HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION

APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS MARCH 6, 2024 HR-2024-007660 HYDE PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT 4204 AVENUE H

PROPOSAL

Construct a second-floor addition. Replace the foundation and roof. Restore front windows. Construct a new garage. Construct a pool.

PROJECT SPECIFICATIONS

- 1) Construct a second-floor addition, clad in reused teardrop siding and new matching siding.
- 2) Replace the foundation with concrete footers.
- 3) Restore the front windows, replacing deteriorated wood elements in-kind.
- 4) Replace the metal roof with a new metal roof.
- 5) Construct a new rear garage.
- 6) Construct a new pool.
- 7) Add a screened patio to the rear and a covered porch to the front-side of the building.

ARCHITECTURE

One-story Craftsman bungalow with covered entry, horizontal wood siding, 1:1 wood windows, and traditional Craftsman detailing.

DESIGN STANDARDS

The Hyde Park Design Standards are used to evaluate projects within the historic district. The following standards apply to the proposed project:

1. General Standards

1.1: Prevention of Demolition

Demolition of any contributing structure is strongly discouraged under all circumstances.

The proposed project demolishes the rear of the building to construct a new addition.

1.2: Retention of Historic Style

Respect the historic style of existing structures and retain their historic features, including character-defining elements and building scale.

The proposed project retains some historic features at the front of the building but changes its scale.

1.3: Avoidance of False Historicism

Respect each contributing structure as an example of the architecture of its time. Do not make alterations that have no historic basis, such as the addition of gingerbread trim to a 1920s bungalow. Do not give an existing contributing structure a "historic" appearance it never had.

The proposed addition and garage include details that make differentiation of new from historic materials challenging, such as exposed rafter tails and triangular eave brackets. It extends the roofline and chimney and replaces the existing bracket in the new location.

1.4: Appropriate Treatment Options for Contributing or Potentially Contributing Structures

1. Preserve the historic fabric: Repair deteriorated historic features and architectural elements. 2. Reconstruct missing or un-repairable architectural features with the following: a) Recycled historic materials that approximate the size and match the scale, profile, and appearance of the deteriorated or missing feature, if available. b) New material that approximates the size and matches the scale, profile, and appearance of the historic material. Reconstruct or rebuild missing architectural features using photographic or physical indications as a guide.

The proposed project restores deteriorated siding and windows at the front of the house.

3. Residential Standards: Single Family and Contributing Multifamily - Preservation and Restoration

3.1: Front of Houses

Retain the historic facade of a house in terms of door and window placement and exterior wall materials. Repair damaged or deteriorated exterior wall materials where reasonably possible. If replacement of exterior wall materials is necessary, choose a material identical in size, profile, and appearance as the historic material.

The proposed project restores and retains the house's historic façade, with the exception of the roofline.

3.2: Doors and Doorways

1. Do not enlarge, alter, or relocate single doorways on the façade of the house. 2. Retain and repair an original entry door. In cases where replacement of an original entry door is required, or where the house does not have the original door, choose a replacement door that is compatible in terms of design and appearance with the historic character of the house.

3. Retain the glazing (window or glass) in its original configuration on doors that contain glass.

The proposed project repairs and retains doors and doorways at the front of the house.

3.3: Windows

1. Repair or rehabilitate the original windows and screens. 3. Do not use tinted glass or tinted film on original windows. 4. If replacing windows, use windows that approximate the size and match the scale, profile, appearance, and configuration of existing historic windows.

The proposed project rehabilitates windows at the front of the house and two on the side of the house. New windows at the retained portion of the house require new openings and do not appear to match the scale or configuration of existing windows.

3.4: Porches

Preserve the original front and street-side porches. Do not enclose open front and street-side ground-floor porches with screening, glass, or other enclosure materials. Screens are appropriate for rear porches or other porches, including second-floor front porches.

The proposed project preserves the original front porch but adds a secondary front porch at the addition.

3.5: Roofs

1. Retain the original roof pitches and profiles on the building. Avoid changes to roofs on the front of the building. Avoid adding to the eave height of original roofs, especially at the front of the structure. Retain historic dormers. 2. In replacing roof materials, consider first the use of the original material, then the use a product that resembles the original material, such as a fiberglass or other energy-efficient shingle. Metal roofs are also acceptable. Do not use shaped, scalloped or diamond shingles unless they were original to the building. Preserve original gable/attic vents and roof brackets.

The proposed project replaces roof material in-kind but changes the roofline at the front of the building, adding height and visual weight. See 1.3.

3.6: Chimneys

Preserve existing chimneys. Use original or similar replacement materials to rebuild a fallen or unstable chimney. The proposed project somewhat preserves the original chimney but adds height. See 1.3.

<u>4. Residential Standards: Additions to Contributing Single-Family and Multi-Family Structures</u>

4.1: Preservation of Historic Character

Construct additions to require the removal or modification of a minimum of historic fabric. Do not construct additions that will require the removal of any portion of the front façade. Design additions to existing residential buildings to reflect the form and style of the existing house.

The proposed project requires the removal of the original roof ridge and rear/rear-side of the house.

4.2: Location

Locate new additions and alterations to the rear or rear side of the building so that they will be less visible from the street. The proposed addition is located at the rear side of the building.

4.3: Roof, Fenestration, and Siding

1. Make the pitch and height of the roof of the addition compatible with that of the existing house. 2. Make windows visible from the street on any addition compatible with those on the existing house in terms of sash configuration, proportion, spacing, and placement. 3. Use exterior siding materials on the addition that match or are compatible with that of the existing house.

The proposed roof pitch at the front of the building is incompatible, as it adds height to the building's original roof. Visible windows and siding appear compatible.

4.4 Size and Scale of Additions

1. Design additions to have the same floor-to-ceiling height as the existing house. 2. Locate second story additions at least 15' back from the front house wall. The front house wall is the exterior wall closest to the street. Houses on corner lots have only one front wall. 3. Design additions so that they do not overwhelm the original building. 4. Do not raise the first story to become a second story.

The proposed addition requires additional height at the existing roof ridge. The first-floor porch addition and the roof ridge modification are not located 15' from the front wall of the house.

5. Residential Standards: New Construction of Single-Family Structures

5.9: Garages

Construct new garages to be detached and located to the rear of the lot. Design a new garage to be complementary to the main structure on the property. Do not locate garages or carports on the façade of a building.

The proposed new garage is detached and appears compatible.

Summary

The project meets some of the applicable standards.

COMMITTEE FEEDBACK

Rework the roofline to appear less top-heavy and better comply with the design standards, moving the addition beyond the ridgeline. Consider rotating the addition to reduce its impact. Use an L-shaped porch, rather than the current rebuilt porch, to keep the front elevation's proportions consistent with the historic building and reduce its overall impact.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Postpone the public hearing to allow additional time for the applicant to implement Committee feedback and invite the applicant to the April meeting of the Architectural Review Committee. NOTE: Revisions were not received in time for staff review; new materials not reflected here may be available in backup.

