HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FEBRUARY 7, 2024 HR-2023-132220

ROGERS-WASHINGTON-HOLY CROSS HISTORIC DISTRICT 2506 GIVENS AVENUE

PROPOSAL

Remodel and construct an addition to a contributing house.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

- 1) Convert the carport into a living space, bringing the inset porch wall flush with the front wall of the house and removing the existing porch and carport supports.
- 2) Demolish covered porch and patio and construct a new deck and patio.
- 3) Remove the bay windows. Replace windows throughout, changing openings at the façade.
- 4) Replace roof in-kind.
- 5) Replace existing vinyl siding with fiber-cement siding, remaining a portion of the stone wainscoting.

ARCHITECTURE

One-story Ranch house with horizontal vinyl siding, an inset porch and integral carport, aluminum windows, and a stone veneer water table.

DESIGN STANDARDS

The Rogers-Washington-Holy Cross Design Standards are used to evaluate projects within the historic district. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

- 1. PROTECTED FAÇADES. Protected facades are defined as the front façade, front 50% of the side facades, and front 75% of the corner side yard façade, as illustrated below. Non-protected facades are the remaining facades of the building. 1.1 Retain and preserve protected facades.
- 1.2 Do not change the character, appearance, configuration, or materials of protected façades, except to restore buildings to their original appearance.
- 1.3 Do not add conjectural architectural features (e.g., do not add a front porch to a house that never had one).
- 1.4 Work to non-protected facades must be appropriate. However, the guidelines recognize that change will occur and that alterations and additions may be required on these non-protected facades.

The proposed project alters the character, appearance, configuration, and materials of protected façades. Work on non-protected façades appears mostly appropriate.

4.1 EXTERIOR WALLS

- 4.1.1 Retain original exterior materials, including siding and trim. Wood and historic masonry and features such as texture, tooling, bonding patterns, and joint treatment are protected and must be retained.
- 4.1.2 Repair rather than replace original exterior materials.
- 4.1.3 When replacement of historic original exterior material is necessary due to severe deterioration or damage, the replacement shall match the historic element in appearance, dimension, form, color, reflectivity, finish, and texture.
- 4.1.4 Do not apply aluminum, vinyl, or other synthetic siding as a replacement for a primary building material. Artificial siding materials have been documented to cause serious, costly, and often irreparable damage to underlying materials and structural members.

The proposed replacement of vinyl siding with fiber cement siding is appropriate; however, the removal of the stone veneer does not align with the standards.

4.4 PORCHES AND ENTRANCES

- 4.4.1 Retain historic porches and entrances as protected features, including porch railings and/or columns.
- 4.4.3 Do not enclose front porches.
- 4.4.4 Do not construct a new front deck or front porch or expand an existing porch on the main or corner side facade.

The proposed project does not retain the original porch but encloses a portion of it as part of the proposed carport enclosure. The project does not retain the original porch columns.

4.5 WINDOWS

- 4.5.1 Do not enlarge, move, or enclose historic window openings on protected facades. Do not create new window openings on protected façades. It may be appropriate to restore original window openings that have been enclosed.
- 4.5.2 Repair historic windows, surrounds, and elements rather than replacing them. If replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration or damage, or to meet a whole-house energy standard along with other energy-efficiency measures, the replacement shall match the historic window size, profile, appearance, window pane number and configuration, and other design characteristics. The relationship between the replacement windows, the window surrounds, and the screens (if present) shall match the original.
- 4.5.3 Do not install vinyl-clad wood windows or vinyl-sash windows. Vinyl is not an environmentally sustainable material, and the texture and sheen of vinyl windows does not match the materials or appearance of original windows.
- 4.5.4 Muntins, the strip of wood or metal separating and holding panes of glass in a window, must match the profile of the original window with either true divided lights or dimensional muntins placed on the outside of the glass. Do not use false muntins inserted inside the glass.
- 4.5.5 Replacement glazing shall be clear. The application of clear ultraviolet (UV) film to window glazing is the least costly option for reducing heat gain from sunlight and may be an acceptable addition to window glass.

The proposed project alters existing window openings on protected façades. The proposed replacement windows at protected façades do not all match the historic window size, configuration, or pattern; materials are not specified. As the existing windows and screens appear to be replacements, the original lite configuration is unknown. Replacement glazing transparency is not specified.

4.6 DOORS

- 4.6.1 Do not enlarge, move, or enclose original door openings.
- 4.6.2 Retain original doors, door surrounds, and sidelights.
- 4.6.3 If a replacement door, door surround, sidelight, or transom is necessary due to severe deterioration or damage, the style, materials, and finish of the replacement shall reflect the style and period of the house. Replacement doors shall be compatible with historic-age doors in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.
- 4.6.4 Do not create new door openings in the front facade of a principal building.
- 4.6.5 If new openings are necessary due to code requirements or unique circumstances, they may be considered by the Historic Landmark Commission. In this case, new openings shall be compatible with existing door openings in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, and material.

The proposed project appears to move/enlarge the original door opening. The proposed new door and sidelight do not reflect the style of the original door.

5.1 DESIGN OF ADDITIONS

- 5.1.1 Design additions to be compatible with the principal building in massing, size, scale, proportion, texture, finish materials, and detail.
- 5.1.2 Additions visible from the street (either from the front or from the side) shall have window-to-wall area ratios, floor-to-floor heights, fenestration patterns, and bay divisions compatible with those on the existing house.
- 5.1.3 Additions are not required to be designed in a particular style, but their design should be compatible with the architectural style of the existing building.
- 5.1.4 Design additions to appear secondary and subordinate to, and differentiated from, the existing house.
- 5.1.5 Design connections between additions and historic structures to be clearly discernible. A clear transition between the new addition and the historic structure shall be established and maintained.
- 5.1.6 One-story additions not visible from the public right-of-way do not need a connector between the original rear façade and new construction.
- 5.1.8 Design the roof form of additions to echo those of the original structure. Do not add dormers visible from the principal public right-of-way (the street on which the building fronts).

5.2 LOCATION OF ADDITIONS

5.2.1 Locate additions at the rear façade of the principal building. Additions must be set back at least two feet from the side facades of the building.

The proposed rear and side additions, aside from those that encroach upon protected façades, appear mostly aligned with the standards.

7. GARAGES, CARPORTS, AND GARAGE APARTMENTS

- 7.1 Retain historic garages and carports and their character-defining features, such as primary materials, roof materials, roof form, windows, window and door openings, and any architectural details.
- 7.3 Conversion of historic-age attached carports into enclosed garages or living space, or historic-age garages into living space, is allowed.
- 7.4 The infill of the entry of the carport on the front-facing façade for a garage shall be recessed six inches at a minimum.
- 7.5 Infill of the entry of the historic-age carport or garage on the front façade as a living space shall be recessed at least six inches, shall use exterior materials similar to and compatible with the original house, and have at least one window similar in size to the typical window on the original house.

The proposed project does not recess the infill at the front façade. It has at least one window similar in size to the original window, and the exterior materials are compatible.

Summary

The project meets most of the applicable standards for the rear and side additions but does not meet the standards for alterations of protected façades.

PROPERTY EVALUATION

The property contributes to the Rogers-Washington-Holy Cross Historic District.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Invite the applicant to the next meeting of the Architectural Review Committee to discuss alternatives to the proposed protected façade modifications.



