

Public Safety Committee (PSC) Meeting Transcript – 5/23/2022

Title: ATXN-1 (24hr)

Channel: 6 - ATXN-1

Recorded On: 5/23/2022 6:00:00 AM

Original Air Date: 5/23/2022

Transcript Generated by SnapStream

Please note that the following transcript is for reference purposes and does not constitute the official record of actions taken during the meeting. For the official record of actions of the meeting, please refer to the Approved Minutes

[2:06:48 PM]

Councilmember gnat, and, Natasha harper-madison and we are meeting in person today in Austin city hall. It is may 23rd, 2022 -- and the time is now 2:06 P.M. I am going to call this meeting to order. First on our agenda, we have to approve the meeting minutes from March 28's public safety committee meeting. Do I have a motion? >> Councilmember Kelly motions we approve the meeting minutes from March 28, 2022 and seconded by councilmember Ellis. All those in favor. We have a unanimous vote to approve those meeting minutes. We are going move right into discussion. We are going to discuss city preparation force disaster resilience. Sponsored by myself and councilmember Ellis. Then we are going to move into some briefings. We have one, two, three of those, all relatively

[2:07:49 PM]

substantive so I am looking forward to getting those. It looks like we have director Ortiz with thus morning. I am assuming to discuss city preparations for disaster resilience. >> Good to see you. And that it is not an emergency. >> Madam chair -- >> You meant unanimous with 0 councilmember vela off the dais. >> Do you need me to do that for the record. >> I am sorry? >> I called it unanimous for adopting the minutes but it is unanimous with councilmember vela off the .. Dais. >> And we have a speaker on the phone, if we can unmute. >> And then we will follow that with a presentation. >> The speaker has two minutes, correct?

[2:09:03 PM]

>> Our speaker is not present so we will move on. Okay. Thank you. >> Thank you. >> Director Ortiz. >> Good afternoon. Thank you for having me here today. I am the director for homeland security and emergency management and a, you know, I would like to be here to answer any questions that you may have as far as from resilience standpoint. The city, with we are working real hard in a lot of different areas and we have had a lot of input as a result of winter storm Yuri and city audit and different efforts are underway. But I would like to more specifically what questions you had as to from resiliency standpoint, and in regards to the city. >> Do we have any questions councilmember Kelly. >> Thank you. >> Kelly: I know that our city is about to get really hot as we do traditionally each time this part of the year cops around. So I am wondering in that context how are we going to

[2:10:03 PM]

improve educating the public on where our cooling centers are going to be and then also how prepared are we for wild fires, brownouts or blackouts? And what steps are we actively taking to prepare for the next heat wave during the summer? >> Yes. Thank you for that question. The we actually have been working on our heat plan update. We have had several meetings with a working group to evaluate the conditions of the plant and what direction we are moving and what our capabilities we will need to have on hand. On one of the key parts of that is making sure that we continue to support our -- the pillars of our community, that is making a plan, building a kit, knowing your neighbor and getting connected. And that is the foundation of the preparedness, specifically for heat. You know, we are working with

[2:11:04 PM]

departments and agencies to make sure we are all aware and understand what our capabilities are going to be and how those are going to be monitored, evaluated and what the triggers are going to be for us to be standing up and engaging with the district communication. Heat is manager that we experience every year and so we need to constantly remind all, everybody on what aspects they can do to prepare for the summer heat and making sure that we are also looking on what things they can do to keep themselves cool. There are other existing programs that are providing fans and other resources to help the community and with we can give you a list of what those programs are. I don't have a specific list here in front of me, but some of the things that we want folks to know is that if they are experiencing conditions in their homes, that are too hot, there are places where they can go and

[2:12:05 PM]

before we even open up cooling stations they can go hang out during the day when the worst heat may be experienced and then be able to stay home. When we have multiple days of three indictment degrees and experiencing really bad heat conditions, through our health department we will be evaluating what

those impacts of the heat are going to be having in our community and then we will be activating a formally activating cooling stations. We can give you a synopsis at a later, after this meeting with what those specifics are going to be, but we have identified how we will activate cooling stations and how will we be communicating with not only the public but the rest of the partners. And -- in the heat response. Specifically, dealing with urban fires or wild land fires, our

[2:13:08 PM]

fire department takes the lead on that, our fire division is working with us and in Travis county to ensure we are constantly taking those things into consideration and we are specifically monitoring fire danger, time periods in which case we are working with the county to conduct county wide conference calls with the fire department and the other emergency service districts throughout the county to look on the our capabilities. They are wild land fires occurring throughout the state right now so there are a lot of resources that we normally have here on hand that are going out to help fight some of those fires. So we want to make sure we keep tabs on what we have available in case something were to happen in our community. So that takes -- that really involves us being able to coordinate with a different fire departments in Austin and Travis

[2:14:09 PM]

county as well as our surrounding communities and we are constantly needing to look at what capabilities we need to have. We are going through a process now where we are reevaluating our existing plans and we will be working towards a workshop later this summer with the key departments to walk through the process of a response to a wild land fire. Specifically take the time here to, we will be meeting with you all tomorrow on the senior officials workshop and I am going to let the cat out of the bag a little bit, but the specific hazard we are going to be using in our discussions is going to be the fire threat, wild land fires scenario, so perfect timing .. From that standpoint we want to make sure we are engaging not only with the frontline personnel but with the policymakers as well, and then also with our community, so preparedness is very important and we are working to make sure

[2:15:09 PM]

we have those plans in place. >> Thank you. Chair, I just have a couple of follow-up questions. I appreciate all of that background and information. I would ask for some locations of where these cooling centers were and you mentioned there are places people can go in in but I didn't hear specific locations. I would guess that libraries are a good place for people to go to if they are experiencing extreme heat in their homes? >> That is correct. And places that are already open, like libraries, community centers, even some commercial stores, grocery stores, places where people can walk to that

are open during the day. They are cool, so you can walk in there, walk around, I would say malls, but I know a lot of our shopping centers are transitioning to other models, but there are other places where people can go to that are open during the daylight hours, which is the worst heat and we would -- so the first thing you will hear from us is encouraging the public to go to those open

[2:16:11 PM]

facilities, libraries and community centers being one of them as well. >> Great. Thank you. And then I really like how you talked about supporting the pillars of preparedness in the community and making a kit, being prepared, knowing your neighbors. I was wondering as part of the resiliency in the community I really know that the community emergency response team is a great asset for people who are in their community that maybe don't understand or know how to prepare to be prepared. Can you talk to us more about the program, how about classes you had this year and how many you plan to have in the future? I know our office in this summer will host one for our community and I want to make sure we are encouraging these types of trainings if we have the capacity to do so at homeland security and emergency management. >> The because of the pandemic a lot of the training has gone to an on-line model and you will find that on our website and encourage everybody to go in that direction. We are working on a pilot project with -- Austin on

[2:17:14 PM]

developing a neighborhood base program that encourages development of surf capabilities in that transition to try to establish certain teams at the neighborhood level. We don't need one city wide team. We need 100 smaller teams, each one of the neighborhood level where they can engage. And so that is in transition right now. The main person that was leading our effort moved on and so we are in the transition of hiring, bringing someone on board to guide that direction. But the direction we are moving is in that fashion, to support the resiliency hub efforts that are going and that is one of the elements we will be looking and trying to facilitate through the resiliency hub program. >> Thank you so much. I know some things you can't necessarily do online, as you can in person, like stopping bleeding, basic first aid but I appreciate your office is doing

[2:18:15 PM]

the effort to do that outreach and engagement made available. That's all I have, thank you. >> Councilmember Ellis. >> >> Ellis: Thank you for joining us, director, I would like to ask a question about water bottle distribution. I know there are a lot of families in town that probably think about when it is cold, when it is freezing, that is the last time they had a situation where they needed to know where water bottle distribution was going to happen. Now we are entering the hot summer months I know

there is not only a risk of wildfire but also flooding, and so it is especially in the district where we know we are probably going first off-line and last online like what happened last time what is the current plan for communicating water bottle distribution, depending on how different parts of town are affected? >>
>> So we are talking about bottled water, not just bottles to fill them with water,

[2:19:16 PM]

correct? To make sure I understand. >> Ellis: Yes, it would be like the bulk pallet distribution we normally do. I know there is a collaboration with Austin water, I believe they have some, you all may have some and so what is the plan to be able to quickly deploy the most emergency aid for people, whether it is the actual fresh bottles of water? I know in these emergencies you may need the bulk, you know, the cubed bottle water that happened last time but there are a lot of families that may need information on the drinkable water and the nonpotable water as well. As you know baby formula you can't use boiled water even if you have the capability to borrow it. What the newest plans on families know five, when, where and how to get drinkable water or nonpotable water, depending on the situation? >> So let me start answering this question and there are different efforts that are underway and certain things,

[2:20:17 PM]

certain things that are -- we as individuals need to do too prepare ourselves and our family. I will start in that regard from a preparedness standpoint. Part of going back to those pillars of preparedness, you know, making a plan and building a kit specifically, we recommend that individuals prepare in advance and get bottled water having bottled water available at their homes, one gallon per person per day, so I have a family of four right now, my oldest is off in the Navy, so four, that's four-gallons per person per daytimes the national standard, FEMA recommends is three days, based on what we experienced with winter storm Yuri we are saying much longer period, at least seven days. And then some areas of the country, maybe 14 days.

[2:21:17 PM]

But seven times four, you know, you are looking at 28-gallons a, and that is what we would recommend to ensure that a folks at their homes are able to build that level of preparedness in the events the water went out. We look at points of distribution for bottled water to be stood out when there is a disruption in the water community lifeline, right? If we lose power or lose water, it has a tremendous impact in our community, so those points of distribution, because we have done it three times in the last three, four years we have gained some experience on that and we are looking at prioritizing those points of distribution based on community need and also looking from an equity lens perspective, and I would say our equity office will be a key

[2:22:18 PM]

partner in helping us accomplish those areas, and we need to prioritize those efforts. We will look at how the private sector, HEB, Wal-Marts of the world, what they are doing to bring additional water in those areas, but Austin water utility as well as -- they are working right now on establishing a more specific plan of determining how much water we are going to have on hand in that initial push of distributing it out. But we don't have a specific locations identified because there is no need, but if there were a need, the process would involve us looking at those impact areas, looking at establishing those points of distribution, which one would go first and make sure we also have contracts in place to bring additional water in. In 2018, when we had to do it, we were able to get water down

[2:23:19 PM]

the street at Seguin, in Seguin water plant that was located there. But in -- winter storm Yuri we were buying water .. From the other 40, 47 states across the United States that were not impacted by the winter storm as well as some water from Mexico that we were bringing in. So those things are kind of more complicated than trying to determine how fast can that water be replaced? How that is going to be communicated we will be communicating that in maybe different ways, to including through our ready central Texas app that we have that we encourage everybody to download, both from the apple store and from the android store and that is one of the ways of how we would be communicating giving people information on where the maps are, where those points of distributions are going to be and what hours of operations and so forth. In addition to that through our joint effort between the city and the county we will establish

[2:24:19 PM]

a joint information system to distribute that information out and working on having that process be translated in multiple languages to include American sign language through a service that we have with a company out of San Antonio a called deaf limping and I would say, deaf link, and I would say we are only the third -- we are one of four communities in the whole state of Texas that is delivering information in American sign language in emergency situations where we have the ability to report it and transmit it correctly. So using those tools, using social media, using our communications teams, we will be getting that information out there. We are also looking to identify resources so that we are able to build a better relationship with the local, nongovernment organizations in our community, those community based organizations are going to be a key player in helping us identify where the needs are and making sure we are building a

[2:25:20 PM]

level of response to an integral service. Priority again is to ensure that critical infrastructure are -- is up and running and then get the water restored to the largest population that we can and making sure we are looking at response through an equity lens and establishing those points of distribution where the community has the greatest needs, but again, if everyone can go to the grocery store and start buying additional gallons of water, if you have that ability am you are able to have an adequate amount of bottled water in your home for an emergency, and you are helping not only yourself but the rest of the community because then we can focus our resources to those areas of greater need. >> Ellis: Thank you. And we have been trying to indicate that it begins with you because there is definitely that need for the first few days to try to help make sure families are resilient on their own, seeing it takes a little bit of

