HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS MARCH 1, 2022 HR-2023-012847

ROGERS-WASHINGTON-HOLY CROSS HISTORIC DISTRICT 2001 MAPLE AVENUE

PROPOSAL

Replace windows, doors, and siding. Update converted carport. Repair original wrought iron columns.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

- 1) Remodel previously converted carport: remove added door and sidelights, replacing with 6' x 5' window. Match combed cedar siding around window.
- 2) Add side access door to north elevation, approximately 7' from front of house, in place of existing window.
- 3) Replace damaged front and back doors with new fiberglass doors to match original.
- 4) Repair original wrought iron posts.
- 5) Replace all 2:2 aluminum windows with new 1:1 double-hung aluminum windows. Increase height of existing openig at south elevation, approximately 15' from front of house.
- 6) Remove damaged aluminum siding at side and rear elevations. Replace siding with cedar-mill fiber-cement siding to match 8" exposure.

DESIGN STANDARDS

The Rogers-Washington-Holy Cross Historic District Design Standards are used to evaluate projects within the historic district. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

Alterations to Contributing Properties

4.1 Exterior Walls

- 4.1.1 Retain original exterior materials, including siding and trim. 4.1.2 Repair rather than replacing original exterior materials.
- 4.1.3 When replacement of historic original exterior material is necessary due to severe deterioration or damage, the replacement shall match the historic element in appearance, dimension, form, color, reflectivity, finish, and texture. 4.1.4 Do not apply aluminum, vinyl, or other synthetic siding as a replacement for a primary building material.

The proposed project replaces damaged aluminum siding at secondary elevations with fiber-cement siding of similar dimensions.

4.4 Porches and Entrances

4.4.1 Retain historic porches and entrances as protected features, including porch railings and/or columns.

The proposed project retains and repairs existing wrought iron columns.

4.5 Windows

- 4.5.1 Do not enlarge, move, or enclose historic window openings on protected facades. Do not create new window openings on protected façades. It may be appropriate to restore original window openings that have been enclosed.
- 4.5.2 Repair historic windows, surrounds, and elements rather than replacing them. If replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration or damage, or to meet a whole-house energy standard along with other energy-efficiency measures, the replacement shall match the historic window size, profile, appearance, window pane number and configuration, and other design characteristics. The relationship between the replacement windows, the window surrounds, and the screens (if present) shall match the original.

The proposed project replaces all existing windows, save for the infilled garage. Replacement aluminum windows are 1:1, while some existing aluminum windows are 2:2; availability of 2:2 windows may be limited among modern manufacturers. Non-original window and door are infilled and replaced with a window. The proposed project appears to remove the existing window screens, grillework, and screen door.

4.6 Doors

- 4.6.1 Do not enlarge, move, or enclose original door openings. It may be appropriate to restore original door openings that have been enclosed.
- 4.6.2 Retain original doors, door surrounds, and sidelights.

4.6.3 If a replacement door, door surround, sidelight, or transom is necessary due to severe deterioration or damage, the style, materials, and finish of the replacement shall reflect the style and period of the house. Replacement doors shall be compatible with historic-age doors in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.

The proposed project removes a non-original door and replaces it with a compatible window, replaces a window with a door at the north elevation, and replaces the existing front and back doors with fiberglass doors matching the existing doors. It appears to remove the existing window screens, grillework, and screen door.

7. Garages, Carports, and Garage Apartments

7.5 Infill of the entry of the historic-age carport or garage on the front façade as a living space shall be recessed at least six inches, shall use exterior materials similar to and compatible with the original house, and have at least one window similar in size to the typical window on the original house.

While the proposed project does not recess the existing infill, it replaces existing non-compatible fenestration and siding with compatible ones.

Summary

The project appears to meet most of the applicable standards; however, existing ironwork is not shown on drawings.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve the application, provided that the applicant retains screen doors and other ironwork on-site for later replacement if historic age.



