HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS MARCH 6, 2024 HR-2023-132220

ROGERS-WASHINGTON-HOLY CROSS HISTORIC DISTRICT 2506 GIVENS AVENUE

PROPOSAL

Remodel and construct an addition to a contributing house.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

- 1) Convert the carport into a living space, bringing the inset porch wall flush with the front wall of the house and removing the existing porch and carport supports.
- 2) Demolish covered porch and patio and construct a new deck and patio.
- 3) Remove the bay windows. Replace windows throughout, changing openings at the façade.
- 4) Replace roof in-kind.
- 5) Replace existing vinyl siding with fiber-cement siding, remaining a portion of the stone wainscoting.

ARCHITECTURE

One-story Ranch house with horizontal vinyl siding, an inset porch and integral carport, aluminum windows, and a stone veneer water table.

DESIGN STANDARDS

The Rogers-Washington-Holy Cross Design Standards are used to evaluate projects within the historic district. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

- 1. PROTECTED FAÇADES. Protected facades are defined as the front façade, front 50% of the side facades, and front 75% of the corner side yard façade, as illustrated below. Non-protected facades are the remaining facades of the building. 1.1 Retain and preserve protected facades.
- 1.2 Do not change the character, appearance, configuration, or materials of protected façades, except to restore buildings to their original appearance.
- 1.3 Do not add conjectural architectural features (e.g., do not add a front porch to a house that never had one).
- 1.4 Work to non-protected facades must be appropriate. However, the guidelines recognize that change will occur and that alterations and additions may be required on these non-protected facades.

The proposed project alters the character, appearance, configuration, and materials of protected façades. Work on non-protected façades appears mostly appropriate.

4.1 EXTERIOR WALLS

- 4.1.1 Retain original exterior materials, including siding and trim. Wood and historic masonry and features such as texture, tooling, bonding patterns, and joint treatment are protected and must be retained.
- 4.1.2 Repair rather than replace original exterior materials.
- 4.1.3 When replacement of historic original exterior material is necessary due to severe deterioration or damage, the replacement shall match the historic element in appearance, dimension, form, color, reflectivity, finish, and texture.
- 4.1.4 Do not apply aluminum, vinyl, or other synthetic siding as a replacement for a primary building material. Artificial siding materials have been documented to cause serious, costly, and often irreparable damage to underlying materials and structural members.

The proposed replacement of vinyl siding with fiber cement siding is appropriate; however, the removal of the stone veneer does not align with the standards.

4.4 PORCHES AND ENTRANCES

- 4.4.1 Retain historic porches and entrances as protected features, including porch railings and/or columns.
- 4.4.3 Do not enclose front porches.
- 4.4.4 Do not construct a new front deck or front porch or expand an existing porch on the main or corner side facade.

The proposed project does not retain the original porch but encloses a portion of it as part of the proposed carport enclosure. The project does not retain the original porch columns.

4.5 WINDOWS

The proposed project has been updated to retain existing window openings on protected façades.

4.6 DOORS

The proposed project has been modified to retain the original door opening.

5.1 DESIGN OF ADDITIONS

The proposed rear and side additions appear mostly aligned with the standards.

7. GARAGES, CARPORTS, AND GARAGE APARTMENTS

The proposed project does not recess the infill at the front façade. It has at least one window similar in size to the original window, and the exterior materials are compatible.

<u>Summary</u>

The project meets most of the applicable standards. The applicant has amended the design to reflect Committee feedback.

COMMITTEE FEEDBACK

Replace the bay. Keep the front door in the same place. Retain iron columns and railings. Retain existing stone and do not mix in new stone; use wood instead of stone to differentiate. Ensure that the carport reads as a conversion and structurally allows for reversal.

PROPERTY EVALUATION

The property contributes to the Rogers-Washington-Holy Cross Historic District.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve the application. The applicant has incorporated Committee feedback.