[2:26:21 PM]

time to deploy the assistance that a lot of people need. But I would just strongly urge now that we know how the water treatment plants and the levels of the infrastructure depending on pressurization affects different communities that that also be a factor. I know that as water came back online during winter storm Yuri there was a situation where people would move to other parts of town to get their water and bring it back and had to remind people that it is not going to fully fill back in in every single type situation until, until that pressurization happens, and so I just know in southwest Austin we saw very acutely how important it was for people who were off-line for a week to be able to have access to the same resources needed regardless of where in the community that it is. But I do look forward to participating in that training tomorrow morning. I think it is going to be very enlightening and I certainly appreciate that, depending on what disaster is taking place the response to it is going to have to be very nimble and

[2:27:23 PM]

respond to exactly what happens when it is taking place. >> Thank you, councilmember Ellis. >> Thank you for the update and it is good to see all of the activity happening in lots of places. I want to talk about one aspect of it. I guess my take away from being in the eoc for last eight years and watching as these events happen as we got to larger events, that the key thing that looked like it would be helpful but would be the hardest thing for us to do because it is so far out of our wheelhouse is how we work with the organizations that exist in the. The city I think very understandably looks at this challenge of emergency response under the lens of what do we need to do? So even when we make reps to the

[2:28:26 PM]

other organizations that are out there, the community organizations, the grass roots organizations, it is looking at it in terms of how can they help us identify where we need to get resources. But I think the real take away from eight years in that room is that when the scale of the challenge gets really big it is no longer a question of us learning where to get resources to. It is empowering and enabling those organizations to get resources where they need to get to. Because there is just so much happening in the -- and the city is being asked to respond to macro issues and where we see the most difficulty is when we have to start reaching down as a city and dealing with the microissues, because we are not close enough to it to really know and it feels like we are playing catch-up, and that's where the demands are coming from, the, from the councilmembers, from the organizations. So the concept of figuring out

[2:29:28 PM]

Lou it is we institutionalize that grass roots response, so that it goes into play as a force multiplier, not just to help us get information but to recognize that in an emergency like that, the city can't do it all, so we have to figure out how to make that happen is something I am still real's never, and I don't know if it is identifiable -- identifying and updating 250 people in the community that would serve as point people that -- of having one day a year, a half day tabletop can with 250 people, and every year or two years you update that list of 250 people, and it is people we know that are just embedded in the community and will be doing work and it is the people that know that if we are dealing with the

[2:30:31 PM]

scale of the issue they are going to be left on their own a lot, and from the city's perspective we are going to try to make our best to make resources available and this is the kind of how the reporting happens where they are going to know or not know but it is all happening outside of the city's macro response. And I don't know how we advance that. We have discussed that and talked about that but that's the hardest thing to do, because it is the one element that is conceptually foreign from how we ordinarily approach mass disasters like that. >> Can you speak to that effort? >> Mayor, you know, that's a really good description of when we start talking about a catastrophic event, it is not just the city and the county, but it is really a community effort, level of response, including our private sector,

[2:31:33 PM]

including our districts that exist in our community, other authorities that exist in our community. All of those working together to look at what is needed for the community in order to be able to respond. That is a very daunting task, a very daunting task. There is a saying in emergency management ..

We don't want to be exchanging business cards in the day of the disaster. In order to establish that collaboration we need to be engaging with everybody and encouraging everybody to engage on a nice clear summer day in order to build that relationship and know what we can count on from a community standpoint and from a private sector standpoint, from a governmental standpoint in order to know what to call upon in the middle of a disaster response.

[2:32:37 PM]

Our role is to guide those efforts, but if the community is working on a solution that makes sense, our job is to assist them in that level of response, building that trust is something that we need to be working on ahead of time, and engaging at all levels with that common set in mind. It is not up versus them, it is just us, it is just us. This is our community. I think that was very evident as a result of winter storm Yuri and how it is very important that we engage. I had time to build those relationships. And clear up any misunderstandings.

[2:33:39 PM]

But how to expedite that community level response as best act we can, and there is a need for a level of awareness within us, the city organization and also a level of awareness from a community, from the community itself. I think there were some things in that response in winter storm uri I wish I could go back and do a little bit different, but then there are some things in there I thought we, man, I am very proud of, being able to set up a conference call with all of the grocery stores, as many as we could to talk about how can we help you open up your stores a lot faster? Engaging them with some of those spontaneous organizations that popped up and, okay, I don't know you but let me work with you to figure out how to help you help the community. Those are great experiences that we need to figure out how to capture that and bring it back. I think that part of that is

[2:34:42 PM]

engaging at the community level on a periodic basis with workshops to walk through the process, similar to what we are doing right now, but in a grander scale, and having the community also lead and take part of that discussion, having them take ownership of some of that level of discussion and response. It is crucial for a more resilient, prepared safe community. >> Mayor Adler: To that end, because I agree with all of that, I don't know if it is possible over the coming months, certainly before the calendar year is over, to have that first meeting of the 250 people in the community, to have a conversation with them about what is it that is reasonable for the city to expect this grass roots network to be able to do and what resources would that grass roots network need in

[2:35:42 PM]

order to be able to meet that, that expectation. Just answer those two questions collectively I think would be helpful, because when we are in the eeoc we are trying to generate those two lists each at that night as it is .. Beginning to kind of progress through and it is coming together. But if there was a network of 250 people that city met with once a year, just to ask those questions, again, what is it reasonable for city and the system to expect and what resources would you need to be able to do it I think would -- I think would help a lot when we did winter storm uri and there was so much community and grass roots engagement. Some people looked at that as a failure on the city and on the county and on the systems. We needed to step in because the city wasn't able to do it, so we

[2:36:43 PM]

needed to step in and I think our perspective on that has changed over the eight years, where I say, of course you do, at that scale, you will always need to step in, and that's not a failure of the system, it is an important component of it. But if that is true, and it is an important component of it, then we need to do exactly the kind of things you are talking about and we had those conversations at a theoretical level, but I really would like to see what the action plan is for this element of our response. What are we going to be doing between now and the end of the year to set up that part of our response so it could be successful and what gatherings or meetings or brainstorming, whatever it is, how do we actualize that component? That is manager I would really like to see some time this calendar year as we move forward with the next generation of our

[2:37:44 PM]

response plan. Does that make sense to do? >> It does, mayor. And actually we have been engaging with the fire department on a discussion of an opportunity to engage with the public, specifically from a wild land fire hazard perspective .. I think it is very similar to what we are talking about, and I can see us doing this on specific hazards seasonally, right? A discussion on how are we engaging with the community from a fire threat perspective. And having that engagement again in the fall as we prepare for winter weather, and then following it up again as we prepare for flooding situations. Flooding situations. .. Looking at our most prominent, using our most high hazard conditions to engage with our community in that discussion so that we can build that

[2:38:46 PM]

commonality, that trust. >> Mayor Adler: And you could build around and event like that. I am not trying to prescribe that, but just to institutionalize, we knew we had elderly people that could be alone in their rooms. We spent several days trying to figure out how to reach them but there are organizations that probably already know them and know who they are and meals on wheels has eyes in so many different places and there are neighborhood groups and community groups that are dealing with communities all the time that don't speak English and it might be harder, but they are the trusted -- >> Agents. >> Agencies for them, and if they were a part of our emergency planning, if once a year they were all gathered and a said if something horrible, if a bomb fell or we lost power and water again, how do we -- how have we already set it up so that the call goes out and there are 250 people or 250

[2:39:47 PM]

organizations that know that now is their time to step forward, they know exactly what to do, they hoe what kind of resources is reasonable for them to expect to get, what kind of resources it is not reasonable for them to expect? How they are supposed to get information so that they know that ahead of time so they are not trying to figure out then how it is da -- they already though. They have a piece of paper that says when a call goes out, this is my responsibility, my organization. If we set that up and try to actualize that, again, that's hardest component of this, because there is no "That" yet but I think it would be one of the most valuable things and I loud love us to see us actually, I will actualize it this year. >> Okay. >> Mayor Adler: Thank you. >> Harper-madison: I would like to mayor tell alter is with us and councilmember tovo is with us virtually, councilmember

[2:40:48 PM]

tovo, your hand was raised? >> Tovo: Yes, I had a couple of questions. Thanks, chair. >> I was just aware and I was watching you guys, sorry, I didn't have the link for the meeting for a bit but I joined a bit of the conversation before I joined. I sure owes questions, mayor are very much in line with mine. And we had a pretty successful, and successful any prescribed for a while program called cert and I forget what that stands for but I think that may be a structure that works for what the mayor is subscribing because there were individuals that signed up, that volunteers, preidentified to be a part of our emergency response and, you know, they got some level of equipment and some level of training and then the city had, you know, coordinated way of reaching out to them. Mayor I am not sure if you are familiar with that, I know -- I don't think it has been -- I remember it from before I got on council can so it has been that long since I heard about it, but when I asked this question during our debriefing after the storm last year I think I was

[2:41:48 PM]

told, you know, that there is cert and went to the page and it is very clear it is not as active as it the once was, gloves and buckets and other kind of things and gone through the training in different neighborhoods throughout the city because cert partnered I think at that time with the Austin neighborhood council to get that work going but anyway. So I would ask, and maybe in a very direct way, mayor, it makes sense to get our city manager looking at cert as part, for, to serve the purposes that you are describing of really reaching out to community organizations to preidentify those individuals and I think that could provide a structure for this sort of response. I guess my other question really leads back, leads us back to grocery stores. I know several of us reached out to aid and got aid in touch with you all at various points. I am interested in seeing the action plan with regard to our

[2:42:49 PM]

partner organizations as well, like what are the especially with aid, which has the ability, as we learned, to get resources into the community pretty quickly. They have relationships with distributors that are different from the ones that the city utilizes, they were able to get us water through their resources pretty quickly once I hooked up one of the aid people to our city staff member. I would also like to see an action plan for those grocery stores. So I wonder if you could speak to that piece of it, director. Is there -- do you have now like a list of the grocery stores and some mechanized coordinated way of communicating with them and a staff member tasked with that piece of the response? I know several of us heard during the winter storm that Costco, that people were showing

[2:43:50 PM]

up at Sam's Club or Costco, I can't remember which, but staff members came out and said we are not able to open because the city, you know, told us to stay closed and, you know, and with the work of a couple of our council offices mine and I think somebody else's we were able to connect them up and get that resolved, but what is the plan moving forward? I know you spoke to making sure knows regs relationships exist. Is there some kind of master list -- I am sorry, comprehensive list of those kinds of stores that you can reach out to and in a coordinated way and a staff member tasked with communicating in a time of emergency? >> Director Ortiz before you answer, councilmember tovo, I don't know if you were on the line with us when he described it. Director Ortiz, if you could speak to you were talking about a pilot you all are working on with ga have a for community cert trainings, if you could go back, councilmember tovo -- >> I missed that so --

[2:44:52 PM]

>> I think it is worth repeating pause I actually have questions about the specific details so I think it is worth him repeatabling so you understand what plan is for them with this pilot including some of is

questions while answering her question about the cert pilot and if you could speak to -- I know you said you don't have somebody to direct the effort yet but if who uh could speak to what qualifications that person has hike what are you looking for in a person to lead that effort when we can expect for the pie throt roll out and how long we expect the pilot to last. >> So let me back up a little bit. The -- the city had a one cert team approach strategy. The challenge was that you had a large membership looking for direction but directions but those were individuals falling into a larger pool and the cert program really is designed as the name implied, community merge response team centered around a small geographical area

[2:45:53 PM]

so they can work together as a team and be able to respond to those situations around their neighborhood. They are not to replace fire, police or ems or any of the other first responders but the intent is for them to be there at the community level to help the community where they live in, be able to respond and be safe from any future emergency disaster. What we started doing several years ago is engage with -- Austin and take that cert program and that material and bring it down into a teachable model that can be -- disseminated or delivered at the neighborhood level. We have staff that is engaging with them at this point in time. My public information and marketing officer moved on and we are about to make a new selection for a new person.

