# HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION

# APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS JULY 5, 2023 HR-2023-062078

# HY DE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT 4109 AVENUE A

#### **PROPOSAL**

Construct a two-story addition to a one-story house. Replace siding. Infill door and windows. Replace existing wood deck with new deck to match existing. Enlarge parking area.

# **PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS**

- 1) Construct an addition at the rear-side of the existing building. The two-story, cross-gabled addition is set back approximately 15' from the front wall of the house. Windows are 1:1 single-hung, rhythmically placed, and divided ribbon windows. It is clad in horizontal siding and features triangular knee braces at the gable end.
- 2) Replace existing horizontal wood siding with horizontal fiber cement siding.
- 3) Enclose side windows and secondary front door.
- 4) Remove existing screened porch and deck from rear of residence and replace with uncovered deck.

#### **ARCHITECTURE**

One-story Craftsman bungalow with horizontal wood siding, gabled roof with gabled partial-width porch, and triangular brackets at gable ends.

#### **DESIGN STANDARDS**

The Hyde Park Design Standards are used to evaluate projects within the historic district. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

### 1. General Standards

1.2: Retention of Historic Style: Respect the historic style of existing structures and retain their historic features, including character-defining elements and building scale.

The proposed project replaces historic siding and encloses the secondary front door.

- 1.3: Avoidance of False Historicism: Respect each contributing structure as an example of the architecture of its time. Do not make alterations that have no historic basis, such as the addition of gingerbread trim to a 1920s bungalow. Do not give an existing contributing structure a "historic" appearance it never had. When developing plans for additions, porches, and other exterior alterations, look to other houses of similar vintage to see how these changes were made historically, and then use that information as a guide to developing an appropriate size, scale, and massing for your proposed exterior change. The proposed project mostly avoids false historicism, save for the brackets at the addition's gable end.
- 1.4: Appropriate Treatment Options for Contributing or Potentially Contributing Structures: 1. Preserve the historic fabric: Repair deteriorated historic features and architectural elements. 2. Reconstruct missing or un-repairable architectural features with the following: a) Recycled historic materials that approximate the size and match the scale, profile, and appearance of the deteriorated or missing feature, if available. b) New material that that approximates the size and matches the scale, profile, and appearance of the historic material. Reconstruct or rebuild missing architectural features using photographic or physical indications as a guide.
- See 1.2. The proposed siding somewhat approximates the appearance of the historic material.
- 3. Residential Standards: Single Family and Contributing Multifamily Preservation and Restoration
- 3.1: Front of Houses: Retain the historic facade of a house in terms of door and window placement and exterior wall materials. Repair damaged or deteriorated exterior wall materials where reasonably possible. If replacement of exterior wall materials is necessary, choose a material identical in size, profile, and appearance as the historic material. See 1.2, 1.4.
- 3.2: Doors and Doorways: 1. Do not enlarge, alter, or relocate single doorways on the façade of the house. 2. Retain and repair an original entry door. In cases where replacement of an original entry door is required, or where the house does not have the original door, choose a replacement door that is compatible in terms of design and appearance with the historic

character of the house.

See 1.2.

3.3: Windows: 1. Repair or rehabilitate the original windows and screens.

The proposed project retains original front windows but infills some side windows.

- 3.5: Roofs: 1. Retain the original roof pitches and profiles on the building. Avoid changes to roofs on the front of the building. Avoid adding to the eave height of original roofs, especially at the front of the structure. Retain historic dormers.
- 2. In replacing roof materials, consider first the use of the original material, then the use a product that resembles the original material, such as a fiberglass or other energy-efficient shingle. Metal roofs are also acceptable. Do not use shaped, scalloped or diamond shingles unless they were original to the building. Preserve original gable/attic vents and roof brackets.

The proposed project retains the roofline at the front of the building and replaces the composite shingles in-kind. It does not remove the original brackets.

# 4. Residential Standards: Additions to Contributing Single Family and Multi-Family Structures

4.1: Preservation of Historic Character. Construct additions so as to require the removal or modification of a minimum of historic fabric. Do not construct additions which will require the removal of any portion of the front façade. Design additions to existing residential buildings to reflect the form and style of the existing house.

The proposed addition removes some historic fabric from the sides of the building, but largely replaces an existing screened porch addition. It will not require removal of the façade and appears to be designed to reflect the form and style of the existing house.

4.2: Location. Locate new additions and alterations to the rear or rear side of the building so that they will be less visible from the street.

The proposed addition is appropriately sited at the rear side of the building.

4.3: Roof, Fenestration, and Siding. 1. Make the pitch and height of the roof of the addition compatible to that of the existing house. 2. Make windows visible from the street on any addition compatible with those on the existing house in terms of sash configuration, proportion, spacing and placement. 3. Use exterior siding materials on the addition which match or are compatible with that of the existing house.

The proposed addition's roof, windows, and siding are compatible with the existing house.

4.4 Size and Scale of Additions: 1. Design additions to have the same floor-to-ceiling height as the existing house. 2. Locate second story additions at least 15' back from the front house wall. The front house wall is the exterior wall closest to the street. 3. Design additions so that they do not overwhelm the original building.

The proposed addition is constructed with the same floor-to-ceiling height as the original house and is located 15' back from the front wall. The addition does not appear to overwhelm the original building.

#### Summary

The project meets some of the applicable standards.

# PROPERTY EVALUATION

The property contributes to the Hyde Park Historic District.

# STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve the application except for the infill of the secondary front door, as it is a character-defining feature of the house.



