# HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION

# APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS MAY 3, 2023

# HR-2023-043058

# ROBERTSON/STUART & MAIR HISTORIC DISTRICT 809 Lydia Street

#### **PROPOSAL**

Repair masonry, replace roof, and replace windows, doors, and canopy. Create a glass storefront at the rear of the property.

# **PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS**

- 1) Repair existing masonry, raising parapet to improve drainage.
- 2) Replace metal-framed plate glass windows in existing openings, removing infill where needed.
- 3) Reconstruct front door and canopy based on historic photos.
- 4) Remove existing incompatible gutter and update drainage pattern at roof.
- 5) Install glass storefront at the rear of the property and infill existing door with matching stone.

# **ARCHITECTURE**

One-story stone veneer commercial building with fixed undivided windows and double entry doors

#### **DESIGN STANDARDS**

The Robertson/Stuart & Mair Design Standards are used to evaluate projects within the historic district. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

#### 1.2.1. General Standards

<u>1.2.1.1.</u> Do not alter or remove historic features unless they are deteriorated beyond repair. Some exterior alterations to a historic building may be needed as part of a rehabilitation project to ensure the building's continued use. Such alterations should not radically change, obscure, or destroy character-defining historic materials and features. The proposed project does not remove or alter intact historic features.

1.2.1.2. If replacing deteriorated historic features, match the original as close as possible. If the level of deterioration or damage to a historic feature means that repair is not possible, or if it is critical to the preservation of the building, the damaged feature should be replaced to match the historic feature based on physical or historical documentation of its form and detailing. The design standards recommend the replacement of the entire feature in-kind. However, a similar substitute material is an acceptable alternative if the form, design, texture, and scale can effectively replicate the appearance of the remaining features.

The proposed project appropriately replaces missing and deteriorated historic features.

1.2.1.3. Do not add a new feature that was not there historically. When an entire feature is missing, such as a porch, it no longer plays a role in physically defining the historic character of the building unless it can be accurately restored in form and detailing after carefully examining primary source documentation of the feature's historic appearance, such as historic photographs or original architectural drawings. If the feature is not critical to the preservation of the building, allowing the building to remain without the feature is one option. If the missing feature is important to the historic character of the building—and adequate documentary and physical evidence exists—the design standards recommend its reproduction and replacement. A second option for replacing a missing feature—particularly when the available information about the feature is inadequate to permit an accurate reconstruction—is to design a new feature that is compatible with the overall historic character of the building. To be compatible, the new design should always take into account the size, scale, and material of the building itself, and should be clearly differentiated from the authentic historic features.

The proposed project uses photographic evidence to reconstruct missing features.

### 1.2.2. Specific Standards

1.2.2.1. Front exterior walls: Retain and repair the historic exterior materials on front walls, as well as side walls and roofs within 15 feet of the front of the building. If replacement of historic exterior wall materials is necessary, choose a material identical in dimensions, profile, reveal, and texture to the historic material, and install the new materials so that they maintain the spatial relationships (including depth and dimension) and joint patterns as existed historically relative to

window frames, door frames, and other exterior features. Maintain and repair historic exterior walls according to accepted preservation techniques.

The proposed project maintains and repairs historic wall materials at front and side façades.

1.2.2.2. Doors and door openings: Do not enlarge, alter or relocate doorways, or add new door openings on front and side walls within 15 feet of the front of the building. Retain and repair historic doors and door frames according to accepted preservation techniques unless Historic Preservation Office (HPO) staff and/or the Historic Landmark Commission (HLC) agree that deterioration is beyond repair. Retain and repair door glazing in its historic configuration. In cases where a historic entry door is missing or deteriorated beyond repair, choose a replacement door that is similar in terms of design and appearance with the historic character of the building. If a new door or door frame is required, install the new components so that they maintain the spatial relationships (including depth and dimension) and joint patterns as existed historically relative to door frames, exterior wall planes, and other exterior features.

The proposed project appropriately replaces the front door of the building based on photographic evidence.

1.2.2.3. Windows and window openings: Do not enlarge, alter or relocate window openings, or add new window openings on front walls, side walls, or roofs within 15 feet of the front of the building. Retain and repair all components of existing historic windows unless Historic Preservation Office (HPO) staff and/or the Historic Landmark Commission (HLC) agree that the individual component is deteriorated beyond repair. If replacement of historic windows is necessary, use windows that are the same size and match the dimensions, profile, and configuration of the historic windows. Substitute materials are appropriate if they maintain the profile and finish appearance of the historic window; xtruded aluminum and wood-clad aluminum are acceptable replacement materials; vinyl is not an acceptable material. If replacement windows are required, install the new windows so that they maintain the same spatial relationships (including depth and dimension) and joint patterns as existed historically relative to window frames, exterior wall planes, and other exterior features. Maintain and repair historic windows according to accepted preservation techniques.

The proposed project appropriately replaces windows where missing or damaged beyond repair.

<u>1.2.2.4.</u> Roofs and roof features: Retain the original roof shape, including pitches, profiles, and eave heights. Retain historic dormers, gable/attic vents, roof brackets and chimneys unless they are deteriorated beyond repair. Maintain and repair historic roof materials and features according to accepted preservation techniques.

The proposed project repairs the roof without compromising the original shape.

#### Summary

The project meets the applicable standards.

#### PROPERTY EVALUATION

The property contributes to the Robertson/Stuart & Mair Historic District.

#### COMMITTEE FEEDBACK

Glass block is appropriate for side windows, if clear glass is not able to be installed.

# STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve the application.