[2:46:54 PM]

But that person will then allow us to engage that, not only with gava but with the other neighborhood associations and begin that work that is necessary to replicate that training mechanism and spread it around to other neighborhood levels. There is a need for a constant engagement with those neighborhood associations and what we are looking to do is, as part of our disaster response of the pandemic, we brought in a lot of retired firefighters and paramedics that have some of that level of training, as we move forward we hope that we have the funds to be able to use that disaster reservist team to engage with the neighborhood associations and provide specific cert training with the hopes of not having one city wide team but having 100 neighborhood based teams that can be centered around a

[2:47:57 PM]

neighborhood and an apartment complex, a homeowner association, depending on where the need is. We need to empower our residents to help take care of themselves, and it is a way of leveraging those efforts, and those are some of the things we saw happening automatically as part of the winter storm response, apartment complexes, you had residents there that said, hey, I have food, let me help coordinate and bring the different resources together, and they would, were taking care of themselves

as best as they could. We need to come in and help them with organizational structure, the give them some training, give them some tools and capabilities, so that they can be empowered to take care of themselves. The effort that we were working

[2:48:57 PM]

with Austin is being rolled out as we speak, and I think we are very close to taking that model and starting to replicate it in other organizations, in other places of the community. But really what it is taking that cert training and putting it at the neighborhood level. >> I believe councilmember tovo has other questions. Would you like to repeat your question for director Ortiz? >> Tovo: Yes, thank you for that and I am familiar with the gava work and just emphasize .. Something the mayor said which also I appreciate it should be local and neighborhood focused and I agree, but I think there is a need for more community organization focus to reach some of those populations that will need those trusted leaders who may or may not reside within their neighborhood. The other question was about, apologies, please just direct me to the tape if you have already covered this too. I heard you talk about wanting to develop those relationships

[2:49:57 PM]

with grocery stores. Is there some kind of comprehensive list that you have and a communication mechanism and a regular check-in with the large distributors or large grocery stores? And do you have a staff person tasked with that responsibility? >> We have identified the larger distributors, the Wal-Marts and andhebs that actually have an emergency management component within their organizations and so we have engaged with them and we engage with them whenever we have those emergency situations and conditions. So it was very helpful to bring them in during winter storm uri, it is not all comprehensive, you have a lot of smaller grocery stores, neighborhood grocery stores whereas it is more of a

[2:50:59 PM]

challenge to identify a representative for all of them. We are hoping that as we move forward we will be utilizing the different chambers of commerce to help us engage with them at that level. I don't have a specific person identified with that to do that right now, but we are hoping that as we move forward we will get additional resources to carry that mission out. Right now we are leveraging that responsibility with our planning group to engage with them periodically and try to build that rapport as we move forward and engage them in training or in exercises as best as we can. But there is a need or a broader engagement that is necessary to reach the level of collaboration that we hope to develop as we move forward.

[2:52:01 PM]

Natasha harper-madison naah is ..men. >> Is that sufficient, councilmember? Thank you. >> Mr. Ortiz, I wanted to just confirm for tomorrow, for tomorrow's session, my note was just councilmembers should be bringing staff to that? >> We limit it to councilmembers in order to make sure we have the level of policy levels down only from the elected officials but then representation to the other city departments that would be necessary in order to have that engagement as well. >> Okay. But should our staff be there to watch it? I know they are not participating. >> We can -- the problem is room. >> Okay. It sounds for some of that stuff they would be the one executing certain pieces of it so we will see how it goes tomorrow but it might be interesting as a

[2:53:02 PM]

follow-on to make sure some of our staff has an opportunity to also make sure they are understanding their roles in that process in the future iteration of that. >> If I can add, what we can do is schedule another session of that course at a later time that is designed more for the -- cure staff, your staff and other levels of management as well to attend so we can do that. >> That would be great. We will see how it goes tomorrow. That's a good idea. >> I wanted to ask, we have been having more conversations about evacuations in case of a wildfire. Can you explain to me what is the role of -- in coordinating and leading the evacuation portion of the wildfire event? >> So the role of hesom

[2:54:03 PM]

primarily is to ensure that we .. Coordinating with multiple departments when ever, whenever there is an incident that requires multiple departments to respond N a wild land fire where there are community wide evacuations, we will be activating the emergency operation center, bring in representation from the different city and community departments as well as the county and be coordinating those evacuation efforts and making sure that we are also getting any additional resources that are required to assist in those evacuations, whether they be bus Mrs. Capital metro or a school district, coordinating the -- any additional resources that may require them, whether it come through state, through Texas forestry service or dps orf we need air access to help put out the fire.

[2:55:04 PM]

.. At a high level, the evacuation decision once it is made from the command posts will be communicated to us and the eeoc as well as other key players in the community. We will be communicating that -- we will be utilizing our public information team to communicate that to the community and be giving guidance and protective actions for those that are impacted, what they can do to protect themselves and how to evacuate, as well as those that are not impacted, giving them recommendations or requests for them to stay out of the area. We will be establishing community refuge points and we will be sending representatives at those community refuge points to assess the number of residents that have evacuated to

[2:56:05 PM]

those points and then be communicating with those residents where a permanent, where a shelter is established to guide them out of the area and be able to begin to assess their needs and be able to coordinate with them. So is that coordination that takes place between the fire, police, sheriff's office, Travis county ems, Austin county ems, our code department, our water department, our Austin energy, all of those major departments that is a role to play in the response to the fire, but then also all of the other community based organizations like red cross, Austin disaster relief network, the school districts to look at the consequent impact of the management of the disaster and begin to address the community level response to make sure we have refuge locations for the people to go to and make sure that we have shelters beginning to open so that we can get them out of those locations

[2:57:07 PM]

to a safer the location and be able to communicate with them and determine whether they are going to be able to go back quickly or whether they are going to need to stay out for a much longer period of time. If it is a level of fire that will require community evacuations, up to that point, we are also going to be dealing with the disaster recovery aspects, bringing in the code and building officials to come in and assess the damage and determine what areas will need to be allowed back in and how do you do that? That may be a day or two or even several days down the line. In the meantime we have the responsibility of communicating with those folks that have to evacuate and be taking care of them the best we can. They don't have to stay in the shelter, they can go to their friend or family members or make their own arrangements but those that need a shelter we will be meeting those needs. >> Thank you.

[2:58:07 PM]

I appreciate that. There is a lot in there but one of the things that keeps me up at night is this perception that we have an evacuation plan and nobody knows what it says and nobody knows what to do, and --

where for hesom in changing that and leading the efforts with respect to various departments, when I start asking questions like, okay, well, you know, who knows how to reverse flow traffic on 2222 so you can get people out of the way of a wildfire, you know, sometimes it is not clear that those dots are being connected, and so I would love to continue this conversation outside of this forum perhaps but I really think that those are -- that is an important role and it requires a lot of advanced preparation and I know there are a lot of pieces you are doing for other

[2:59:09 PM]

disasters, but I think there are some very specific ones for this that I am concerned and would feel much better knowing you are on top of, so I would appreciate being able to have that conversation at a community level. >> If I could have one more comment. You mentioned contra flow. That is -- even in a hurricane scenario, having experienced being in a community where we had to evacuate for a hurricane and we can see the hurricane coming for multiple days, it was a very daunting task for the state to be able to do a contra flow. .. I think what is going to be key in our community to have a successful evacuation is to ensure that we are engaging with the public early, when the fire danger hazards are present and making sure people are -- refamiliarizing with the plans

[3:00:10 PM]

on what day -- how they are going to evacuate and what you are going to take with you. Because if there is an evacuation that is made, then that evacuation needs to be taken -- people need to take action very quickly, and if -- that is the Boston time to start thinking about what you are going to take, because you are >> You are making that have the same level of importance as your own life or your family members lives. Going back to pillars of preparedness I talked about. Making a plan. When we talk about making a plan based on where you live where your answers. Are if you live in a part of the city where wall in-tire say danger you need to understand what it is you need to do to prepare yourself in order to evacuate. And when that order is given and communicate that with your

[3:01:12 PM]

family and your neighbors your neighbors can be also part of the key to success. If they are clogging up the arteries for evacuation. Then we put a lot more people in danger. >> I totally agree with you on all that. And though I do not believe we are set with our evacuation preparedness so we're not doing this at the last minute and may be prepared you may be prepared I still think there is enormous amount of work to be done for battalion chiefs for our police officers to know what to do for atd to know where they're stepping in an event of the wildfires I happens to be the disaster I know more about. Not that the others aren't important. We will continue the conversation. We asked the

[3:02:13 PM]

after reports storm uri, we were not waiting for the next budget to get additional resources what is the status of that budget amendments I imagine you need more resources to plan at the level we're asking you to plan. >> The short answer kwre, we do need more resources we are working with the city manager's office the best way to come back to council with addressing some of those needs, but I would say I need to let the city manager's office answer that question better than I can. I know we're working specifically with them. Trying to address those deeds as best we can moving forward. >> Thank you. I understand you are Bein ING diplomatic whoever is stepping in for him. To reiterate, we have identified being prepared for disasters is

[3:03:14 PM]

important collectively as a council we stated we wanted to make sure we address these needs not waiting in the end the end I expressed to the city manager before I think it's important for us to reiterate this as a priority. If we want our unit toss be prepared, we have to be able to provide you the resources to do that. Thank you. >> Are there any other questions colleagues? I have several of my own in the interest of time it's 303, we still have several other presentations. Aopposed to I will ask a few questions and also make statements to prepare you for the kinds of questions my office will be sending and the things we're thinking. So, I think most of what I would like to ask has at least to some degree been addressed by my colleagues questions which is great. Especially the follow up on mayor pro tem alter's point about when we prepare,

[3:04:14 PM]

this is the third year in a row where it feels like we're preparing at the last minute. As opposed to you know, I think we should be preparing for summer and the fall as soon as summer ends. So, that is it. I have some concerns about when we prepare to mayor Adler's point about comprehensive, um...unilateral expectations council expects the city manager's expects community leaders example expect having something in the protocol would be helpful. In the course of the storm of uri that presented themselves but the community involvement especially with them trying to coordinate with tesm with the city, it was a true disaster just sort of watching all of those systems collide into one another. This is pretty granular it's something you and I both know we were dealing with for months

[3:05:14 PM]

after we addressed some of those concerned there were folks that jumped in with the promise to be paid not having been certified vendors with the city not being paid. There were multiple things that made it to these organizations they gave the time they gave the hours they used their resources but didn't get paid for months. I think that's something we need to address immediately. Even if the only thing we do is level set and make sure everybody is coming to the table with the same expectations about how the process will work. I think to some degree we were reacting so much. We set people up for failure I would rather not get months worth I'm about to give my carry pones and my time and money to the city hasn't paid me back yet. That is heart wrenching I have several other I can appreciate grocery stores are an option it doesn't sound like the city's option. I much

[3:06:15 PM]

like my colleagues I would like very much I think it was councilmember tovo who said comprehensive list of resources and opportunities for our community comprehensive and accessible I would like to see that to councilmember Ellis's point about water distribution, one of the things I immediately thought about was just how many plastic bottles of water we distributed during the course of responding to the emergency. I wonder I know it seems superficial I wonder if there's a way for us to address the need for water distribution and not produce a billion tons of plastic waste I would like for us to at least be taking that into consideration as we do our preparation and you know preemptively and not as a response to the emergency. Rolling blackouts I had some questions about that already from our constituents they

[3:07:15 PM]

would like to know what to expect when leads me to wonder thank you for joining us mayor, which leads me to wonder is there a place our constituents can go to for up to date information about when where why how, how is ERCOT performing? What should we expect for them? As part of that preparedness for them. In addition to the list of resources for locations you know, I think you mentioned multiple organizations are doing a fan drive. District one probably some of my colleagues are doing this for their other districts as well, we want to contribute to the fan drive at churches are hosting that is small potatoes I wonder if there is a comprehensive list that we can--our constituents were sharing with us our newsletters during the course especially the first couple of months of covid how they received their information collectively with ve an opportunity. To reach a large portion of the city directly

[3:08:17 PM]

communicating with our constituents the more district information, we can share with them the more we can disseminate that information it will help to comprehensively answer their questions. Um...I already said the thing about preparing. When folks are preparing for 4th of July they're not waiting until

January the fourth of jewel that night, we are starting preparation from the next one I would like us to get in front of it way faster. I would for there to be more emphasis on people I think are so resilient that they're resilient to their detriment sometimes. They think you know I have lived in Texas all my life I can touch it out before you know it they are dropping from heat exhaustion. More emphasis on symptoms they need to be watching for and what the implications are of waiting until it's too late to respond to your body tells you are, in

[3:09:19 PM]

fact, experiences heat exhaustion and need to seek medical attention. I know you listed the libraries, and community centers I think in large part those are city assets. You also talked specifically about grocery stores or retail operations. I would like very much for there to be more city assets on the list of resources that way we know there is no guarantees around private retailers and what it is. What their rules are about you taking shelter in their spaces and not purchasing things I know for a fact, there are multiple places that are cool in the summer you can't sit in there unless are you making a purchase I also don't want to set the retailers up for failure nor do I want to set our constituents up for failure I walked like to delineate these are a list of city resources this is city hall this is your building you paid for it. The chair and floors are yours I want them to know when you walk in the

[3:10:20 PM]

building this is yours. They can't do that in HEB or Costco or where ever else they go. I want us to clearly have them recognize the difference between privately held locations we don't have any say over who they let come in their doors. City resources contributed to the resources where we're sending people. You and I probably all of us talked to much in the course of the winter storm we're trying to find cots and blankets I hope there's a comprehensive list one of the things we ran into is warehouse locations. There's a need I think it was dessa and Cameron someone drove west when it turns out there's a distribution center right there at Rutherford. I wopbd to make

[3:11:25 PM]

sure F there's a logistical perspective, we are the most efficient as possible. Having each councilmember know where each of the distribution centers and the community distribution operations in their districts are so we don't step on one other's toes but ambiguous don't get in your way I can't imagine how many calls you got gummed up the system buzz we didn't know how to call and information on the front end. I recognize how hard you and your stef work this is not criticism so much as concern. I'm expressing collectively we should be concerned it does definitely feel like it was 92 degrees the other day. If we're having this conversation right now and already hot feels we're behind the eight ball and that scares me.

