### HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION

# APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS DECEMBER 13, 2023 HR-2023-147510; GF-2023-149135 HYDE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

## Hyde Park Historic District 4306 Duval Street

#### **PROPOSAL**

Add a second story to the existing house.

#### PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

The proposed second-floor addition is clad in horizontal siding to match the historic portion of the house, has a gabled roof that appears to match the existing gables in pitch, and is set back greater than 15' from the front wall of the house. Fenestration is irregular, including fixed and double-hung windows throughout.

#### ARCHITECTURE

One-story Craftsman house with 1:1 wood windows, horizontal wood siding, and a partial-width porch supported by tapered columns atop brick piers.

#### **DESIGN STANDARDS**

The Hyde Park Design Standards are used to evaluate projects within the historic district. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

### 1. General Standards

1.3: Avoidance of False Historicism. Respect each contributing structure as an example of the architecture of its time. Do not make alterations that have no historic basis, such as the addition of gingerbread trim to a 1920s bungalow. Do not give an existing contributing structure a "historic" appearance it never had.

While the proposed addition is constructed to match the exterior materials and roof pitch of the main house, it appears appropriately differentiated from the main structure by its simpler design and second-floor placement.

#### 4. Residential Standards: Additions to Contributing Single Family and Multi-Family Structures

4.1: Preservation of Historic Character. Construct additions so as to require the removal or modification of a minimum of historic fabric. Do not construct additions which will require the removal of any portion of the front façade. Design additions to existing residential buildings to reflect the form and style of the existing house.

The proposed addition somewhat reflects the form and style of the house, with the exception of street-facing fenestration.

4.2: Location. Locate new additions and alterations to the rear or rear side of the building so that they will be less visible from the street.

The proposed addition is located atop the existing house, about 19' from the front wall of the house.

4.3: Roof, Fenestration, and Siding. 1. Make the pitch and height of the roof of the addition compatible to that of the existing house. 2. Make windows visible from the street on any addition compatible with those on the existing house in terms of sash configuration, proportion, spacing and placement. 3. Use exterior siding materials on the addition which match or are compatible with that of the existing house.

The proposed roof pitch matches the pitch of the existing house. While the visible double-hung window at the front of the addition appears appropriate in style, the spacing and placement of windows does not reflect the window patterns present on the historic portion of the house. The proposed exterior siding materials match the existing house.

4.4 Size and Scale of Additions: 1. Design additions to have the same floor-to-ceiling height as the existing house. 2. Locate second story additions at least 15' back from the front house wall. The front house wall is the exterior wall closest to the street. Houses on corner lots have only one front wall. 3. Design additions so that they do not overwhelm the original building. 4. Do not raise a first story to become a second story.

The proposed addition is approximately 19' from the front wall of the house. The proposed addition does not appear to overwhelm the original building, though adjusting the window pattern at the front of the addition may help it to blend better with the historic portion of the house.

## <u>Summary</u>

The project meets most of the applicable standards.

# PROPERTY EVALUATION

The property contributes to the Hyde Park Historic District.

# STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Postpone the public hearing to January 10, 2024 in order to invite the applicant to the Architectural Review Committee to explore alternative window placement at the street-facing portion of the addition.



