the historic house and one-story design options for the addition. Request redesign of the south wall to replicate historic openings, doors, and the window. If the Commission elects to approve the project, authorize staff to administratively approve the color specification and release plans after accurate elevations are received.

LOCATION MAP



SUBJECT TRACT



PENDING CASE



ZONING BOUNDARY

1" = 166'

NOTIFICATIONS

CASE#: PR 21-036097

LOCATION: 1805 E 3RD ST

This product is for informational purposes and may not have been prepared for or be suitable for legal, engineering, or surveying purposes. It does not represent an on-the-ground survey and represents only the approximate relative location of property boundaries.

This product has been produced by CTM for the sole purpose of geographic reference. No warranty is made by the City of Austin regarding specific accuracy or completeness.



PROPERTY INFORMATION

Photos



Source: Historic Preservation Office, May 2021