Especially a lot of district one, district four, district two constituents, they already struggle to pay the light bills when they start

[3:12:26 PM]

costing 4 or \$500 in the summer they will go without. Having them be prepared and having some sort of comprehensive relationship and resources with our utility. I don't know if we have a moratorium of sorts on disconnections. Are we putting people's utilities off when it's 114 degrees for four consecutive days? I would like to know and make sure we are having those conversation I asked about the GABA pilot I talked about engaging with local and grassroots organizations. Letting them know right now in August a vendor with the city of Austin a 6 or 8 week process they should probably do it now. I want to get ahead of the challenges we face. I think you spoke to already our joint coordination with the county. I

[3:13:27 PM]

did want to talk about our etj folks who aren't city of Austin residents per se. I want to make sure we have considerations for them. Especially people in food deserts and more far removed from resources I don't know what our plan is there. If we have sort of a regional plan with our partners in pflugerville Ville and round Rock and Buda county I want to know collective looks like for addressing need. A lot of this, even if you stood here and talked to us for three hours you couldn't answer all of these questions on the spot a lot of this information we really should have had. I hate we lost count. Mayor pro tem alter ewe should have more of a comprehensive presentation I also wonder if it would be prudent to have multiple committees meet. This is a public health concern. This is

[3:14:27 PM]

you know the auditing committee. This is public safety I wonder if we should be concerned having a joint committee meeting that way, we can have it be more substantive I and not risk not getting all the information from all the other important presentations we have today. This is so important. This could have been a whole public safety meeting on it's own frankly. There is only two more things I have again I'm posing, these are statements and not questions because we will follow up. I have two more pages of stuff. The red cross I would like to know what their role is bless you. And how we interact with them. So, it was brought to my attention that there is some sort of legal requirement about having an annual emergency management meeting if that is the case I want to make sure we're in compliance. And just get a better understanding of about whose requiring that, you know it's by law by way of whom is that a state of Texas?

[3:15:29 PM]

Is that a federal requirement? Again I want to make sure we're in compliance. I still have the question about what qualifications we're looking for in that coordinator for the GABA pilot. I wonder if we are recognizing that so frequently, people skills can transfer to another position for example, a lot of the folks that ended up being the most pen official to us in our time and need were wedding planners and event planners. Really having a masterful understanding of logistics came in so handy. So, I just want to make certain we are utilizing all the time pilot and treasure we have in our community already knowing specifically what we're looking for in terms of skill set I think would be helpful as well. Then lastly. It was on here.

[3:16:34 PM]

Just a moment. Bear with me. The city's capacity to shelter our population in the event of extreme heat or lecture grid failure I would like to know what percentage of our population we could shelter. One of the things I have been able to convey to folks I think really seeps in when it doesn't concern you you are not concerned winter storm uri didn't spare everybody all over the city regardless of socioeconomic status were cold. I want to know what percentage of our population will be able to assist. I know people with means generally speaking aren't suffering when the house is hot. You are talking about cooling centers, during the day I can tell you for a fact there are folks sitting in their house with box fans being 92 degrees at midnight. It's still hot at night in Austin Texas so I want to make sure we are take

[3:17:36 PM]

into consideration even when the sun is not blazing hot outside it's still hot especially people who have medical conditions I have lupus it's difficult for people with autoimmune disorders to regulate body temperatures I can't get too hot I can't get too cold it doesn't mean I'm uncomfortable. It means I need to go to the hospital because I can't cool my core. Recognizing tpaoebgs in the community that have less access to preventive care and resources that are really going to struggle this summer. Our ems and other first responders, I would like to know how do we preempt their service provision? And how they function in the instance of a loss of power massive sort of catastrophic loss of power. I want to know what the plan is, and I think

[3:18:40 PM]

mayor pro tem alter says it keeps her up at night. I think about. It's so multitiered I think of all of the layers and levels and potential for harm. At the risk of making it seem the city is unprepared I don't feel confident telling our constituents, we have it figured out. That is not appropriate. I feel more confident talking to district one and residents of the city of Austin speaking to them substantively how we will respond in the case of an emergency. And then I believe--lastly, the emergency plan and how we were able to release information. I remember there was a big struggle for when we would release mass text when we do row bow calls when

[3:19:43 PM]

aid would be deployed as a resource I want to make sure we have a process in place and certain triggers that will notify us when we need to do a mass text. When we need communication essentially. I want to make certain we have clear, comprehensive strategy around how we communicate during the course of emergencies and preempting emergencies if we know we're going to have 31 days consecutively of triple digits, we need to be telling people how to prepare what to do. Whatnot to do frankly, I think more people than we believe don't access information the way that we distribute it. So, I would like to make sure folks are getting the communications they need. None of those were questions necessarily that I'm asking you to answer today. Those are questions I have and statements I'm making that are concern to me I leave it at that and follow up with your office >> Yeah. Some of those

[3:20:45 PM]

questions, my department can answer. Some of the other questions, we will be working with those departments specifically would have a lead in those specific areas you asked specific questions that related to Austin energy, Austin water and Austin public health and fire department, we will work with them to answer all those questions that everybody had and make sure we are transparent and give the community the answers to the questions that were presented as well as demonstrate what we're doing and what the gaps are and what else needs to be done as we move forward. There is lots of different opportunities out there and one of the things I was going to mention is that there is a need for us to look at our critical infrastructure and pursue funding that may be available. We are working with departments to pursue housing mitigation grant funding associated to the

[3:21:46 PM]

pandemic that will facilitate if gets elected to be able to provide funding to address back up power generation and critical infrastructure whether it be a community center or another area or other ways we can improve mitigating the disaster. Impact in the community, there say deadline coming union June, we will be working to have an application committed in a lot of those areas, and I can tell you I'm

working with different members of community to look at what options we can pursue one of them being tornado safe rooms especially after the tornados, we experience in the region. That is an area if we gets elected, we can provide funding to reimburse up to 50% or anybody interested in building a safe room in their home and may be other opportunities out there where we can be able to provide

[3:22:46 PM]

funding for the acquisition of a generator to ensure that community center is going to have power whether it's winter storm or a rolling--rotating power outage due to heat. We have facilities now we need to look at the critical infrastructure to make sure they are up and run whg I need them. >> Harper-madison: That inspired two questions I had. Summer camps and athletics I wonder what our relationship is with private proprietors that have outdoor activities, and city summer camps that have outdoor activities, make sure they have appropriate protocol about breaks and time out of the sun it's with aid I would like srrb E very much for us to have clear and open

[3:23:48 PM]

communication about how our athletes are being prepared for the summer heat and what plans they have in place to mitigate heat exhaustion and doing two I days when it's hot in the summer. Lastly that brings about for me a question about--you know what? It's another thing I will add to the list of stuff. I would like to close my questions by saying, when do you think my colleagues and I should expect to have that information? If you could give us a soft date we can follow up with you, that would be helpful so we don't, you know, fall behind in terms of delivery. >> I would say at least 30 days. We got to go back and capture all the questions and make sure we send them out to appropriate departments and be able to collect the responses and provide them to you 30 days would be appropriate. May not be fully complete answer, we

[3:24:49 PM]

will definitely get you an answer there may be a definite question from the responses that will require additional work at least now you will have a point of contact for that work in take the lead in following up those questions. >> Harper-madison: What I'm thinking we will take this item up again for the pup safety meeting even a special call for June. I would like to push for my colleagues to have joint meetings with other committee meetings that would be appropriate. Councilmember you have a question? >> Yes in addition to having the questions and answer back where she a formal presentation on this topic we are kind of all over the place and need to understand it better I would be more than happy to cosponsor the information so our colleagues have information they need to make more informed decisions on council thank you. >> Thank you I appreciate it. Mayor pro tem? >> Alter: We had been

[3:25:51 PM]

scheduled to have an after action report in audit and finance at the request of Ariana out of town this week, we moved it to June's meeting I think June 15th. I don't know if that is sufficiently long enough if everyone's going to come with questions that would be an opportunity to continue the discussion if my memory is moving me well. >> Harper-madison: I agree. I wonder loosely if that joint meeting might be something you will be interested in and talk to councilmember tovo also for public committee. It's applicable for all committees so I wonder if we can dedicate a comprehensive amount of time to really get a full report. >> Alter: Surement I don't think, we would object to a date and time for a special called meeting rather than do three committee meetings together it might be make more sense to do a special call I

[3:26:51 PM]

will leave that to you guys to figure out. >> Harper-madison: Thank you. I appreciate it. Thank you vice chair Kelly letting us know it's blazy hot in here and gave them a time to turn the air-conditioning down, we owe her gratitude it is not steaming for the meeting. >> Alter: I'm going to watch the next part upstairs. >> Harper-madison: Did I see a hand councilmember tovo? >> Councilmember tovo: You covered it mayor pro tem did, we task the audit and finance to be the body to follow up on the winter storm audit and the winter store which this relates to I agree we probably do need more time, by the time you get audit and finance public health and public saeflty council it hey make sense to do a special call. >> Harper-madison: Got it. Thank you. Any other comments

[3:27:53 PM]

colleagues? All right. Thank you we appreciate your time. >> Thank you. >> Harper-madison: So item number two was discussion of city preparations. So, with our briefings--I'm sorry? >> We have public kphupb indications speaker if you would like to take that person they have three minutes it is just one person Scott Johnson. >> Harper-madison: Thank you. Mr. Johnson you have three minutes. >> Mr. Johnson you can begin. >> Harper-madison: Would you like to keep moving fen if. There he is. >> Can you hear me now?

[3:28:54 PM]

>> Harper-madison: Yes sir. >> Johnson: There is lag between online and atxn my name is Scott Johnson here to talk about item five. The issue of--yes. I'm speaking now. I'm speaking now. Can you hear me? >> Harper-madison: Yes, we can hear you speaker. >> Yes regarding item five about classes related to city of Austin and police. I don't know I don't have the report in front of me and the information but one area of concern I have had as many employees using... I will continue speaking. There is a lag. Sorry about that. One issue that is predominant within the issue of (speak in

[3:29:55 PM]

the background). >> Mr. Johnson. We are hearing a portion of what it is you are parenthesis today I will encourage you to go ahead. I also encourage you to send your remarks to the members of the committee so we can address all of your concerns, we are only hearing every other word. >> Yeah. Yeah, there is quite a lag between online and this. Distracted driving is something I worked on professionally with the city with a citywide effort and was the lead on that. Whether or not some of these crashes relates (sounds in background). >> Johnson. This is city hall a V. You can hear me? >> Yes. Yes. There's a tremendous lag. >> Are you on your cell phone?

[3:30:58 PM]

>> No. I'm on a land line. >> You are on a land line try calling again and see if you can get a better connection. >> Harper-madison: I think we should encourage hemi to mute his television I can hear it in on in the background. >> Is your television on in the background? >> It was. Yes. >> Your television is on? >> It was. I muted it. >> Okay. We're not getting a strong connection from you so we can't entirely everything you have to say to us. >> Okay. Can you hear me now? I'm speaking softly because I'm sick. >> Okay. Do you have the phone to your ear? >> Yes. It's very close I'm cupping it. Yes. >> Okay let's try again.

