HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness November 15, 2021 HR-2021-166282 Castle Hill Historic District 807 Baylor Street

PROPOSAL

Repair historic-age windows. Replace retaining wall. Restore original wood siding, porch, and trim at south, west (main), and north elevations. Replace roof. Remove 1-story addition and replace with 2-story addition. Replace rear balcony with screened porch.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

- 1) Construct a 2-story rear addition in place of the existing 1-story addition. The proposed addition is set back approximately 23 feet and is sited at south, east, and north elevations. The proposed addition is clad in fiber-cement siding with brick at basement level. It features metal windows and a composition shingle roof. Historic wood window from rear will be salvaged and installed adjacent to historic wood window at north elevation.
- 2) Remove existing wood-framed balcony with lattice rail and replace with screened porch at south and east secondary elevations. North, east, south, and west elevations Wood framing and finish, porch screen, brick piers.
- 3) Repair, repaint and reglaze existing windows, where deteriorated, at all elevations. Replace in-kind where deteriorated beyond repair.
- 4) Restore original wood siding, porch, and trim at south, west, and north elevations.
- 5) Replace existing composition shingle roof with new composition shingle roof.
- 6) Replace current railroad tie retaining wall with masonry retaining walls not to exceed 2' at south and east elevations.

ARCHITECTURE

One-story Folk Victorian house with wing-and-gable plan, partial-width porch with turned posts, 2:2 windows with 3:1 and 4:1 screens, original entry door with transom window, and fish-scale shingles at gable end.

DESIGN STANDARDS

The Castle Hill Design Standards are used to evaluate projects within the historic district. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

A. General District Standards

(a) Repair, rather than replace, original materials. Replace only materials that are deteriorated beyond repair or that detract from and are not original to the building. Replacement materials shall match the original materials when feasible. The proposed project repairs original materials where possible and uses matching replacements where needed.

(b) Do not make changes to the public view of an existing contributing or non-contributing building that have no historic basis and/or that seek to create the appearance of an architectural style that is not original to the existing building. The proposed changes to the street-facing elevation appear appropriately differentiated.

(d) The allowable height for additions and new construction is the average height of the adjacent properties on either side of the subject property or 32', whichever is greater. The proposed addition is evently 22' in height

The proposed addition is exactly 32' in height.

<u>B. Site Improvements</u>

(b) Masonry retaining walls (exposed on one side, earth-retaining on the other) are permitted as per city code.
(c) Masonry site walls (exposed on both sides of the wall) may not exceed 2' in height unless pre-existing.
The proposed project replaces existing railroad ties with masonry as retaining wall supports. Retaining walls do not exceed 2' in height per plans.

C. Rehabilitation or Alteration of Contributing Buildings

(a) Maintain the historic style and retain character-defining features. The proposed project retains character-defining features.

(b) Do not install new materials that obscure or endanger original materials, including but not limited to painting of original masonry or installation of vinyl or aluminum siding over original wood siding.

The proposed project does not appear to obscure or endanger original materials, except where removal is required for the rear addition.

(c) Repair existing original windows unless determined infeasible due to excessive deterioration that is adequately documented in the application for a certificate of appropriateness. Utilize recommended repair practices listed below where feasible.

The proposed project repairs existing original windows where possible at all elevations, and salvages rear window for use on north elevation.

(e) Roofs. (1) When replacing a roof, maintain the original roof form and other character defining features of the roof including overhangs, barge boards, rafter tails, and cresting, where existing. (2) Unacceptable roof materials are those that are not used elsewhere in the district, are not appropriate for the subject property, or have otherwise been determined incompatible with the district or the subject property.

The proposed project replaces roof materials in-kind and retains character-defining features at primary elevation.

D. Additions to Existing Buildings

(a) For contributing buildings, a new addition shall not visually overpower the existing building, compromise its historic character, or destroy any unique character defining features.

The proposed addition does not appear to destroy character-defining features at the main elevation. A historic-age rear wing and basement doors will be removed, and one historic-age window will be relocated to another elevation.

(b) For contributing buildings, two-story additions to one-story buildings must be set back a minimum of 1/3 the depth of the building measured from the front wall of the house (excluding the porch), or 15 feet measured from the front wall of the house (excluding the porch), whichever number is greater.

The proposed addition is set back 23' from the front wall of the house, immediately behind the existing roof ridge.

(c) Design an addition using appropriate scale and detailing to avoid creating a top-heavy appearance. The proposed addition may appear top-heavy due to its large size; however, street topography may affect its visibility.

(d) Materials of the addition (walls, roofing materials, and windows) shall be compatible with the original building and may include use of modern materials such as fiber-cement siding, as appropriate. The proposed addition's materials appear appropriate and differentiated from historic-age materials.

(e) New roof forms must match the pitch of the roof on the existing house to the greatest extent possible. The proposed roof appears to match the existing roof pitch where possible; however, the addition's complexity at secondary elevations does not reflect the original building's design.

(f) Windows shall be compatible in form and materials with the existing building and can be used to define contemporary design when determined appropriate for the particular application. The proposed new windows are compatible in form and materials.

<u>Summary</u>

The project meets most of the applicable standards, and the applicant has amended the design in response to Committee feedback.

PROPERTY EVALUATION

The property contributes to the Castle Hill Historic District.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve the application, encouraging the applicant to further reduce the height of the addition's second-story hipped roof.