[3:32:00 PM]

>> Okay. Scott Johnson here regarding item five on your agenda while I don't have the report in front of me, there's a large minority of crashes that happen in the community related to distracted driving. Something that I talked to some in the city manager's office over time including former city manager. Mark oclus through codify through administrative bulletin that city of Austin imemployeys are not allowed to use their mobile phone or touching it. While in motion. That started in August 2014 and started in January of 2015. I was involved with that. This can be helpful there are things that happen that city employees may know or should do. Or idling whatever is against city rules and regulations is not being followed 100% I encourage

[3:33:00 PM]

the city council to have conversations about whatever laws and rules are in effect this is an ordinance. That the city passed that might help this situation distracted driving is a major issue nationally and internationally this could be a way through administrative bulletin that is part of the resolution of the city council passed to make sure every city employee knows when they're hired and is trained and is reminded that they can't touch their phone in any way while the vehicle is in motion. Thank you. >> Harper-madison: Thank you Mr. Johnson. >> You are welcome. >> Harper-madison: I'm hearing from councilmember alter she needs to be moved to the panel she's stuck in one of those limbo rooms. Thank you. Okay. At this time, we will move forward with our next presentation. We're going to bring the crowd folks online I believe they're joining us

[3:34:02 PM]

visually to offer us an opportunity to hear the final update regarding the independent report on the Austin police department training academy. Good afternoon. Thank you for joining us. >> Yes. [Audio cutting out] It's a pleasure to be here than you for inviting us to speak with the public safety committee today. With me today is Rick brown I think you can see him on the screen and Dan linski I know we had an opportunity to speak with all of you before it's a pleasure to be in front of you again. >> Harper-madison: I want to offer you just real quick, we have running behind today I don't want to take away any of the substance I would like have much I know you are all dynamic eloquent speakers I would like for the presentation to be succinct and give the key

[3:35:03 PM]

information from the presentation while we have you. >> Absolutely. I have about a 15 minute overview of our report from February of this year which I can go through if you want us to open it up for questions, we can do that, too. Whatever your preference is. >> Harper-madison: I will which she can in with my colleagues for what it's worth we have the presentations colleagues is anybody opposed to us jumping into our question and utilizing the 15 minutes, to interact directly then we can follow up further for the any other questions about the presentation? I will just sort of show of hands moving with questions vice chair Kelly? Councilmember tovo and mayor pro tem alter? >> Alter: I would very much like them to go over the implementation slides with respect to the pieces that are not done yet for the part that

[3:36:03 PM]

is recommended at the end of their report had not yet been implemented. >> Harper-madison: Okay. That sounds like we will go over the imply mention. And if you have any question mores the floor is yours. >> Thank you. I'm going to just share my slides for a minute then I will jump to the then I will jump to the part mayor pro tem alter asked for. We have the assessment of the academy, we did in April of 2021 a number of short term and long term recommendations and for purposes of being an

[3:37:04 PM]

independent evaluator with council's blessing, we were appointed on may 7th. Our job really was to independent leverify APD's implementation of the full recommendations and to assess how effectively the academy considers racial and gender equity emphasize, deescalation and community perspectives and trains officers through adult learning instruction. These slides you have are kind of highlights of the major findings and observations from our report, but as we get to slide 24 where I'm at now, this is implementation of the short term recommendations so the vast majority of the short really almost all of the short term recommendations were completed. And the, um...the

[3:38:07 PM]

only exceptions really were increased use of subject matter or content experts. There were a number of forces in the 144th. Cadet class they did use external subject matter experts to teach or coteach the classes for example, the force of police and race in America taught by Dr. Kevin foster at the university of Texas. He was assisted by Felicia Williams a former police officer there were other courses lgbtq and transgender taught by not external experts but essentially officers with specialized expertise in those areas and a number of other courses included help from victim services and some other areas as well. However, we have

[3:39:09 PM]

always felt there's a need to have more content experts and so that was something that the APD leadership and the academy staff agreed to do. There has been some reluctance on the part of staff to buy into that concept the division manager and commander are working currently to add to the content experts in the 145th cadet class. The other short term recommendation that is still a work in progress in developing expanding mentorship programs it had not been robustly expanded in the last cadet class. They didn't have a good mentorship for women cadets. They had a mentorship program to some extent for the Texas peace officer for officers of

[3:40:10 PM]

color it's questionable how meaningful that was and expand it to essentially all cadets are something they need to work towards. That is the other area. All of the other short term recommendations in our report, this is all outlined in section three of our report have been completed. As far as the long term recommendations, the majority of these have been completed however there is still a number of them that are a work in progress. Academy staff or leadership staff has committed to completing implementing long term recommendations at some time during the 145 cadet class. Or fiscal year 22, 1 area of progress is the diversity of academy staff they were

[3:41:11 PM]

supposed to develop a long term plan for diversity in staff at least at the supervisory ranks supervision has become less diverse there has been a lot of turnover since the 134 while I have good people in those positions they have lost diversity in the supervisory ranks in the academy. With procedural justice and adopting peer intervention training program, they I know they are working on that. And are supposed to be doing that for the 145th and have committed to doing so you know, but I couldn't tell you where they are at this present time. As of February, they had not yet completed those. Additionally, researching way on cognitive decision making and emotional

[3:42:13 PM]

intelligence skills as well as complying field of recommendations in the office you are training program had in the been completed at the time of our report in February. Those are also marked as in progress. We also had a number of recommendations in our interim report in October. We have all but two completed the one that is completed with qualifications is adjusting the timing and schedule of community connect which is the two week community orientation program at the start of the 144th cadet class. It was very well done program. It was the first time they had ever done something like that. They've included it in the scheduling of the 145th. The only thing they have done however partly, our recommendation based on

[3:43:14 PM]

cadet and staff feedback is to adjust the timing of that. To work it later into the academy schedule the feeling was that it would be more effective to have community programs after the cadets had oriented into the expectations of being a cadet and had a little bit more insight into being what a police officer is all about so their participation in those programs would be more meaningful and I think so that's been

done as far as adjusting the timing the only caveat, we would note is they have reduced the amount of community connect in 145. What say two week program is essentially a five day program however they also have the two of brown water analysis racial equity training in addition to the five days and they have added some cadet ride out programs. The other two

[3:44:15 PM]

recommendations in the interim report that haven't been fully addressed is the staffing needs of the learned skills unit and the improvements to academy facilities. We understand those are at least improvement to facilities is more of a long term prospect and that is going to require city approval and involvement as well and budget considerations. Finally, we have further adjustments we recommended in our final report including. Developing and expanding the internal video library, adding cadet survey questions at the end of the academy class on deescalation principles to make sure those principles have been reinforced properly and emphasized to a

[3:45:15 PM]

great extent. We also suggested additional criteria should be added to field training officer selection which include commitment to community policing and building community relationships then we also have recommendations on the physical training program and time management the only other thing I would add, we did submit hopefully you all received a copy of the audit protocol guidelines we helped develop subsequent to the final report, we worked with the division manager on that. And that's an important component I think to address the long term sustainability of the reform measures and the implemented recommendations. Patrol no one else from the outside is there as an evaluator of the

[3:46:16 PM]

assessment of 145. APD have a system in place they are come mying and continue to effectively implement these reimburses so we work with the division manager to develop those protocols I know she has agreed and working on complying with them, but it will be important I think for council or for this committee and the city manager's office to hold the department countable for implements the guide lines and reporting back to you all to make sure they have complied with them. So, that is a quick run through. I don't--probably better to open it up for questions at this point, we are happy to take any questions you have. >> Harper-madison: Is your hand raised? Vice chair Kelly then mayor pro tem alter. >> Kelly:. Thank you I know you mentioned slide number three and buying and lacking in staff

[3:47:17 PM]

can you explain what that means and provide examples? >> Sure. So, what we had noted was, um...there, you know, they implemented the forms and recommendations we had made were implemented in good faith with a few exceptions we just went over. All of it is done in good faith not all of them completed certainly APD leadership was committed to and agreed to all of the recommendations and were working in good faith to comply with them. However we noted in our report, a military style cult essentially predominates in the academy and a lack of buy in to some of the academy staff changes for example, midway through the academy

[3:48:18 PM]

there is a cadet survey it indicated comments by the staff mocking the aspects of the academy there is the notion or kind of statements that community engagement were not quote unquote actual police training or detracted from police training. There were many cadets I think came across and I can only believe it came some extent from staff comments, came across with the belief that all of the added community engagement programming and the further emphasis on diversity equity or inclusion were actual police training or detracted from police training when, in fact, they had more training than any prior cadet class overall in the sense of all of the prior tactical and conventional

[3:49:21 PM]

training this cadet class received on top of that enhanced community engagement and other important programming. The lack of buy-in is not so much that there is any strong resistance to it, just some things we had heard and feedback we got both from staff and from cadets that there is still some work to be done I think for some of the rank and file staff members to really you know buy into change. Change is difficult. I'm sure Mr. Linski and Mr. Brown can talk about that in the context of police, policing I will leave it at that. >> Alter: I hear what you are saying, and we identified the problem I wonder in your expert opinions the ultra consultants, we hired to oversee the independent review if you have suggestions how we turn this

[3:50:22 PM]

into something more positive and help our staff over there buy more into the process. >> I think as mark mentioned that is a process that takes time police officers hate two things they hate any change, of course, they hate the way things are. However once they get into it, that is kind of the culture has changed and there is division in direction they realize it's not as bad as they thought they get with the program. I think we saw that here. Some of the staff were more resistant to the thought of a civilian

director asking information and giving requests for things to be done and you know, respect and I think some have self-selected and gone to new assignments with APD and some transferred by supervisor personnel as well. I think the

[3:51:22 PM]

main point is you know, we flag that. And the supervision of the academy and the department are focused on making sure they maintain the changes and support those who want to be creative and help reimagining the policing experience out there. And do what needs to be done with those who don't wish to get on the program. >> Okay. Thank you I have one more question chair I have a lot of questions I'm just going to parse it down to these in the interest of time. On slides 20 and 21 in the presentation the separation academy was addressed one of the reasons for separation is covid-19 was mentioned, we lost five cadets for covid who went through a rigorous process to be accepted into this program I'm wondering if you know what APD has done to adapt the pandemic to allow cadets to continue after exposure and quarantine from

[3:52:24 PM]

covid-19? >> I think the academy staff actually did a good job later in the academy with dealing with covid-19. For example, 18 cadets tested positive in late December and early January for covid as did a number of staff members and instructors. So, the five cadets I think had to ultimately be separated because of lost time to covid 19 quarantine protocols that all happened in the first half of the academy I think everybody is trying to figure out how do we deal with this? And by the end of the academy one had better protocols in place they made sure everyone is masking properly with k95 masks at least in the classroom they had adopted procedures and protocols to give flexibility. I know they had to shift some

[3:53:25 PM]

of the defensive tactics training at the end they delayed it by three weeks so you know those that had covid wouldn't miss that and would be able to take those tests because you know they couldn't, they wouldn't have been able to graduate I think they did address it. I suspect into into the 145th that they are prepared to deal with in a more flexible way with cadets who if any do get covid in this new cadet class, they will be able to deal with it more effectively. >> Thank you so much for explaining that I would also say you provided a final report in report link to the council and when the cadets visited here at city hall in your report you did misspell my name I did want today flag that for you all. Thank you for mentioning it it was an interesting discussion I had with them letting them know what we do here at city hall as

[3:54:25 PM]

commissioner Schaub and the work we do helps support the work they do. With that, I will let someone else ask questions. Thank you. >> Mayor pro tem. >> Alter: Thank up you. Can you hear me? Okay I appreciate the work you have done gentlemen and the team throughout this process, we have set in motion. I think the very precise nature of the recommendations, the logic and the sense behind them and the clear articulation has been very helpful as we try to make some real transformative changes and I believe that we now have leadership in place that is leaning into it. And the roadmap and the guidance has been really important. It is still a work in progress. I only saw the audit protocol guidelines before this meeting I have only looked at them a little bit. You and I had an

[3:55:27 PM]

opportunity several of you and I had an opportunity to meet at length about the more detailed report. I got one of my questions answered there, one of the things we kept coming back to was, how are we going to keep holding the training academy accountable? How are we going to make sure as council we have the information we need. This protocol you touch on each of the points you ask very specific questions I think it's about as good of a set up as we can have going into this next phase where you won't be there to look at it specifically. We may have to iterate after that. You know, as we foe what comes back. I did want to understand better the reporting process for the part that is going to come to the public safety committee or the commission or to council what format that is in. Is that a combination of an

[3:56:28 PM]

oral and written report or just an oral report or is that sort of let's do the audit and figure out as we get there to see what makes sense if you could speak to that, please. >> I think we were probably--this may have been in our interaction with the division manager--didn't specify precisely what reporting that should take place in. I think that is really between council and the public safety committee and academy leadership. I think it could be whatever format and level of reporting you would prefer I think would be something you could request. I think we want today make sure the protocols had a reporting component in it so that you know there was the accountability process they would be reporting to council and public safety committee at the end of each academy class and they had to do so within 30 days but what format that

[3:57:29 PM]

reporting takes I think is really up to you and the committee and APD. >> Alter: To clarify it's public safety committee this is the public safety committee. The commission is folks we have appointed to serve. [Multiple speakers] You said it here at the public safety commission which is the right place to have another and to council which may or may not come through this committee. That is just being specific on that. You know for me, I err on the side of especially for the next class and the completion of the 145th. To be particularly more thorough, we just related to my colleagues, we have come a long way there is still more work to be done and part of how we keep the momentum we have is us

[3:58:29 PM]

keeping our eye on the ball and us focusing in and making sure we're following these kinds of details, and that when it does come barks hopefully it will come back to the whole council but if it doesn't, then the public safety committee I think we need to make sure that we are really inviting our colleagues to come and that we are really diving into those details at that point, because we have invested a lot, we have had a lot of people who have really leaned in and I think it is important that as a council we take these next steps to make sure that we can continue the momentum. Thank you very much. >> >> Harper-madison: Thank you, councilmember Ellis. >> Ellis: Thank you, chair. Where does the question lie with expansion, potential expansion of the facilities, I know there has been some discussion not just the police department but other public safety trainees

[3:59:30 PM]

needing access to improved facilities or potentially more buildings or portables to be able to have their lessons completed. Can you tell me where that conversation is right now? >> It is our understanding there is a proposal that the police department has for new facilities and enhanced facilities, fire and ems and that might be sitting at the city manager's office with the capital improvements project program, where that might be. That was our last understanding of that. >> Councilmember Ellis, if I could cut in real quick, we did get the results back from the resolution that I sponsored in February related to the public safety vacancy staffing plan, and it does address in that 45 page report some of the needs that city staff has identified for additional training, so it is a pretty lengthy report and took some time to get through over the weekend but it does address that. >> Thank you. And I appreciate the opportunity to do sponsor that with you, so I am glad you are taking the

[4:00:30 PM]

lead on that and I look forward to furthering that conversation about is that coming as a cip recommendation? Does it need any council approval? Just so we can help make sure if that is truly the issue with helping to make sure our folks can have have the lessons and training they need that we appropriately take action on that. >> Harper-madison: Any other questions, colleagues? So one of the questions I have, you know, it is going to be pretty broad. I would like to know, aside from the information that has been produced in the report I think ultimately you are responding to information we have requested. Is there any information that is not included in the report that you think we should be tabling into consideration as we move forward? >> . I don't know specifically. I think we try to be as comprehensive, we tried to be as comprehensive as we could, frankly in all of our reports

[4:01:32 PM]

but I would say that, and this was a follow-on of our assessment report back in April. >> Right. >> And the specific recommendations that were in there, and what our scope of work was as independent evaluators, so it is based on, you know, our 300 plus hours of classroom and instructional observations in person and virtually in some of, in the case of some of the classroom instruction as well as, you know, talking with community participants, city people, staff, cadets, reviewing weekly staff reports and other documentation, lesson plans, so it is based on all of that information and our kind of independent assessment and evaluation of how the academy proceeded over that eight month time. So we tried to be -- I am sure if there are some things we didn't address, I would apologize for that but I think we tried to be as comprehensive

[4:02:34 PM]

as could be and certainly hit all of this the areas that we had discussed in our original assessment. >> If I can climb in on that, one of the things that, with all of these reports we did keep in mind with our phase B report we added some additional recommendations involving training, and some of that directly relates to some of the encounter Wes saw in the use of force, you know, to stop and frisk, reasonable suspicion, the constitutional provisions and so this ties right into cofacilitating and instructing the cadets but also instructing the supervisor, because I have actually seen documentation where a supervisor has misapplied what the constitutional requirements are and it went straight up the chain of command and wasn't addressed so there is a training -- there are some training components in our phase B report that link back too the academy, not only to the cadet instruction but also in field training instruction and in

[4:03:34 PM]

service instruction that will be helpful to reduce some of those. >> Thank you I appreciate that and it sort of touches of one of the things we want to hear. In terms of the gaps, I think we think of it as an

ancillary consideration, I think several of my complyings and I brought up during the course of the conversation with, was leadership training, and I am not seeing the substance that I was looking for around a real comprehensive approach to developing leaders who ultimately become those mentors. You know, I, appreciate the effort by way of tpoa and the efforts around mentorship for women who are approaching employment in the service, but I guess I am just not seeing as much as I would like to see around developing strong capable competent leaders who subsequently, you know, pass those skills along and really do capacity building which I think

[4:04:35 PM]

we are going to need to address folks not liking it like it is and not liking change, I think that is going to -- in order to address that part of the culture, I do believe it is something that we are going to train away and I am not seeing that real strong leadership component. >> That was a statement but I am happy to receive any response that you may have as a result of the statement. >> >> Just initially, my response from looking at one dreads of force cases and investigating the issues we were looking at in phase B, I see a void, and I hear you loud and clear, I see an opportunity to develop mid level leaders, your sargents, your commanders, your lieutenants because I feel as though in some of the areas they are the closest to the officers

[4:05:35 PM]

in the field. They are the ones that have to take the steps and do what they need to do to correct behavior. If they are missing it there, a lot of types when it gets up to the executive level, you know, the lieutenant level relies a lot on the mid level commanders to handle these things so certainly if mid level leadership is addressed, the accountability processes, the training gaps we have identified, that is going to also build competent leaders, the Sargent and lieutenant commander with the abilities to move up the ranks and have that knowledge they need when it comes to enforcing policy and holding them accountable. >> You articulated that more eloquently than I did in which case I would like for you to expand on it and tell us what recommendation you have for us to to develop appropriate expectations and protocol around developing those mid level leaders, because without being, you know, a part of this particular excuse me, a part of this particular field I think that is applicable to multiple

[4:06:37 PM]

fields. >> Yes. I think the first -- the biggest gap that concerned me was the amount of cases we looked at, the omission of, to address constitutional issues when it came to an actual seizure, a frisk is a seizure that leads to a patdown search which is a search even though it is for weapons and not evidence it could lead to that depending on what is found in the patdown. That's a -- that's an educational gap and I think

once supervisors sergeant and lieutenants are looking at these type of cases that those gaps are done away with and their training void has been fulfilled then they become more of an active supervisor in monitoring them. Because that's what they are supposed to be doing in correcting the behavior to ensure that citizens are getting the services that are expected of them, constitutional policing fair and impartial policing those sort of things, I think

[4:07:37 PM]

once supervisors have the tools to be able to be competent supervisors to add to their toolbox, they will become more effective as they move up the chain. Because then if you have a Sargent that doesn't know how to assess an encounter when it comes to a detention and search, that person becomes a lieutenant they still don't got, if it is corrected early on and those folks learn how to hold their officers accountable, for these types of things, and that's to expand all of this is linked to other things, operational things in the field, that will help develop the competency and also the confidence of those officers to be a supervisor. >> >> Thank you, I appreciate that, I think some of the other questions I have I could probably send over, because there is something specific I am trying to ask and I haven't figured out exactly how to articulate it, I think you are getting close to what I am trying to ask you, I think I am

[4:08:38 PM]

asking for a solution that doesn't necessarily exist yet which may be what I am asking you is, how do we, do we as a city that, you know, prides itself on being innovative and forward thinking, you know, the amount of calls we are getting from other cities, you know, really wanting to emulate what we have been able to produce thus far, you know, it tells me that we have the capacity to go even further but I am still not quite sure how we get that piece, so to the point you made earlier about, you know, some of the -- some of the hesitance to accept this path moving forward, the change, right, I think that carries over into that void of leadership, that mid level leadership because the truth of the matter is, that's space where I think you guys call it setting the tone in the report. I think that's where you are setting the tone and really

[4:09:38 PM]

indicating that -- I think what I am trying to say is, I think that the hesitation to accept the change inherently puts us in a position to where the city and the department aren't allies from the start and I think that's something that needs to be addressed, accepted and presented to cadets coming in and recognizing that a part of the culture that needs to, you know, sort of just go away, like smoking on airplanes is that inherent othering we do between policymakers and the folks, you know, the rank and file, and that leadership void for me I think a part of that is that part where we really, you know, my

brother when they played basketball, you know the coach hollers out, same team, I think if we can do that for the ca et >> Casar: Debts and say same team, guys we are all moving toward the same goal, there is not, you know, some bogeyman at

[4:10:39 PM]

city hall that is trying to stop your ability from doing the job well, there are people at city hall who have to create policies and respond when the citizens, the residents of the city of Austin ask us questions about how the service is being provided, and I would like very much for us to have more clear, open, authentic conversation and relationships between the entities and it won't happen without that missing part. But I will stop there. Again, I will figure out a better way to really ask the question I am trying to ask. >> Let me just throw this out as a last thought. There is training available for mid level supervisors out there and, you know, sometimes police officers only know what they know from what is inside their own agency but once you get exposed I think about my career path, I went to the FBI national academy as a captain, you can go there, some departments send

[4:11:40 PM]

their sargents and lieutenants there and they get to interact with other leaders across the country and learn good, you know, they get to learn there other ways to do things and broaden their horizons that way so there is and hopefully academy will look at that, but there are some training opportunities out there for mid level supervisors. >> Thank you. Councilmember Kelly, did I see your hand? >> >> Kelly: You did and thank you for recognition. I agree with you that there is definitely a disconnect, especially in public safety with the work that we do as policymakers and then actually being implemented, but I also think that's a great opportunity for us as policymakers to have those discussions with the people that are impacted by the actions that we are taking here on council, I know that it will create a lot more transparency and just the imitation to have a discussion about something maybe we don't know a lot about and just to relate to them and understand where they are coming I found is really helpful so I appreciate you raising that up and raising it as a point.

[4:12:40 PM]

I look forward to having the discussion with those groups. >> I agree. And I think what I was trying say ultimately is I want leadership to encourage that, because as it stands I think there would be an inherent mistrust or hesitation. >> Right. >> And I think having people that you trust encouraged that with will get us closer. >> And I can't tell you how many times I have heard from officers or even ems workers in particular, they don't want to talk to us because they have been told they are not allowed to. >> Right. >> I do not like that one bit. I mean we are here so we can understand those particulars they go through

every day in the job and help make their jobs and lives easier and make their quality of life better. >> And I feel all city staff should be able to come to us request their problems or some of the great things that happen so we can celebrate those moments together, so thank you. >> --

[4:13:41 PM]

>> How you obtain goals, and often times as achieve I would come up with policy and I would tell people what the policy is and then I would request supervisors to enforce my policy and sometimes I would up in situations where, you know, the supervisors would push back, you know, they would enforce some policy and wouldn't enforce the policy and when I got on the is supervisors they would enforce it but that actually resulted in resentment and misunderstanding, one of the programs I did in Boston was called the code 19 and I asked my cops every day if you can park your police car and get out of your police car and walk through the neighborhood in an hour and engage people, talk with them and find out what they are doing and what their needs are and get out and meet the community. We teach you so well how to deal with, you know, bad guys so to speak where we teach you how to speak and be defensive, we never taught our cops how to engage effectively with good citizens and in adversarial relationships that's the program I tried to put in place and I measured this

[4:14:43 PM]

at comstat, walk and talk turned out I would hear cops on the walk and talk and go that is great I will walk with them and find them parked in the a car but not getting out of the car, right? So checking the blocks so they could comment and say well they want us to do this thing but no real supervision so then I would sty the sargents, why would one of your officers think they can possibly do that, that you must not be a good supervisor and don't have a relation with them if they think they can do that on your watch, they embarrassed you, sergeant, that they did that, right? So then the sargents is like okay you can't do that anymore you have to get out of the car a and do walk and talks and do a walk and talk, dwi at the time walk and talks and agree with it but why am I out in 4:00 A.M. In February in Roxbury when no citizens out and, you know, why am I walking a street like a jack in the box, why would you do that? That makes no sense at all. That's why they say we have to, so many of them and if we get stuck in the car they will yell at us and I had to have a

[4:15:45 PM]

conversation with the sergeants and brought them all into the headquarters and had a conversation, do you realize the goal of this? We want us to make our cops have a better relationship with our cops and the community to come forward and give us information and here is one of the ways I think we can do it and don't just check the box, look I gave an example of 4:00 o'clock, why would we waste that officer's

time and energy and put him through a miserable experience when we could have him out at 6:00 o'clock in the morning when the commuters are going to and from and kids need to be crossed across the street and people are out and about that time and don't do it for sake of checking a box but I found where I failed sometimes is coming are a good policy and program and not explaining the why to the supervisors responsible for it, when I have worked with supervisors and they have had their ability to put their input in because often times my policies are flawed and they can think of ways at that to more effectively work on the street,

[4:16:45 PM]

they buy into the lie, they will change that culture and do the result and we will no longer have very smoking on airlines just as you said because people understand it and explain it and feel like their voices are heard and there is a reason for it, I think the strategic planning process of exactly, the policies and procedures you are trying to do and engaging in the supervisors in the why you are doing them and why it is important to do them will be helpful to any police department in America today to try to make culture change. >> Thank you. I appreciate that. Colleague do we have any other questions before we move on to the next report, our briefing? >> I don't believe so. Thank you for coming back and offering us an opportunity to go through this final report .. And have appreciated our interaction with you along the way and hopefully have the opportunity to follow up with you all as needed. >> Thank you very much, it was a pleasure to be here as always. Thank you. >> Thank you. Have a great rest of your day. >> Thank you. You too. >> All right, colleagues. So it looks like we are moving on to item number 4 in on our

[4:17:46 PM]

agenda for public safety committee, we are going to receive a report on license plate readers. And then we have one other report, and just as a matter of observation it is 4:17, I know that you all have other things to do this afternoon, both of these things are important, but given that I tend to be long winded personally I am going to not ask any questions after the presentations and I encourage our presenters and my colleagues to be observant of the time. It looks like your presentation is all loaded up so the floor is yours. >> >> All right. Hello, good afternoon, everyone. This is assistant chief Jerry Bazan, unfortunately I think

[4:18:46 PM]

there was trouble with the link so we are joining by phone, I brought with me commander Jeff Greenwald and we are here to discuss the apr so thank you for giving us that opportunity and to answer any questions. So right now, for a time's sake let's offer to commander Greenwald. >> >> And actually, chair, real quick I know that this backup isn't available online currently in the form of a

presentation so if we can make sure that gets put up by the end of the day so the community can see it and for transparency purposes that might be helpful. >> You bet. I have been assured it will be there by the time we are -- >> Thank you. >> Are you there, commander? The presentation has disappeared. >> Can you guys hear me? >> We can hear you but we continue see, don't see the presentation any longer. Do you

[4:19:46 PM]

not need it? >> I don't need it to speak, I can follow along with my notes and my understanding is you guys will get it at a later date so it is nothing complicated or earth-shattering. It is more of an outline for my points so I will go through the highlights and please slow me down if you guys have questions or would like me to elaborate on anything. The department's license plate reader system program that was taken away from us in 2021 is what we are discussing today. We want to be able to access that data again. The purpose of that program is to keep our community safe by solving crimes quicker and locating and identifying violent offenders more quickly. We firmly believe that this will in turn prevent further violence by apprehending them before they can reoffend and a lot of times hope to seize the guns they used in the offenses by catching them quickly. In addition to the violent crime focus we also utilize these license plate readers or lpr for

[4:20:48 PM]

short to identify people in silver or amber alerts or those involved in kidnappings, they have been successful in the past. There are dozens and dozens of cases we can talk about but just on a high level I want you to understand how we utilize them to solve crimes at APD. In 2016 a local teacher befriended and unfortunately sexually assaulted a 16-year-old student here in Austin, after his arrest he bonded out of jail and moved to Lubbock and started harassing the victim online and threatened to kill her after the online threat he traveled from Lubbock to Austin to carry out this murder but we were unable to find him through traditional investigative methods. Fortunately the lpr system was able to locate his vehicle at a local hotel and after we took him into custody we found a loaded revolver zip ties, numerous knives and duct tape in his vehicle, there was no doubt he was here to carry out his threat but the license plate reader system helped us to find him before he was able to do so.

[4:21:49 PM]

>> In 2017, officers were able to successfully locate a kidnapped two-year-old child that had been taken from San Antonio and the license plate reader program on our highway alerted us to their presence here in our city and were able to return the two-year-old back home safely. In 2019, two suspects kidnapped a child from a school bus stop, actually attempted to kidnap a previous juvenile but

unsuccessful so they went on to kidnap this one. Their intent was to sexually assault the child but she escaped before they were able to follow through, investigative leads led us to a suspected vehicle license plate but unable to we were where that vehicle was staying or where it was currently registered. However the license plate reader system took us directly to its current locate and were able to take one of the suspects in custody and get a full confession question is how we knew what their intentions were going to be and placed both of them in custody before they were able to put anymore juveniles into harm's way. In 2020, there was a violent

[4:22:49 PM]

serial shooting spree that spanned several months south Austin, most notably around the Riverside area. The suspect drove a stolen white Honda four-door shot at numerous vehicles during different road rage incidents, many, many innocent people were shot, some suffered serious injuries and one actually died from her injuries. The apr system was instrumental in identifying and locating the vehicle and eventually let us to the suspect's location an his arrest. Those are a joust, those are just a couple of success stories but I want to touch on the concerns the community has had in the past in regards to privacy and making sure we are utilizing the data appropriately. We do understand what the community has concerns about and we have a very strict privacy policy with auditing and log-in audit process. The apr system does not contain any pi or personal identifiable information first of all, we want people to know what it does and doesn't contain.

[4:23:49 PM]

It is just the license plate information and description of the vehicle and location where it was logged. Each log-on that our users do and every transaction that they take within the system are logged so everything that is done is tracked and we know who was performing each search and each search they do has to have a corresponding case number so we know it is being conducted for a legitimate law enforcement purpose. We do not sell the data to any third party persons and we do not use the data for any sort of warrant roundups or collecting of past dues or fine organization anything like that, all of this systems, all of the data in hour system is also purged after 365 days, so one year in, the data is gone. I can tell you this is an investigative tool that has solved many, many cases and it is extremely important that we are able to utilize the system moving forward and happy to provide additional information if you guys need it and answer any questions that you guys might have.

[4:24:50 PM]

>> Harper-madison: So I think because of the late hours some of our colleagues have had to step off, it is me and our cochair, councilmember Kelly, I believe councilmember Ellis is watching from upstairs, and

councilmember, or mayor pro tem at has to step away, alter and councilmember tovo stepped away, so just the two of us

♪♪ just the two of us ♪♪ ♪♪ >> I am still here. >> >> Tovo: I have been listening and had my camera off -- >> Do you have any questions for the commander? >> Cochair Kelly. >> Thank you. I know that one of the big discussions in the community is the concern that license plate readers can be a lot like big brother and they collect information about the driver themselves but my understanding is that license plate readers objective and unbiased facts about vehicles. They support intelligence led policing initiatives and the reader technology itself focuses

[4:25:50 PM]

wholly on extracting empirical data, the license plate numbers in which Texas state law requires to be after fixed to every vehicle to my question here, because this seems to come up often in this discussion, is what protections are in place to keep license plate readers from being used in a way that has a disparate racial or socioeconomic impact? >> >> Good question and thank you for bringing that up. I have always believed that the way to solve the misconceptions that the community might have is by sharing information. It is important to know that APD's professional standards division our risk management unit conducts quarterly audits to make sure that every single transaction that we do within the system is related to a law enforcement purpose. So in other words, we are not going to be able to log on to the system to target quote unquote poor area of town or an area of town that has a high reputation of minorities. We have to already have been

[4:26:51 PM]

conducting a law enforcement investigation a, so we are only going to be using that lpr system in direct response or as a result result of a case number we have or an investigation that is already taking place. >> Okay. Thank you. And then I have seen across the country when you look at standards related to apr data and information usually there is a policy that the city agency that uses that technology follows, but I am wondering if it is publicly available. And if not if you could explain to us what the policy was prior to the removal of that use of technology. >> Yes. All of are policies are public and happy to supply that to you. >> Okay. But is it publicly available for the city of Austin to review perhaps on our website somewhere? Because I believe that might be helpful in educating the public about what the use and intent is and ensuring accountability on behalf of the officers who utilize that technology.

[4:27:55 PM]

>> Understood. Yes. We can absolutely give you what our policy is on the topic and it goes over the privacy policy and the audits and all of that information so I think that would be helpful. >> Okay. Great. And that's it for now, if my colleagues have any other questions I have one final thought I might bring up at the end. >> Councilmember Tovo. >> Tovo: Thank you, chair, just a quick one, can you give us a sense of what the budget -- what it would cost to use this technology in the city of Austin? I know you have supplied some of our offices with that additional information and I apologize if it is in the presentation which I don't have a copy of. >> It is not in the presentation as a dollar amount, I can say that the technology is already in place, the hardware is in place, all we need to do is reactivate it and I know APD has identified the funding for it, which the, we need to just quote unquote turn it on, I don't have a dollar amount but I can find out what that is and circle back with you on that. >> Thank you. And I know that you and your

[4:28:57 PM]

colleagues have provided that information. So I likely have some of that information that may be dated at this point but thank you very much. Thanks for the presentation. This is very helpful and the specifics. >> Sure. >> The specific anecdotes I think were very useful in kind of understanding how it really does leverage the -- leverage the -- help -- what am I looking for, colleagues? Help expand the abilities of our officers to bring -- >> Absolutely. I think that communication is important. I think to help people understand how we utilize it to make sure to know why we have it. >> Exactly. >> Councilmember Tovo, I actually have the amount, because of technology still exists on the vehicles that APD officers use the subscription itself on a yearly basis is \$114,000.775. >> Thank you, councilmember Kelly. >> That's helpful. Thank you. Councilmember Ellis, did you

[4:29:58 PM]

have any questions? >> Ellis: I do not, thank you, chair. And I appreciate the presentation. >> You bet, I also appreciate the presentation. The one thing I would -- well two things I am taking away. One, I have a much better understanding of the use of the technology but commander I would like to encourage you to -- I don't know if you had an opportunity to hear our previous conversation where I talked about us, I will be on the same team. I want to encourage we all be careful with the language you use. You said when it got taken away from us and I think sometimes when the community hears the officers that they reanniversary and respect and support so much say things got taken away somebody had to taken it and that's us so I want to make sure we say things like, you know, that encourage the community to understand that at some point, somewhere we decided that we didn't need to utilize that technology or couldn't afford that technology but not sort of

[4:30:59 PM]

inadvertently make it appear as though the council took any opportunity to make your very difficult job more difficult but other than that, thank you for presentation, I really appreciated it . >> City owned vehicles. Receive report on crashes involving city owned vehicles. >> Chair, while that presentation is loading I just wanted to let you know I do have a 4:45 so I will need to step away at that point. >> Completely understand. >> Thank you for being here for as long as you can

[4:32:08 PM]

. >> Harper-madison: Thank you. >> All right. Good afternoon, my name is Keith and special manager for the report on crashes involving city owned vehicles. >> Before I give the meat of the audit I want to distinguish with between an audit and a special request. So our audits tend to be very large projects that are broad, they are asking questions about the efficiency and the effectiveness of city operations and programs and in contrast our special requests are much smaller projects that just see the aim, to answer specific questions asked by councilmembers. This was a special request so there is no findings or conclusions that we normally have. There are no recommendations and we don't have a formal written response from management other than of course we did consult request them to make sure we were on the right page and all of that stuff. So this special request sought to answer five questions asked by council. The first one is how frequently does each department have crashes rutting in, resulting in significant damage? The next was what is the estimated cost in damages,

[4:33:08 PM]

including repairs and liabilities when determined that city was at fault. The third was how much are city vehicles irrelevant repairable or totaled as a result of a crash and what the financial implications? Next we were asked what the city's protocol was for employee seat belt usage and finally, we were asked how often city drivers are involved in crashes where they weren't wearing a seat belt/how often is there injury or death as a result of a city driver not wearing a seat belt. >> In order to answer these questions we worked with staff in the fleet mobility services department, the human resources department and the law enforcement. Services provided us the actual repair costs and ree placement cost for vehicles that are involved in crashes. The human resources department manages our city's driver safety program and the law enforcement is responsible for investigating and processing liability claims when there is an accident. All right. So to answer the questions, the

[4:34:10 PM]

first one, how frequently does each department have crashes resulting in significant damage? We found from fiscal years 2019 through 2021, there were 1,855 crashes. In this table we have the six departments that each had over 100 crashes during that time frame and as you see the Austin police department had the most at 882 crashes during those three years. The next question was asking about the cost in damages when the city was at fault. We found that of those 1,855 accidents 871 of them were the result of actions of city drivers. The value or the cost of those accidents was approximately \$4.7 million. Let's leave this up here for a second. Okay. The third question was how often are vehicles totaled as a result of a crash and what were those

[4:35:11 PM]

financial implications? And we found approximately six percent of the city's crashes during our time remain totaled a city vehicle. So that was 116 of our vehicles were totaled during those years at a replacement cost of roughly \$4.8 million. Three quarters of those vehicles were owned by the Austin police department. Moving on, question 4 is asking what the city's protocol for employee seat belt usage was, we found the city has guidance and training related to driver safety but doesn't explicitly talk about seat belts, so city drivers are responsible for following all federal, state and local traffic laws and of course that means that city drivers are expected to wear seat belts. However we only found very limited information on what happens if a city driver is found not to be wearing a seat belt. I do want to add that the municipal civil service rules specifically allow for the city to discipline drivers who are not following driver safety

[4:36:11 PM]

standards or violating traffic laws. However, certain groups like the police department and sworn firefighters aren't covered by municipal civil service rules, of course they have other guidelines they have to follow. And then lastly we were asked how often there were crashes where a city employee wasn't wearing a seat belt. We did not explicitly answer this question. The reason why is that our current guidelines require city drivers after they have been involved in an accident to self report whether or not they were wearing a seat belt. Rather than go through all of those accidents trying to find out how many people self reported this, I just want to focus our attention on a new vehicle monitoring system that the fleet mobility services department is currently installing and all, in all city vehicles. This system is going to be able to provide a wealth of information about all sorts of different aspects of the vehicle and its usage, including whether or not drivers and passengers are wearing a seat belts. Once those are fully installed and the current timeline

[4:37:13 PM]

estimates that to be done around the end of the year, then I think we will be able to provide much better data on employee seat belt usage. I know it sped through that, but I am happy to answer any questions and go back to any slides you may have. >> Harper-madison: Councilmember Kelly, if you wouldn't mind taking the presentation and talk to our other colleagues you know what, councilmember Kelly, do you mind if I defer to councilmember Ellis since she has a 445? >> Definitely. >> Councilmember Ellis, do you have any questions? >> >> Ellis: I don't have any at this time but I would like an opportunity to review the information further and to be able to circle back with you if there are any additional questions. It is kind of surprising to see how many accidents or crashes are happening, rather, but I would like a little more time to review the information to be able to a circle back on questions. >> Harper-madison: Councilmember Kelly. >> Kelly: I feel very similarly, that's why I wanted

[4:38:14 PM]

to see this come forward, I thought it was a very important internal request audit and when it was brought I know the one -- 1,855 crashes, over 882 of those were attributed to Austin police department, and I was hoping maybe APD could outline what their current policy is and I know they are not there, so with that said, driver safety overall among our employees is something that I really hold in high regard. From what I know when it comes to the subject in particular, if -- I would like to know if actions are being taken to actively reduce crashes in city vehicles and when it comes to this again in particular if there is a program that exists that should possibly work to change driver attitudes, improve and increase skills to be safer drivers. I know that there are some departments that give specific training on, this but I wonder what other safe driving practices and if even safety

[4:39:16 PM]

conscious behavior if that is something we do. I am not sure that exists but I would like to invite my colleagues who are here now, maybe to join me in developing a resolution that might direct the city manager to come up with such a program if it doesn't exist, because, again, we need to, not just follow vision zero but protect our employees as well, so that's about it. I know that was a lot of talking. >> Harper-madison: It was just the right amount. I would absolutely support that, in fact, one of the things I was Jo jotting down real quick is I would like to have a follow-up to this conversation, some of the things I wrote down as you were speaking councilmember Kelly, I would like to know sort of the implications of the crashes and if it is helpful one of the reasons I wanted to see this information when I urge my colleagues to bring it forward so my husband is a firefighter, and there is so much in the way of discipline when a driver, that is what they call the person driving the engine, crashes the vehicle. I mean, you really get in

[4:40:16 PM]

trouble for losing equipment, breaking things or crashing the vehicle. And so it didn't surprise me to see comparatively how few there are, that made me think, you know, because there are -- there is a stigma, the fact you will be reprimanded and, you know, there is some sort of, I guess department culture that says if you crash the vehicle, you know, your colleagues, your peers will definitely give you a hard time, so I just -- it occurred to me if there was a large disparity to councilmember Kelly's point, maybe there isn't the same level of expectation around how our employees in the Austin police department treat their squad cars -- 0 on the consistency I personally liked it. There is that -- there are consequences, and those -- both being by way of policy and what your peers expect from you, I think -- I think peer expectations are a good

[4:41:19 PM]

motivator for behavior, so with that said, those are some of the things I would like to follow up with. I really like the idea of knowing what programs are -- you know, the discipline, I would like to know what programs are available to reward safe drivers. I really would like to get more information about seat belt usage, the act that you all weren't able to -- it sounded to me and don't let put words in your mouth, I would love for you to 0 correct me if I don't articulate it correctly but it sounded like you had a hard time finding that information, and I know fleet has some new mechanisms they are going to deploy, maybe if you could speak to that briefly if you familiar and tell me whether or not that will help to capture that data around seat belt usage and I will tell you one of the reasons, I am especially curious is, you know, we sort of think through as we have been, you know -- as a municipality having to have really difficult

[4:42:19 PM]

conversations around liability expenses. I want do make certain as the budget gets tighter and tighter, with covid and all of the other considerations, inflation, affordability, I think just in general, as a municipality if we are going to continue to have our very robust and positive credit rating, we are going to have to really be tight with how we allocate the use of our funds. I mean the dollars are finite. So I want to make certain that, you know, we -- that there aren't any gaps for where our dollars are going and, you know, looking at this amount of crashes that we obviously looking at the graph is really jarring and recognizing that that giant graph, it translates into dollars, reach dollars, that the city of Austin and our residents need, so there is that, and then I think through some of the implications around payouts for our employees, you know, workmen's comp, farm, and

[4:43:19 PM]

then, you know, we have considerations for, you know, god forbid somebody should lose their life in an accident, we have, you know -- we have consideration for pd and for fire, I don't know whether or not we have the same considerations for ems, but, you know, on-the-job injury, I mean that's a long-term financial responsibility by way of the city of Austin. And so I just want to make certain if we do -- and we should have those commitments to folks who like I said god forbid lose their life in the line of duty, you know, in service at the city of Austin, I want to make certain that just like everybody else, you know, so for example, you know, if you should get lung cancer and it is the direct result of a 45 year, you know, smoking habit there is some implications around what your insurance would cover, and as crass as it may sound I would like very much to take into consideration when we do formulate those payouts and when

[4:44:19 PM]

we do make the determination of what is considered an on-the-job injury, accident, line of death duty that is substantial, rather, it is substantial, you know, it is kind of a lifelong payout that the family receives, and those are real dollars. So if, you know, unfortunately, that employee should be out of compliance by way of what it is that we expect from them from a safety perspective, I want to make certain that we are making fair decisions around who is eligible for those long-term payouts by the way of city of Austin and their families. So I would love to follow up on this conversation when you do feel like you have more substantive data, and then one of the -- one of the questions I had, councilmember Kelly touched on it but I would really love to see that sort of overview of rules and like you I wish there was a representative from APD here to really talk us through

[4:45:19 PM]

what is it that their employees expect to have happen when they do have an accident. Is it nothing? Is it, you know, are you shamed by your peers? I would really love to know sort of what that process looks like. I am not asking you to answer that question but it is something I would like as a part of the follow-up. Did you have anything additionally outside of the consideration you had about the production of ifc in is there anything else we can extract by way of having a follow-up conversation with the committee? >> Well, I am really happy that you are willing no work with me on that and put our heads together and we will come up with something really great for the city but I don't think there is anything more we can get that is -- because it is a special request but I wonder if we could call any other departments that were involved in those major amounts of wrecks to really talk to them about what their policies are and come up with some solutions after we listen to them. I think those would be the next steps to take. >> Harper-madison: Sure. And for the general public watching, the difference between

[4:46:21 PM]

-- can you talk to them about the difference between a special request and an actual audit, and the reason why, and the reason why there aren't any expectations or you guys aren't giving us any recommendations as a direct result of the special request. >> And thanks for doing it a second time because I know you did it at the beginning of the presentation as well. >> I appreciate that and I am happy to. So our special requests are very limited in scope, and I just wanted to have an opportunity to add in that because of how limited it was, because we were specifically answering those five questions that we laid out at the beginning, we didn't actually go and speak with APD. We weren't trying to determine what their culture was like or, you know, how they operate in that regard. We were specifically trying to answer how many accidents there were, what was the dollar amount, those type of questions, that's why we worked with the human resources department, the law enforcement and didn't go into the fire department or the police department or all of these other ones.

[4:47:22 PM]

So just can very broadly speaking our audits are larger projects that have recommendations, they have findings, that are trying to, you know, help the city, management determine where to go next, special requests are very directed where again we are doing our best to answer that question and provide just that answer. >> Thank you. I appreciate it. Are there any other questions from our colleagues? Thank you very much for your presentation. All right. Thank you so much. >> I do believe that's all, folks: future items. >> Yes. That was the last of our presentations. And so if there are any future items that our colleagues -- I am pretty sure councilmember Ellis had to take her leave but if councilmember Tovo you are still here and there are any future considerations you would like to present and councilmember Kelly. >> Yes, the first one I know council just received the results of the resolution passed in February related to the atx public safety vacancy staffing plan. And I believe that would be something good for us to get briefed on, and then also

[4:48:22 PM]

knowing that we are moving into the summer months I have come to realize the level of violence in certain parts of our city had during that time are a real problem and for every life that we lose here in the city of Austin part of the city has lost too, so what I want to know is that I know we can't predict those tragedies but there are other steps that communities across the country have taken to ensure safety in the high crime areas, and so I am interested in learning more about the violent crime reduction plan or if the staff has a violent crime reduction plan and what APD is doing to address that as a future committee item. >> Harper-Madison: Would you say it is accurate to say if I put sort of like a subbullet heat related increases in violent crime, how would you -- I want to make sure. >> Heat related is well but also as a whole -- >> Inclement weather -- how would you say that if I do a bullet? Violent crime reduction plan for city of Austin? >> Thank you. >> Or if exists or not.

[4:49:23 PM]

I am just thinking. Also make funny faces so -- >> Thank you. >> And then the public safety vacancy report? And then I have one that was on and then sort of fell off and I don't know that it ever came back in a way that was substantive and it was around uniforms for our 0 code enforcement professionals. I don't know that we ever got some of the responses I was looking for out of that conversation. And then there was one that occurred to me just this morning and. Oh, no. It didn't slip my mind entirely. During these conversations about people readying themselves around inclement weather, I know especially at the onset of covid that our ems professionals were, you know, really struggling with wearing all of this ppe and the weather, and so we were right at the end of March and moving into April and may may and that was difficult for them so they had

[4:50:24 PM]

to, I think rehab where they had to go cool off, I would like to have some information about how our emergency services personnel, what our protocol can is for them to maintain their health and wellness when they are having to be exposed to the inclement weather as well. >> Councilmember Kelly. >> >> Kelly: Yes, one last thing I just thought about, I know in the mobility committee meeting we were concerned about vehicles with expired registrations and when sensors go out and that sort of thing. I wonder if we could get a briefing on fines and fees for tickets that people might get for those such things here at the city of Austin a and wondering if there is something we might be able to take action honored to have a sliding scale or something similar to that so people at a lower economic socioeconomic status so it doesn't hurt them as much in their wallets when they experience those type of situations. >> And that's a conversation we have had on multiple occasions. I think I might have been quoted

[4:51:26 PM]

for saying riding dirty because that's what people end up doing. So I second continuing that conversation and coming up with some, something substantive that helps our residents. I wonder if that might also be an opportunity for a joint conversation between mobility and public safety. >> I believe that might be all. Without any objections, the I would say that we are adjourned at 4:51 P.M. Thank you, everybody. Have a great day.